

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING
WORTHINGTON ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
WORTHINGTON MUNICIPAL PLANNING COMMISSION

May 23, 2013

The regular meeting of the Worthington Architectural Review Board and the Worthington Municipal Planning Commission was called to order at 7:30 p.m. with the following members present: Richard Hunter, Chair; James Sauer, Vice Chair; Kathy Holcombe, Secretary; Mikel Coulter; and Jo Rodgers. Also present were: Scott Myers, Worthington City Council Representative for the Municipal Planning Commission; Lynda Bitar, Planning Coordinator and Clerk of the Municipal Planning Commission; and Melissa Cohan, Paralegal. Board member Amy Lloyd was absent.

A. Call to Order – 7:30 p.m.

1. Roll Call
2. Pledge of Allegiance
3. Approval of minutes of the meeting of May 9, 2013

Mr. Coulter moved to approve the minutes, and Mr. Sauer seconded the motion. All members said, “aye”.

4. Affirmation/swearing in of witnesses

B. Architectural Review Board

1. New

- a. Portico, Awnings & Signage – **885 High St.** (Providential Properties) **AR 32-13**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. John Leff approached the microphone and stated his address is 885 High St., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Leff said they have a new tenant who wants to establish a presence in Old Worthington. Mr. Leff said the previous tenant had been there for twenty-five or thirty years, and they did not realize the amount of water damage to the building. They will be replacing the rotten portion with cedar boarding and more weather resistant trim, and then repaint the trim on the entire building in the same color.

Mr. Sauer asked about the dimensions of the hanging signs, citing his concern with the potential for customers to hit their heads. Mr. Leff said he wants to keep the signs small and tasteful, and discussed the recent replacement of sidewalks along the building with landscaping. Mr. Leff did

not think the signs would interfere with pedestrians. Mrs. Holcombe said she liked the projection signs, and wanted to confirm the signs on the doors were going to be removed. Mr. Leff said they will be removed. Mr. Hunter said he was happy to see improvements being done to the building and thought the signs will almost be invisible from High Street. Mr. Hunter said he would like to see some work done on the monument sign eventually for that location, and Mr. Leff agreed. Mrs. Bitar said the current code only allows for three tenants to be listed on a freestanding sign. Mrs. Bitar also said there are other factors to be considered and that updates to the freestanding sign may need to be reviewed by the Board of Zoning Appeals, as well as the Architectural Review Board. Mrs. Holcombe asked how many tenants are occupying the building. Mr. Leff said there are four tenants, with each occupying two units.

Mr. Coulter asked Mrs. Bitar if the applicant would be required to bring back the graphics for the projection signs so the ARB Board could approve those. Mrs. Bitar said she had a discussion with the owner and was told that all of the signs would have black text. Mrs. Bitar asked Mr. Leff if the tenants would have a similar font for each of their projection signs, and Mr. Leff said they would require the signs to have the same font.

Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. The property owner would like to make some changes to this single-story multi-tenant office building, including the addition of a portico, awnings and signage.
2. On the south face of the building there is a pediment framing the two doors furthest to the east. The applicant would like to replace that entrance with a portico that extends approximately 7' from the building and leads to a single door. The structure and trim would be a combination of wood and a cementitious product, with fiberglass columns and a steel door. All elements of the structure are proposed to be painted white, and the asphalt roof shingles would match the existing on the building. Light fixtures are proposed for both sides of the new entry.
3. Black fabric awnings are proposed above the two windows on the east (High St.) side of the building, and above the other building entrances on the south and east elevations adjacent to the parking lot.
4. A new projection sign is proposed for each business in the building. The proposed signs are white and oval shaped, and would dangle from a 36" black bracket with scrolls. Proposed text will be black, but text style has not been identified. A variance has been requested to allow each business to have a projection sign instead of the existing wall signs, which would be removed.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed changes are appropriate.

Mrs. Rodgers moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY PROVIDENTIAL PROPERTIES FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO MAKE ALTERATIONS TO THE BUILDING AT 885 HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 32-13, DRAWINGS NO. AR 32-13, DATED MAY 3, 2013, BE APPROVED AS AMENDED THAT ALL OF THE SIGNS WILL HAVE BLACK TEXT AND ALL IN THE SAME FONT AND BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Coulter seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said the motion has been approved.

b. Dumpster Gate – **649 High St.** (Jim Stoneking/Worthington Inn) **AR 33-13**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present.

Mr. Jim Stoneking approached the microphone and stated he is the Chief Engineer of the Worthington Inn. He said they are trying to cover up the dumpster to make the area look presentable because the dumpster is located near an area where people come in and out of the building. Mrs. Holcombe said she liked the choice of the wrought iron hardware for the enclosure. Mr. Stoneking said the gate will be paint a cream color to match the window trim.

Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. There is an existing dumpster enclosure on the north side of the Worthington Inn. The applicant is requesting approval to add a new gate.
2. The posts, frame, and trim for the gate doors are proposed to be iron. Cedar pickets are proposed to be attached to the frame. The gate would be 12' wide x 7' high.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed gate will be an improvement.

Mr. Coulter moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY JIM STONEKING FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO ADD A GATE TO THE DUMPSTER ENCLOSURE AT 649 HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 33-13, DRAWINGS NO. AR 33-13, DATED MAY 9,

2013, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said the motion has been approved.

- c. Windows and Satellite Dish – **135 W. Clearview Ave.** (Brett & Kay Holland) **AR 34-14** (Amendment to AR 50-12)

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Brett Holland approached the microphone and stated his address is 135 W. Clearview Ave., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Holland said they are trying to reuse as many of the windows as they can, and felt the originally proposed vent above the garage would have been too small. Mr. Holland said there are currently four windows flanking a center door on the north side of the screened porch, and Mr. Holland has proposed replacing the area with six windows.

Mr. Holland said the satellite dish would be visible from Evening Street Elementary School, but not visible if driving down Evening Street, unless you were in a very tall bus, or semi-truck. He said the other option was to locate the satellite dish on the south side of the house, but then it would be visible to people driving down Evening Street. He is proposing to place the dish on the upper story of the back of the existing house.

Mr. Sauer was concerned that replacing an odd number of openings with an even number of windows would make the arch over the windows look off center. He said the windows would look more balanced by keeping an odd number of windows. Mr. Holland said his budget would not allow for creating custom windows. Mr. Holland feels the home will look very nice. Mrs. Holcombe said she was fine with the proposed windows, and that the new windows will be a big improvement over what is there now.

Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. The homeowners would like to make several changes to the previously approved plans to construct an addition at this location.
2. A window removed from the existing house is proposed to take the place of a vent above the garage doors.
3. New white vinyl windows are proposed for the existing enclosed porch at the northwest corner of the house. The existing windows are aluminum. The proposed will fill approximately the same size openings.

4. A satellite dish has been temporarily located on the west side of the house. A permanent location for the dish is proposed on the second story of the original house on the south side, approximately 11' from the west wall of the house. The homeowner indicates the dish cannot be seen from the street.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed changes are appropriate.

Mrs. Holcombe moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY BRETT AND KAY HOLLAND FOR APPROVAL TO AMEND CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS #COA 50-12 BY MAKING CHANGES AT 135 W. CLEARVIEW AVE. AS PER CASE NO. AR 34-13, DRAWINGS NO. AR 34-13, DATED MAY 10, 2013, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Coulter seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, nay; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said the motion has been approved.

- d. Sign – **2181 W. Dublin-Granville Rd.** (Brian Zaayer/Computer Services) **AR 35-13**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present.

Mr. Brian Zaayer approached the microphone and stated he is the owner of the business at 2181 W. Dublin-Granville Rd., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Zaayer showed the letters he plans to use to the Board members. Mr. Hunter said the letters matched the letters of the neighboring business “Dublin Cleaners”, not the submitted drawing. Mrs. Holcombe said she was happy to see that the letters will match the neighboring business. Mr. Sauer asked what type of business will be operating in the new space. Mr. Zaayer said that they will be offering computer repair services.

Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. Individual 12” high white letters spelling “Computer Services” are proposed for the existing sign band.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed sign is appropriate.

Mrs. Rodgers moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY BRIAN ZAAVER FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO INSTALL A SIGN AT 2181 W. DUBLIN-GRANVILLE RD. AS PER CASE NO. AR 35-13, DRAWINGS NO. AR 35-13, DATED MAY 10, 2013, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Sauer seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said the motion has been approved.

e. Siding – **300 W. Dublin-Granville Rd.** (Mikel Coulter, AIA/TWHS) **AR 36-13**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Hunter said to let the record show that Mr. Coulter has temporarily left his seat with the Architectural Review Board, and is now the applicant for this matter. When it comes to voting time, Mr. Coulter will abstain from voting.

Mr. Coulter approached the microphone and stated his address is 686 Evening St., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Coulter said he is representing the Worthington School District. Mr. Coulter said his firm was hired to replace one third of the roofing on Thomas Worthington High School. Mr. Coulter explained the same materials will be used to replace the roof as what they used to replace other portions of the school's roof about six years ago.

Mr. Coulter said the metal siding has been leaking for quite some time so both issues will be taken care of at the same time.

Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. This application is a request to replace vertical metal siding on the rear (north side) of Thomas Worthington High School. The proposed siding would match the existing siding on the south side of the building. A sample was presented at the meeting.
2. The proposed work also involves roof replacement which is considered maintenance and not subject to review by the Board. The shingled area of the roof will be replaced with matching shingles, and the flat portion will not be seen.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed siding is appropriate for that location.

Mr. Sauer moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY MIKEL COULTER FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO REPLACE SIDING AT 300 W. DUBLIN-GRANVILLE RD. AS PER CASE NO. AR 36-13, DRAWINGS NO. AR 36-13, DATED MAY 13, 2013, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Coulter, abstain; and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said the motion has been approved.

Mr. Hunter said to let the record show that Mr. Coulter re-joined the Commission.

C. Municipal Planning Commission

1. Amendment to Development Plan

a. Canopy – **100 & 200 Old Wilson Bridge Rd.** (Worthington Industries/Triangle Real Estate LLC) **ADP 01-13**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Don Martin approached the microphone and stated he is with Village Communities, the General Contractor for the project. Mr. Martin said his company is charged with renovating office space for Worthington Industries. It was decided that since there would be a high amount of traffic between the two buildings it would be nice for the employees and out of town guests to have a walkway between the two buildings. They would like the permission to move forward with this project.

Mr. Coulter asked if Mr. Martin planned to put side curtains up, and if lighting would be needed inside the walkway. Mr. Martin said lighting was not scheduled at this time, but side curtains are available if needed and permitted. Mr. Hunter said he would not have an objection to adding side curtains to the motion. Mr. Coulter said they could allow lighting in the walkway as an option also.

Mr. Sauer said there is a change in the grade, and he asked Mr. Martin if the canopy would follow the change in the grade. Mr. Martin said it would. Mr. Sauer asked if the aluminum could match the mullions of the windows and Mr. Martin said yes. Mr. Martin said the color is bronze.

Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this matter and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. Worthington Industries will be leasing space in the 100 Old Wilson Bridge Rd. building, and would like to connect the office space to its building at 200 Old Wilson Bridge Rd. with a covered walkway.
2. The proposed connection includes a concrete sidewalk and gabled aluminum canopy structure covered with blue awning material. The structure will match the color of the window framing. Side curtains and lighting are optional.
3. Because the canopy would cross the property line between the buildings, the requirement to be at least 30'-40' from the property line with a structure would be violated on both properties. Side yard setback variances may be granted by the City Council with regard to approval of an Amendment to Development Plan.

Conclusions:

1. The proposed covered walkway will not change the character of the properties.
2. The required variances are appropriate for this structure.

Mr. Sauer moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY WORTHINGTON INDUSTRIES FOR APPROVAL TO AMEND THE DEVELOPMENT PLANS FOR 100 & 200 OLD WILSON BRIDGE RD. BY ADDING A CANOPY IN THE SIDE YARD SETBACK AREAS, AS PER CASE NO. ADP 01-13, DRAWINGS NO. ADP 01-13, DATED MAY 14, 2013, AS AMENDED THAT SIDE CURTAINS BE ALLOWED TO BE INSTALLED IN THE FUTURE; THAT THE TUBE FRAMING BE PAINTED TO MATCH THE WINDOW FRAMING OF THE ADJACENT BUILDING; AND THAT IF SIDE CURTAINS ARE INSTALLED INTERIOR LIGHTING MAY BE ADDED AT THE SAME TIME, BE RECOMMENDED TO CITY COUNCIL FOR APPROVAL BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; and Mr. Coulter, aye.

D. Other

Mr. Hunter asked Mrs. Bitar if there was any other business. Mrs. Bitar spoke about elimination of the logo from the retaining wall at the southwest corner of the interchange project. All of the other improvements are still planned as far as Mrs. Bitar knows.

E. Adjournment

Mrs. Holcombe moved to adjourn the meeting at 8:29 p.m., and Mr. Coulter seconded the motion. All members said, "aye".