

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING
WORTHINGTON ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
WORTHINGTON MUNICIPAL PLANNING COMMISSION

July 12, 2012

The regular meeting of the Worthington Architectural Review Board and the Worthington Municipal Planning Commission was called to order at 7:30 p.m. with the following members present: Kathy Holcombe, Secretary; Chris Hermann; Mikel Coulter; Amy Lloyd and Jo Rodgers. Also present were: Scott Myers, Worthington City Council Representative for the Municipal Planning Commission; Lynda Bitar, Development Coordinator and Clerk of the Municipal Planning Commission and Melissa Cohan, Paralegal. Board members Richard Hunter, Chair and James Sauer, Vice Chair were absent.

A. Call to Order – 7:30 p.m.

1. Roll Call
2. Pledge of Allegiance
3. Approval of the minutes of the meetings of June 28, 2012.

Mr. Coulter moved to approve the minutes, and Mrs. Lloyd seconded the motion. All members said “aye”.

4. Affirmation/swearing in of witnesses

B. Architectural Review Board

1. New

- a. Door Replacement – **1 Kenyon Brook Dr.** (Roger Simmons) **AR 60-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. Mrs. Bitar said that the new door will not be very visible from the road but the door is subject to approval because the house is in the Architectural Review District. Mrs. Holcombe asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Roger Simmons approached the microphone and stated he lives at 1 Kenyon Brook Drive, Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Simmons said there were two reasons for needing a new door. Mr. Simmons said it is an interior door and they are losing a lot of energy, losing heat in the winter and losing air conditioning in the summer. He also said they need the new door for security reasons because you can push right through it. The door will be painted the same color. Mrs. Holcombe asked if there was anyone that wanted address this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. The homeowners would like to replace the front and side doors of this home for security and energy efficiency purposes.
2. The proposed doors are different in style, but will be painted to match the existing.
3. Visibility of the doors is limited.

Conclusions:

1. Although the style of the doors may not be completely in character with the house, the proposed should not harm the look of the property or the District.
2. The new doors should be more secure and energy efficient.

Mrs. Rodgers moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY ROGER SIMMONS FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO REPLACE TWO DOORS AT 1 KENYON BROOK DR. AS PER CASE NO. AR 60-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 60-12, DATED JUNE 29, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Hermann seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mrs. Holcombe said it has been approved.

- b. Storefront & Signage – **7227 N. High St., Space 087** (M&A Architects, Inc./Swan Cleaners) **AR 53-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. Mrs. Bitar said they had not seen the specifications sheet on the night drop box yet, but was told that it would be bronze in color. Also, a sliding glass door with awning above is proposed on the side. This request is being amended to consider a minor change to Amano's patio plans. Pictures of the construction sight were reviewed. Mrs. Holcombe asked if the applicant was present.

Lori Bongiorno approached the microphone and stated her address is 775 Yard St., Grandview, Ohio. Mr. Hermann asked Mrs. Bongiorno if Swan's side awning will be the same color as the front and she said yes. He also asked if there would be screening for the service area on the north side, and Mrs. Bongiorno said they have not planned screening for that area yet. Mr. Coulter asked for clarification as to where the awning will be and Mrs. Bongiorno said that it will be over the transom area. Mr. Coulter said it would be nice to see Swan incorporate their logo into the signage instead of just using block letters. Mr. Myers said that he agreed the wall

sign looks very plain and kind of cheapens the look. Mr. Coulter said he was okay with the blade sign. Mrs. Holcombe asked if the Board could separate the motion from the box letters and Mrs. Bitar said yes. Mrs. Holcombe asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and one person came forward.

Mr. Joseph Supolla approached the microphone and stated his address is 6330 Dublin Rd., Dublin, Ohio. Mr. Supolla said he suggested using a red awning with the swan logo on it but the client did not like it. Mrs. Bitar asked Mrs. Bongiorno what lettering would be on the night drop box and Mrs. Bongiorno said that she was not sure yet.

There were no other speakers.

Findings of fact:

1. This application is a request for approval of a drop box and signage for Swan Cleaners.
2. A drop box painted dark bronze to match the storefront system is proposed for the left side of the door, flush with the storefront.
3. An externally illuminated 3' x 3' projection sign is proposed in the area to the right of the sign band. The proposed sign will be mounted on 1" square aluminum tube support brackets, and have a white background with a black and white oval logo. The logo has a swan in the shape of an "S". Small lights will be mounted for illumination.
4. White block style internally illuminated channel letters are proposed above the entry door, but removed from the application by the Board.

Conclusions:

1. The drop box should be appropriate for the storefront.
2. The projection sign is appropriate.
3. For internally illuminated signs, the lettering should be stylized and not just plain block. Use of the same letter styles as on the projection sign may be appropriate.

Mr. Coulter moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY M&A ARCHTIECTS, INC. FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO INSTALL SIGNAGE AND A DROP BOX AT 7227 N. HIGH ST., SPACE 087 AS PER CASE NO. AR 53-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 53-12, DATED JUNE 22, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING WITH THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS:

- **THAT THE CHANGES PROPOSED FOR AMANO’S PATIO ARE ACCEPTED AS SUBMITTED**
- **THE MAIN SIGN ABOVE THE STOREFRONT IS NOT ACCEPTABLE AS SHOWN, IT WILL BE REQUIRED TO RE-SUBMIT TO THE BOARD FOR REVIEW**
- **THE VERBAGE “NIGHT DROP BOX” CAN BE ADDED**
- **THE SLIDING GLASS DOOR IS APPROVED AS SHOWN AT THE MEETING**

Mr. Hermann seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mrs. Holcombe said it has been approved.

c. Signage – **7227 N. High St., Space 116** (DaNite Sign Co./First Watch) **AR 59-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. The applicant would like to install a sign that incorporates their new logo. Mrs. Bitar said staff and M & A Architects did not want the client to use exposed raceways so the raceways will be behind the walls. Mrs. Holcombe asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Robert Schorr approached the microphone and stated his address is 3818 Kinsey Dr., Columbus, Ohio. Mr. Schorr said the sun and the fork will not be illuminated, but the letters will be illuminated. The applicant said he can shrink the sign to fit into the sign band. Mrs. Holcombe asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. New signage is proposed for First Watch that is modified from the earlier approved renderings.
2. A wall sign is proposed in place of the existing on the brick “tower” part of the building. The proposed sign has internally illuminated channel letters, and will fit in the upper portion of the tower. The letters are white and the logo is yellow and green and will not be illuminated. Non-illuminated black letters saying “The Daytime Café” are proposed below.
3. Two non-illuminated pvc painted oval signs are proposed to be suspended from the existing arbor. These signs are 4’ wide and 1’2” high and will say “FirstWatch” and include the logo.

Conclusions:

1. The wall sign is appropriate for this location.
2. The oval signs may be appropriate, but the final look should be clear before approval.

Mr. Coulter moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY DANITE SIGN CO. FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO INSTALL NEW SIGNAGE AT 7227 N. HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 59-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 59-12, DATED JUNE 29, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING WITH THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS:

- **THAT THE SIGN AS PRESENTED WILL BE SHRUNK TO BE IN THE UPPER SIGN BAND WITH A 4" SPACE ABOVE AND BELOW**

Mrs. Lloyd seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mrs. Holcombe said it has been approved.

d. Roof – **551 Evening St.** (Able Roofing LLC/Caudill) **AR 54-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. Samples of the materials were distributed amongst the Board members for review. Mrs. Holcombe asked if the applicant was present. Ms. Tiffany Reimenschneider approached the microphone and stated she lives at 4777 Westerville Rd., Columbus, Ohio 43231. Mr. Hermann asked Ms. Reimenschneider if she would be replacing the entire roof, including the garage, and she answered yes. There were no other questions. Mrs. Holcombe asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. The applicant is planning to replace the existing roof, including underlayment, ice and water shields, and flashings, and place new gutters.
2. The shingle color will change from Weathered Wood to Princeton Slate. The gutters will be almond to match the existing siding.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed change is appropriate.

Mrs. Rodgers moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY ABLE ROOFING LLC FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO REPLACE THE ROOF AT 551 EVENING ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 54-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 54-12, DATED JUNE 28, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Lloyed seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mrs. Holcombe said it has been approved.

e. Demolition – **2287 W. Dublin-Granville Rd.** (Segna Investment, Inc.) **AR 55-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. She said the house to be demolished was built in 1830, and possibly a bit later because of the method of construction. The house has been used as commercial property for a long time, being a bait shop and used for camper sales most recently. Two former gas stations are also proposed to be demolished, but are on the Perry Township property. The asbestos has already been removed. The plan is to re-develop the entire site. Mrs. Holcombe asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Joseph Segna approached the microphone and stated his address is 781 Northwest Blvd., Columbus, Ohio.

Mr. Segna said the lot is a five acre parcel. Part of it is located in Perry Township and part of it is located in Worthington. He said there are no utilities but one of the gas stations has water. The building is not ADA compliant. He would like to make the site more suitable for a client. The property is currently on the market and they are looking for a developer.

Mr. Myers asked Mrs. Bitar if she walked the property with Mr. Foust and she said yes. Mrs. Bitar said Mr. Foust could not find much of historical value. There were no other questions.

Findings of fact:

1. The structure proposed to be demolished was constructed in 1830 as a house, but has been used as a commercial property for a long time. It is part of a site owned by Segna Investment, Inc. which was most recently used as a car dealership. Also on the larger site, much of which is in Perry Township, two former gas stations are also proposed for demolition.
2. Significant alterations have been made to the structure over the years. Historical references to the property have not been found.
3. The Division of Building Inspection has indicated conformance to either the commercial or residential building codes would be difficult.

Conclusion:

1. There does not appear to be value in saving this structure on this site.

Mr. Hermann moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY SEGNA INVESTMENT, INC. FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO DEMOLISH THE BUILDING AT 2287 W. DUBLIN-

GRANVILLE RD. AS PER CASE NO. AR 55-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 55-12, DATED JUNE 28, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Coulter seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mrs. Holcombe said it has been approved.

f. Addition – 50 W. Stafford Ave. (James Ross/Harris) AR 56-12

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. Mrs. Holcombe asked if the applicant was present. Mr. James Ross approached the microphone and stated his address is 6120 Crystal Valley Dr., Galena, Ohio. There were no other questions asked. Mrs. Holcombe asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. A 9' x 10' addition is proposed for the east side of the structure, placed behind the front part of the house.
2. The proposed addition is designed to match the house in style and materials. The entire house will be painted in the near future

Conclusion:

1. The proposed addition is appropriate for the house.

Mr. Hermann moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY JAMES ROSS FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO CONTRUCT AN ADDITION AT 50 W. STAFFORD AVE. AS PER CASE NO. AR 56-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 56-12, DATED JUNE 28, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Lloyd seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mrs. Holcombe said it has been approved.

g. Door Removal – **250 E. Granville Rd.** (Timothy & Caren Troester) **AR 57-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. Mrs. Holcombe asked if the applicant was present. Mrs. Caren Troester approached the microphone and stated that she lives at 250 E. Granville Rd., Worthington, Ohio. Mrs. Troester said that she is turning her office into a nursery and would like the option of either removing the door and building a wall or replacing the door with a solid door. If she replaces the door with a wall, she said the exterior wall would match the rest of the house. There were no other questions. Mrs. Holcombe asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. Removal of an existing door, or replacement with a solid door on the east side of the front porch is proposed.
2. The wall will be finished with the same siding as the rest of the porch area.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed change is appropriate.

Mr. Coulter moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY TIMOTHY & CAREN TROESTER FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO REMOVE A DOOR AT 250 E. GRANVILLE RD. AS PER CASE NO. AR 57-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 57-12, DATED JUNE 29, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING WITH THE FOLLOWING CONDITION:

- **THAT THE OWNER HAVE THE OPTION OF EITHER REMOVING THE DOOR AND REPLACING WITH A SOLID WALL OR WITH A SOLID DOOR.**

Mrs. Rodgers seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mrs. Holcombe said it has been approved.

h. Sign – **2171 W. Dublin-Granville Rd.** (Sign-a-Rama/Delightful Cakes) **AR 58-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar discussed the facts from the application. Mrs. Holcombe asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Craig Snider approached the microphone and stated he is a representative for Sign-A-Rama and his address is 9985 Sawmill Parkway, Powell, Ohio. Mrs. Holcombe asked if the background area would be painted and Mr. Snider said yes. There were no other questions. Mrs. Holcombe asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. A sign face is proposed for a new business called "Delightful Cakes".
2. The background of the proposed sign is burgundy, and white letters are proposed. Although the text style is similar to those previously approved for the center, it is slightly different. Also, the original lettering for the center was proposed to be off-white, but white has been approved and installed for other businesses.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed sign face will fit in with other signs in the center.

Mr. Hermann moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY SIGN-A-RAMA FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO INSTALL A SIGN. AS PER CASE NO. AR 58-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 58-12, DATED JUNE 29, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING WITH THE CONDITION THAT THE BACKGROUND AREA OF THE SIGN BE PATCHED AND PAINTED.

Mrs. Lloyd seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mrs. Holcombe said it has been approved.

C. Municipal Planning Commission

1. Subdivision

- a. Preliminary Plat – **6520, 6530, 6540 Huntley Rd.** (Taylor Property Development, Ltd. & RT Industrial Group, Ltd.) **SUB 02-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar explained that the applicants have asked to table this matter.

Mr. Coulter moved to table this matter and Mr. Hermann seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; and Mr. Coulter, aye. Mrs. Holcombe said that this matter has been tabled.

There was no other business to discuss. Mr. Coulter moved to adjourn the meeting and Mrs. Rodgers seconded the motion. All members said aye. The meeting adjourned at 8:25 p.m.