

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING
WORTHINGTON ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
WORTHINGTON MUNICIPAL PLANNING COMMISSION

December 13, 2012

The regular meeting of the Worthington Architectural Review Board and the Worthington Municipal Planning Commission was called to order at 7:30 p.m. with the following members present: Richard Hunter, Chair; James Sauer, Vice Chair; Kathy Holcombe, Secretary; Chris Hermann (arrived at 7:48 p.m.); Mikel Coulter; Amy Lloyd and Jo Rodgers. Also present were: Scott Myers, Worthington City Council Representative for the Municipal Planning Commission and Lynda Bitar, Development Coordinator and Clerk of the Municipal Planning Commission. Melissa Cohan, Paralegal, was absent.

A. Call to Order – 7:30 p.m.

1. Roll Call
2. Pledge of Allegiance
3. Approval of the minutes of the meetings of November 8, 2012.

Mr. Coulter moved to approve the minutes, and Mrs. Rodgers seconded the motion. All members said “aye”.

4. Affirmation/swearing in of witnesses

B. Architectural Review Board

1. Unfinished

- a. New Residential Buildings – **7227 N. High St.** (M&A Architects/Crawford Hoying Development Partners) **AR 110-12**

This item remained tabled.

2. New

- a. Fence – **679 High St.** (CRV-XIV Worthington Limited) **AR 119-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. She said the landlord of the building has removed the dumpster and its enclosure fence and given individual trash cans to each of the tenants. The landlord would like to relocate the fence along the asphalt in the back of the parking lot. Mrs. Bitar said the relocation of the fence would help screen the area and be

beneficial to both the public side and the residential side of the area. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Scott Beaver approached the microphone and stated his address is P.O. Box 2235, Westerville, Ohio.

Mr. Coulter asked Mr. Beaver for a little more clarification about the fence. Mr. Beaver said it is a straight line fence that does not turn.

Mr. Sauer said he thought the fence was a good idea. He suggested extending the fence six feet if possible to help screen the area near the condominiums. Mr. Beaver said that would be fine. Mrs. Rodgers asked if the fence would be painted and Mr. Beaver said yes, it would be the same color as the building.

Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and one person came forward. Mr. Kinsley Nyce approached the microphone and stated he was representing 697 through 709 Wesley Court, Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Nyce said he called and left messages to talk with the landlord of the building. He appreciated Mr. Sauer's suggestion of extending the fence back six feet and asked to have the fence painted beige/sand on the side that faces the condominiums. Mr. Beaver said that would be fine, but he would like to have the public side of the fence painted to match the building. There were no other speakers.

Findings of fact:

1. Re-installation of fencing that was part of a recently removed dumpster enclosure is proposed. The enclosure was west of the building. The new location will be along the northern edge of the asphalt on the west side of the building, running 27' west from an existing screen fence for HVAC equipment next to the building.
2. The fence sections are wood that is painted gray to match the building. The side facing the condominiums will be painted beige/sand.
3. The fence sections will have the supporting members facing south.

Conclusion:

1. This proposal will provide additional screening for the residential neighbors to the north, which is desirable.

Mr. Coulter moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY CRV-XIV WORTHINGTON LIMITED FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO INSTALL FENCING AT 679 HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 119-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 119-12, DATED NOVEMBER 19, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING WITH THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS:

- **FENCE IS TO BE PAINTED GRAY ON THE PUBLIC SIDE, AND BEIGE/SAND ON THE CONDOMINIUM SIDE**
- **STRUCTURAL MEMBERS ARE TO BE ON THE PUBLIC SIDE**
- **FENCE IS TO BE EXTENDED ANOTHER SIX FEET**

Mrs. Rodgers seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye; and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

b. Compressor Unit – **788 Evening St.** (Columbus Worthington Air/North) **AR 119-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Jon Ford approached the microphone and stated his address is 554 Haymore Ave., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Ford said he was representing Worthington Air, the company that installed the unit.

Mr. Ford said the homeowners recently remodeled their home and turned their garage attic into a playroom for their children. The mini split is about half of the size of a regular compressor, and much quieter. He said the unit is well hidden behind the garage and barely visible from the neighbors' yard.

Mr. Hunter said in the future the Board would like to review the application to install units within the Architectural Review District in the event a problem arises so the issues can be addressed. Mr. Ford said he understood. Mr. Hunter asked if there was any present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. With the goal of heating and cooling a children's play room above the garage, a mini-split heat pump system was installed at the rear of the garage.
2. Approval is needed for a white compressor mounted at the base of the rear garage wall.
3. The property is roughly 90' wide and 252' deep.

Conclusion:

1. The exterior unit is appropriately placed on the property.

Mr. Sauer moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY COLUMBUS WORTHINGTON AIR ON BEHALF OF TYLER AND LAURA NORTH FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO INSTALL A COMPRESSOR AT 788 EVENING ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 120-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 120-12, DATED NOVEMBER 27, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Coulter seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye; and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

c. Air Conditioning Unit – **137 E. Granville Rd.** (Cal Taylor/Sharon Memorial Board) **AR 121-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. There are currently two other units that are green in color and screened by bushes. The new unit to be installed is smaller than the existing units and will also be screened by the bushes. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Scott Haring approached the microphone and stated his address is 935 Claycraft Rd., Gahanna, Ohio. Mr. Haring said he works for Custom Air in Gahanna and he is the one who will be installing the unit. Mr. Haring said the new unit is smaller and one decibel softer than the other two units and all three will be hidden by bushes. Mr. Hunter asked what color the unit was and Mr. Haring said it is beige. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. A third air conditioning unit is proposed for placement adjacent to two existing units at the southwest corner of the building.
2. Existing evergreen plant material is proposed to screen the new unit.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed placement of the additional unit is appropriate.

Mrs. Rodgers moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY CAL TAYLOR ON BEHALF OF THE SHARON MEMORIAL BOARD FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO INSTALL A NEW AIR CONDITIONING UNIT AT 137 E. GRANVILLE RD. AS PER CASE NO. AR 121-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 121-12, DATED NOVEMBER 29, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye; and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

d. Sign – **693 ½ High St.** (Natalie Bentz) **AR 122-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. The applicant would like to add a panel to an already existing projection sign. The business is called the Relaxation Station, and the applicant would like to promote a new service. The sign will be made by the same company and will blend in. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Ms. Martha Burke approached the microphone and stated the address is 693 ½ High St., Worthington, Ohio. Ms. Burke stated she was representing the owner of the business, Natalie Bentz, because Ms. Bentz could not attend the meeting. Ms. Burke said Ms. Bentz recently acquired certification for Reflexology and will be offering that service to clients. Ms. Burke also stated Ms. Bentz already has an established clientele such as professional athletes, and referrals from physicians. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. A 3 ½” tall by 24” wide panel is proposed to attach to the bottom of the existing projection sign for the Relaxation Station, which is near the north side entrance to the second floor of the building.
2. The additional panel will match the existing in design, colors and material.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed sign panel addition is appropriate

Mrs. Holcombe moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY NATALIE BENTZ FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO ADD A PANEL TO THE EXISTING PROJECTION SIGN AT 693 ½ HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 122-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 122-12, DATED NOVEMBER 30, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Lloyd seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye; and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

e. Generator – **5760 N. High St.** (Gary Wallace) **AR 123-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. The applicant has already installed the generator. The business is involved in financial services so they installed the generator for back up. It is slightly visible from High Street. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Gary Wallace approached the microphone and stated his address is 8003 Storrow Drive, Westerville, Ohio. Mr. Wallace stated he is an engineer with GW Engineering, and was asked by his client to prepare the application. Mr. Wallace said his client thought it was okay to install the generator because he thought his business was located within the City of Columbus. Mr. Hunter asked Mr. Wallace that specific location was chosen for the generator, and Mr. Wallace said he did not know the answer. Mr. Hunter said this unit will need additional screening. Mrs. Holcombe stated that generators can only be tested during the week between the hours of 9:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m., and she would like to see a tree planted in that area. Mr. Wallace asked for permission to call his client to see if it is acceptable to plant a tree. Mr. Hunter said the application could be temporarily tabled so that Mr. Wallace could contact his client. Mrs. Holcombe moved to table the application and Mr. Sauer seconded the motion. All Board members said, "aye". At the end of the meeting Mr. Coulter moved to remove the application from tabled status and Mr. Hermann seconded the motion. Mr. Wallace stated his client agreed to plant a similar sized tree in a similar species to help screen the generator. There were no other speakers.

Findings of fact:

1. Approval is requested for a generator that was installed on the south side of the building.
2. The generator is partially screened by a brick wall and plant material.

Conclusion:

1. Placement is appropriate, but additional plant material for screening may be needed.

Mr. Sauer moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY GARY WALLACE ON BEHALF OF RABOLD INVESTMENTS, LLC FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO HAVE A GENERATOR AT 5760 N. HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 123-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 123-12, DATED NOVEMBER 30, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING WITH THE CONDITION TO PLANT AN EVERGREEN TREE OF THE SAME SIZE AS THE ADJACENT TREE TO MATCH THE HEIGHT OF THE TOP OF THE GENERATOR.

Mrs. Rodgers seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye; and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

f. Wireless Telecommunications Facility – Modification – **300 W. Dublin-Granville Rd.**
(SureSite Consulting Group LLC) **AR 118-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application, pointing out that the green fabric approved for screening the enclosed area of the bleachers, used for utility purposes, has been removed. Mrs. Bitar said she spoke with the facilities manager for the Worthington Schools, and apparently the fabric was removed a few years ago due to its poor condition. It was never replaced. Mr. Sauer asked who was responsible for the fence, and Mrs. Bitar said it is unclear. Mr. Coulter said that whoever holds the lease agreement should be responsible for the upkeep of the screening. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Ms. Mary Cirhanski approached the microphone and stated her address is 3659 Green Rd., Suite 214, Cleveland, Ohio 44122. Ms. Cirhanski stated she is a representative for SureSite Consulting Group.

Ms. Cirhanski said three different carriers have their equipment on the tower which is owned by AT&T. AT&T is the one who has the agreement with the school. Ms. Cirhanski said she would relay the message back to AT&T that something needs to be done to replace the screening material. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. The applicant is proposing to replace and add antenna panels to the existing monopole on the west side of the Thomas Worthington High School main athletic field in the middle.
2. Equipment will be added to the enclosed area at the base of the pole.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed modifications should not change the look of the facility.

Mr. Sauer moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY SURESITE CONSULTING GROUP LLC FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO MODIFY AN EXISTING WIRELESS TELECOMMUNICATIONS FACILITY AT 300 W. DUBLIN-GRANVILLE RD. AS PER CASE NO. AR 118-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 118-12, DATED OCTOBER 31, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye; and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

C. Municipal Planning Commission

1. Conditional Use Permit – Unfinished

- a. Residential Uses in C-2 Zoning District – **7227 N. High St.** (M&A Architects/Crawford Hoying Development) **CU 09-12**

This item remained tabled.

2. Conditional Use Permit – New

- a. Wireless Telecommunications Facility in S-1 Zoning District – Modification – **300 W. Dublin-Granville Rd.** (SureSite Consulting Group LLC) **CU 11-12**

Mr. Hunter asked if there were any additional comments and Mrs. Bitar said no. Board members had no other comments or concerns. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. The applicant is proposing to replace and add antenna panels to the existing monopole on the west side of the Thomas Worthington High School main athletic field in the middle.
2. Equipment will be added to the enclosed area at the base of the pole.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed modifications will not change the effect or appearance of the facility.

Mr. Hermann moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY SURESITE CONSULTING GROUP LLC FOR A CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT TO MODIFY AN EXISTING WIRELESS TELECOMMUNICATIONS FACILITY IN THE S-1 ZONING DISTRICT AT 300 W. DUBLIN-GRANVILLE RD. AS PER CASE NO. CU 11-12, DRAWINGS NO. CU 11-12, DATED OCTOBER 31, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

3. Amendment to Development Plan – Unfinished Business

- a. New Buildings – **7227 N. High St.** (M&A Architects/Crawford Hoying Development) **ADP 11-12**

This item remains tabled.

4. Subdivision – Unfinished Business

- a. Preliminary Plat – **7227 N. High St.** (M&A Architects/Crawford Hoying Development)
SUB 03-12

This item remains tabled.

D. Other

Mr. Hunter stated that all four members of the Municipal Planning Commission and Architectural Review Board were reinstated by City Council. Mr. Hunter also thanked Mr. Myers for his continued representation of City Council. Mr. Myers will be serving in 2013 also. Mr. Hunter thanked everyone for doing a good job.

Mrs. Holcombe moved to adjourn the meeting. Mr. Hermann seconded the motion. The meeting adjourned at 8:23 p.m.