



## MEMORANDUM

TO: Matthew H. Greeson, City Manager

FROM: R. Lee Brown, Director

DATE: December 17, 2020

SUBJECT: Ordinance to Modify PUD 01-2018 to permit a new mixed-use building at 121 W. Wilson Bridge Rd. PUD 01-2020M

---

### **Background & Request:**

This portion of the Worthington Gateway Planned Use District (PUD) is a 2.033-acre parcel abutting Caren Ave. and single family lots to the south, and Lot #1 of the Worthington Gateway Subdivision on the north, west and east sides. The parcel was intended to accommodate a hotel, with a Tru hotel being the last brand approved for this location.

The current application is a request for a building on the "hotel" parcel that would house a mix of uses including first floor retail/restaurants/office, second and third floor office and a boutique hotel on the fourth floor.

The previously approved buildings along W. Wilson Bridge Rd. and at the intersection of High St. and Caren Ave. are not part of this review and are to be constructed as previously approved.

Upon approving the modification to PUD 01-2018, the applicant would then come back to the Municipal Planning Commission for a PUD Final Plan approval and Architectural Review Board approval for this portion of the site.

### **Application/Parcel History:**

- March 18, 2019 – City Council approved the original rezoning from the C-4 District to a PUD to allow for the redevelopment of the entire site with a mix of retail, restaurant, office, and a hotel.
- December 12, 2019 – The Municipal Planning Commission and the Architectural Review Board reviewed and tabled a proposal to modify the hotel from a Hampton Inn & Suites to a Tru by Hilton for the site where the applicant received feedback from the Commission & Board and the general public.
- February 13, 2020 – The Municipal Planning Commission and the Architectural Review Board reviewed and approved a minor modification to the existing PUD and

the Architectural Review application for a new Tru by Hilton.

- September 10, 2020 – The Municipal Planning Commission and the Architectural Review Board reviewed and tabled a proposal to modify the existing PUD to permit the parcel that was originally approved for a hotel to a new mixed-use five-story building.
- December 10, 2020 – The Municipal Planning Commission recommend approval to City Council to modify PUD 01-2018 to permit a new mixed-use four-story building.

### **PUD Project Details:**

The project details are provided below and are organized by the categories dictated by [Code](#).

### **Project Details:**

1. Site Plan and Landscaping:
  - Planned in about the same location, the new building would have a smaller footprint and be a bit further to the east than the hotel.
  - Main access to the building would be from W. Wilson Bridge Rd., and the Caren Ave. entrance would be secondary. The main entrance is shown at the northwest corner of the building.
  - The site plan indicates there would be 168 parking spaces or 3.4 spaces/1000 square feet of building area.
  - The dumpster enclosure is shown on the west side of the parking lot.
  - Traffic, storm water and utility considerations were addressed with the PUD application but need to be updated and then approved by the City Engineer.
  - A landscape plan is now included showing a variety a plant material, walkways and open space.
2. Building:
  - The building would have a flat roof with four stories to the east. The partial fifth story was eliminated, so only mechanicals with a screen would be on the roof.
  - Building design includes:
    - Brick veneer is proposed for the first three stories. Pilasters and inset brick detailing are shown.
    - The first-floor brick would be darker than the second and third. Blue aluminum storefront windows are proposed for the first three floors, with aluminum awnings and a sign band on the first floor. Near the entrance at the northwest corner of the building, dark blue fiber cement panels and a glass curtainwall are proposed.
    - Dark blue fiber cement panels and trim would be used for the fourth floor and aluminum clad double hung windows are proposed.
    - Blue steel trellises are shown at the ground floor and fourth floor on the west end.
    - A projection sign would be made available at the northeast corner for use by a major tenant.
4. Site lighting is included to match the approved for the rest of the site.

5. Mechanical units would be on the roof.

**Updated Development Text:**

II. Development Standards – These standards are for the entire site.

A. Allowable Uses

- Offices – minimum amount – 18,000 square feet – Parcel #100-006791
- Offices – minimum amount – 20,000 square feet – Parcel #100-006792
- Hotels
- Restaurants
- Social Activities
- Breweries, Distilleries and Wineries
- Sale of goods at retail – limited to less than 10,000 square feet in gross floor area per business with on-site food preparation permissible
- Personal services
- Accessory uses
- Banks, Drive-in banks
- Pet shops
- Arts and crafts
- Entertainment facilities
- Recreational facilities
- Public uses
- Essential services

B. Design Regulations

1. Character

The owner is proposing the redevelopment of the site with a mix of uses as the Hotel has been demolished. There are six (6) buildings proposed for the existing Holiday Inn site located at southwest corner of North High Street and West Wilson Bridge Road. The vacant lot located at the corner of Caren Avenue and North High Street was separately submitted to the Architectural Review Board and the Municipal Planning Commission for all necessary approvals under the Worthington Planning & Zoning Code. This submission is to provide detailed exterior elevations and building materials along with an overall a sense of scale, proportion, massing, and spacing of the buildings as it relates to the current site plan and grade changes for the proposed mixed-use building.

Buildings #1, #2 and # 6 are single story, Buildings #3 and #4 are two story and Building #5 is proposed to be a four-story mixed-use building. All the buildings are designed as ‘four-sided architecture’. By using the same materials on all four sides of each building, the design will not interrupt, and all parts are perceived as a unified whole.

The architectural style of the proposed buildings is meant to complement the surrounding Worthington neighborhood and design standards while differentiating the buildings from one another. Traditional style design elements are incorporated into the design using brick

facades, gabled roof lines, dormers, double-hung windows and entrances with transoms. The street level storefront facades are designed using pilasters, bulkheads, cornices, awnings and externally illuminated sign panels. The speculative 2-story office buildings at the western portion of the development utilize traditional rationale and detail while maintaining a more contemporary architectural style. The four-story mixed-use building will also utilize traditional style, tri-partite design (base, middle, top). The design shall incorporate brick veneer and fiber cement paneling. While the four-story building will have a flat roof, the fourth floor shall be articulated with a change in façade material to visually break up the elevations. Signage (wall signs, blade sign and monument sign) for the four-story building is proposed to utilize internal illumination with push-through acrylic lettering and/or graphics.

The proposed materials are consistent with the City of Worthington's design guidelines with brick masonry, siding, multi-panel windows, metal & shingled roof, paint finish and awning fabric or standing seam metal.

## 2. Screening

Landscaping and screening shall be installed in compliance with the original Landscaping Plan and proposed Landscaping Plan included in this PUD district application. Landscaping maybe added along the southwestern corner of the site and along the southern property boundary if deemed necessary by the City of Worthington.

## 3. Tract Coverage

Tract coverage for the hotel parcel and Wilson Bridge Road parcels is shown on the site plan included with this PUD district application.

## 4. Lighting

A lighting package has been submitted as a part of this application that indicates the location of the light poles, cut off fixtures and a photo metric plan that shows compliance with the adopted City guidelines on light impacts on abutting properties. No exposed concrete bases for the parking lot lights will be permitted.

## 5. Graphic/Signage

An updated signage package for the new mixed-use building is included in this submittal. The original signage package remains for the previously approved portion of the site. The submitted package includes all the wall signage, freestanding signage and directional signs. The four-story mixed-use building will submit a sign package for review and approval by the Architectural Review Board.

## C. Traffic & Parking

a. Access to the property will be depicted on the submitted site plan. Only two curb cuts will be utilized, and the other existing curb cuts will be eliminated. The curb cut on Wilson Bridge Road will be shifted slightly to the west to allow it to line up with the existing curb cut from the Shopping Center to the north. The relocation of the curb cut will allow for four (4) way traffic control and a safer flow of traffic on and off the site. New sidewalks and other amenities will be added to the site to improve pedestrian access to,

through and off the site per the site plan.

b. The original traffic impact study was commissioned by the applicant and it was reviewed and approved by the City as a part of the Architectural Review Board process. An updated traffic analysis was submitted and reviewed to reflect the revised vehicular trips related to the mix of uses for the new building.

## 2. Parking

The parking areas are shown on the site plan which provides for 404 parking spaces. The site plan provides for all the required setback and landscape areas. The 7± acre site was previously split into three (3) lots and easements were provided for crossing parking between the new lots as well as ingress and egress provisions for vehicle and pedestrian access over the three (3) lots.

## D. General Requirements

### 1. Environmental

#### a. Stormwater Drainage

Preliminary and final stormwater drainage studies have been conducted for the redevelopment of the site. The preliminary stormwater plan has been submitted as a part of this application and it will meet all regulations adopted by the City of Worthington for detaining the stormwater, mitigating run off on abutting properties and thereby meeting all City and EPA requirements.

#### b. Utilities and Facilities

The site will be served by existing water, sanitary sewer, stormwater sewer and electric lines that surround the property.

#### c. Natural Features

The subject property is without significant natural features other than a dropping slope of the land from the east to the west that has proven difficult with laying out buildings on the site.

#### d. Public Area Payments

The applicant will comply with Code Section 1174.05(c)(3)(B) of the Worthington Zoning Code. The existing square footage of the Holiday Inn Hotel is 136,834 and the proposed square footage of the new buildings is 98,989 so no payment is required under the above Code Section.

#### e. Public Space Amenities

The applicant will comply with Section 1174.05(c)(4) by providing a minimum of twenty-seven public space amenities in various locations on the Property. Public space amenities are provided and incorporated at various locations around the site.

The public amenities shall be:

- (1) Public Right-of-Way dedication
- (2) Decorative Street lighting
- (3) Bike Parking (4 total) for each building
- (4) New Pedestrian sidewalks
- (5) Wilson Bridge Road intersection improvements – Traffic lighting and configuration corrections
- (6) Plaza / Meeting area
- (7) Bio-Retention areas
- (8) New Corner treatments (Caren Avenue & N. High Street & Wilson Bridge Road)
- (9) Street trees (along the rights-of-way)
- (10) Paver parking and maneuvering areas
- (11) Upgraded Landscaping
- (12) Decorative retaining walls
- (13) Patio areas (11 total)
- (14) New green lawn area along Wilson Bridge Road
- (15) Decorative planting areas along entry ways to site along Wilson Bridge Road
- (16) Decorative Trash Reception (10 total)
- (17) New green lawn area extending from outdoor patio space of four-story mixed-use building
- (18) Decorative benches.

### **Worthington Land Use Plans:**

#### **Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance**

1. Scale, Form & Massing: Simple geometric forms and uncomplicated massing tend to make buildings more user-friendly and help to extend the character of Old Worthington into the newer development areas. Inclusion of sidewalks, pedestrian-scaled signage, and planting and lawn areas will help communicate a sense of a walkable pedestrian scale. Carefully designed building facades that employ traditional storefronts -- or similarly-sized windows on the first floor -- will help make new buildings more pedestrian-friendly.
2. Setbacks: Parking areas should be located toward the rear and not in the front setbacks if at all possible. Unimpeded pedestrian access to the front building facade from the sidewalk should be a primary goal. Building up to the required setback is desirable as a means of getting pedestrians closer to the building and into the main entrance as easily as possible.
3. Roof Shape: Generally, a traditional roof shape such as gable or hip is preferable to a flat roof on a new building. Roof shapes should be in scale with the buildings on which they are placed. Study traditional building designs in Old Worthington to get a sense of how much of the facade composition is wall surface and how much is roof.
4. Materials: Traditional materials such as wood and brick are desirable in newer areas, but other materials are also acceptable. These include various metals and plastics; poured concrete and concrete block should be confined primarily to foundation walls. Avoid any use of glass with highly reflective coatings. Some of these may have a blue, orange, or silver color and can be as reflective as mirrors;

they generally are not compatible with other development in Worthington. Before making a final selection of materials, prepare a sample board with preferred and optional materials.

5. Windows: On long facades, consider breaking the composition down into smaller “storefront” units, with some variation in first and upper floor window design. Use traditional sizes, proportions and spacing for first and upper floor windows. Doing so will help link Old Worthington and newer areas through consistent design elements.
6. Entries: Primary building entrances should be on the street-facing principal facade. Rear or side entries from parking lots are desirable, but primary emphasis should be given to the street entry. Use simple door and trim designs compatible with both the building and with adjacent and nearby development.
7. Ornamentation: Use ornamentation sparingly in new developments. Decorative treatments at entries, windows and cornices can work well in distinguishing a building and giving it character, but only a few such elements can achieve the desired effect. Traditional wood ornamentation is the simplest to build, but on new buildings it is possible to use substitute materials such as metal and fiberglass. On brick buildings substitute materials can be used to resemble the stone or metal ornamental elements traditionally found on older brick buildings. As with all ornamentation, simple designs and limited quantities give the best results.
8. Color: For new brick buildings, consider letting the natural brick color be the body color, and select trim colors that are compatible with the color of the bricks. Prepare a color board showing proposed colors.
9. Signage: While the regulations permit a certain maximum square footage of signs for a business, try to minimize the size and number of signs. Place only basic names and graphics on signs along the street so that drive-by traffic is not bombarded with too much information. Free-standing signs should be of the “monument” type; they should be as low as possible. Such signs should have an appropriate base such as a brick planting area with appropriate landscaping or no lighting. Colors for signs should be chosen for compatibility with the age, architecture and colors of the buildings they serve, whether placed on the ground or mounted on the building. Signs must be distinctive enough to be readily visible, but avoid incompatible modern colors such as “fluorescent orange” and similar colors. Bright color shades generally are discouraged in favor more subtle and toned-down shades.
10. Sustainability: The City of Worthington and its Architectural Review Board are interested in encouraging sustainable design and building practices, while preserving the character and integrity of the Architectural Review District. Energy conservation methods are encouraged. Landscape concepts often complement energy conservation and should be maintained and replenished. Utilize indigenous plant materials, trees, and landscape features, especially those which perform passive solar energy functions such as sun shading and wind breaks. Preserve and enhance green/open spaces wherever practicable. Manage storm water run-off through the use of rain gardens, permeable forms of pavement, rain barrels and other such means that conserve water and filter pollutants. Bike racks and other methods of facilitating alternative transportation should be utilized. Streetscape elements should be of a human scale. Make use of recycled materials; rapidly

renewable materials; and energy efficient materials. Use of natural and controlled light for interior spaces and natural ventilation is recommended. Minimize light pollution.

## **Wilson Bridge Corridor**

### Wilson Bridge Road Corridor Study

The Wilson Bridge Road Corridor Study, adopted in 2011, makes recommendations for the Wilson Bridge Road corridor from the Olentangy River to the west to the Railroad Crossing to the east. The Study recommends the need to promote the redevelopment of the Wilson Bridge Road Corridor into a mixed-use area that will generate new economic growth within the City. These requirements are intended to foster development that strengthens land use and economic value; encourage a mix of uses; enhance livability of the area; to augment pedestrian and bicycle connections; and to promote construction of high-quality buildings and public spaces that create and sustain long-term economic vitality.

### Wilson Bridge Corridor Districts

City Council adopted the [Wilson Bridge Corridor Zoning](#) in 2016, creating new zoning districts and development standards for the Wilson Bridge Corridor.

The site is in the area that was identified as Mixed-Use (WBC-4). This area allows for a mix of retail and office uses both vertically and horizontally. Retail uses are encouraged for the first floor of multi-floor developments. Pedestrian facilities and public spaces are encouraged.

- Permitted Uses: Uses listed in Chapter 1147 of the Codified Ordinances as permitted uses in the following districts: "C-1" Neighborhood Commercial, "C-2" Community Shopping Center, and "C-3" Institutions and Offices.
- Conditional Uses: Residential Uses, Hotels, Motels, Drive-in Commercial Uses, and Breweries, Distilleries and Wineries.
- Maximum Building Height: 3 stories for properties south of Wilson Bridge Rd; except for the WBC-3 Mixed-Use location south of Wilson Bridge Road and west of High Street, where the maximum building height shall be 3 stories within the westernmost 180 feet and 4 stories in the remaining area; 4 stories for properties north of Wilson Bridge Rd.

## **Planning & Zoning Code**

### Code Chapter 1174

1174.08 PUD PROCEDURES.

(2) Requested modifications to the approved Final Plans shall be reviewed according to the following:

A. City Staff. The City staff may authorize minor design modifications that are required to correct any undetected errors or that are consistent with the purpose of the approved Final Plan. Such modifications shall be limited to:

1. Minor adjustments in lot lines provided no additional lots are created;
2. Minor adjustments in location of Building footprints and parking lots, provided the perimeter required Yards remain in compliance;
3. Minor adjustments in Building height;

4. Minor modifications in Structure design and materials, and lighting provided there is the same general appearance; and

5. Minor modifications of landscaping, including substitution of materials.

B. Municipal Planning Commission. The Municipal Planning Commission shall review modifications other than those listed in the above section, and any of the above modifications as recommended by City staff.

1. Should the Municipal Planning Commission find that such modification keeps the essential character of the approved PUD, and does not require an amendment to the PUD Ordinance, the Municipal Planning Commission shall approve such modification.

2. Should the Municipal Planning Commission find that such modification requires an amendment to the PUD Ordinance, the Municipal Planning Commission shall forward a recommendation of approval or denial to the City Council for such amendment.

**Staff Comments:**

Use Considerations:

The proposed mix of uses on the site are in line with the uses already approved for the site and the uses recommended in the Mixed Use (WBC-3) in the Planning & Zoning Code.

Planning & Zoning Code:

The proposal is following the procedures outline in Chapter 1174 to make modifications to a previously approved PUD. The proposed modification does not negatively impact the overall site layout, sign package, landscaping plan, stormwater plan and/or traffic for the site.

Comprehensive Plan Considerations:

- The proposal ties to the Wilson Bridge Road Corridor Study objective to promote the redevelopment of the Wilson Bridge Road Corridor into a mixed-use area that will generate new economic growth within the City.
- The proposal builds upon the previously approved PUD for the overall site and complements the proposed uses and approved site plan and architecture.
- The proposal strengthens land use and economic value, encourages a mix of uses, enhance the livability of the area, augment pedestrian & bicycle connections, promote the construction of high-quality buildings and public spaces that help create and sustain long-term economic vitality.

**Recommendations:**

Staff is recommending ***approval*** of the proposed modification to PUD 01-2018. Please see additional comments above under Staff Comments.

Municipal Planning Commission reviewed and unanimously recommended ***approval*** to modify PUD 01-2018 to permit a mixed-use building at 121 W. Wilson Bridge Rd. on December 10, 2020. The Municipal Planning Commission members felt that the proposal met the objectives outlined in the Comprehensive Plan/Wilson Bridge Road Corridor Study and met the overall needs of the community. The Commission discussed the existing

conditions found on the site, existing zoning, Land Use Plans, Design Guidelines and the general requirements found in the Planning & Zoning Code. The Commission felt that proposed changes would complement the previously approved uses and layout on the site. The Commission felt that since the hotel was not feasible, that this modification would provide a balanced mix of uses that would enhance what was previously approved for the rest of the site. The Commission felt that the height of the building and been reduced and pulled away from the residential to the west and that it added additional outdoor patio space and greenspace to the site. Please see the recording for the [December 10, 2020](#) virtual meeting for comments from each Commission member as it pertains to their vote. The December 10, 2020 meeting minutes are not available at this time.

**Attached:**

- PUD Ordinance
- Exhibit A – Development Text & Development Plan
- PUD Application & Materials
- Development Text – 12.10.2020 – Track Changes