

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING
WORTHINGTON ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
WORTHINGTON MUNICIPAL PLANNING COMMISSION

November 11, 2010

The regular meeting of the Worthington Architectural Review Board and the Worthington Municipal Planning Commission was called to order at 7:30 p.m. with the following members present: Richard Hunter, Chair; James Sauer, Vice-Chair; Kathy Holcombe, Secretary; Chris Hermann; Mikel Coulter, Jo Rodgers and Amy Lloyd. Also present were Scott Myers, Worthington City Council Representative for the Municipal Planning Commission; Lynda Bitar, Development Coordinator and Clerk of the Municipal Planning Commission, and Melissa Cohan, Paralegal.

A. Call to Order – 7:30 p.m.

1. Roll Call
2. Pledge of Allegiance
3. The October 25th Tour of Easton minutes were approved.
4. Affirmation/Swearing in of Witnesses

Mrs. Bitar swore in those who planned to speak.

B. Architectural Review Board

1. Landscape – **777 Evening St.** (McConnell Arts Center) **AR 73-10**
(Amendment to AR 68-08)

This application was tabled pending a commitment from the Arts Center to paint the building trim as was agreed to at a previous meeting. Mrs. Bitar indicated the vertical trim has been painted. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Andy Herron approached the microphone and stated that he lives at 1436 Tall Pine Ct., Columbus, Ohio. Mr. Herron said that he is the Facility Manager for the Arts Center.

Discussion:

Mr. Sauer thanked Mr. Herron for getting the trim painted. Mr. Herron said that he would like to proceed with their application to amend the previously approved landscaping plan for around the building. He believes that the gravel is much more attractive, and will be easier to maintain. There will be a weed mat under the gravel to control weed growth. Mr. Hermann was concerned about the size of the plants they plan to purchase for the facility. Mr. Herron said that they will

be planting mostly small ground which will only be about six to eight inches high when its fully matured, and the other grasses will probably mature to about four or five feet. The grasses will be about half of that size when they are planted. Mr. Herron said that they do not plan to buy fully matured plants. Mr. Hermann asked Mr. Herron if it possible to fill in the gaps between the boxwood hedge, and Mr. Herron said that is a possibility. Mr. Hermann also asked Mr. Herron about why they decided on gravel instead of turf or grass, and Mr. Herron said that it will look nice to have the stone that matches the brick and tan exterior, and it will be low maintenance. Mr. Herron said that he had a difficult time trying to get rid of the weeds, and eventually hired help to deal with the weeds. Mrs. Holcombe felt that there will still be an issue with weeds, even while using a weed mat, and asked Mr. Herron if the landscape company he called for help will continue to provide maintenance. Mr. Herron said having a maintenance contract has been discussed.

Mr. Herron also said that there will be metal trim along the walkway, separating the two gravel colors. Mr. Coulter asked Mr. Herron if he plans to get the entire landscaping plan done at this time, and Mr. Herron said no, they are just installing gravel at this time, and plan to add plants in the spring and summer. He said they should have their landscaping complete by this time next year.

Mr. Sauer mentioned to Mr. Herron that he thought that the signage for the building is out of character, but realized that directional signage is not part of Mr. Herron's application. Mr. Sauer said that in the future Mr. Herron might want to address different no parking and handicap signs.

Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. The Arts Center would like approval to amend the previously approved landscaping plan for the area around the building.
2. Gravel walkways and other gravel areas along with additional plants will be added to the existing plant material.
3. A paver patio is proposed that may house benches and a small table. The tents on the drawing are not proposed at this time, but are shown to illustrate what would fit for special events.
4. Additional shrubs must be added between the existing around the building.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed changes are acceptable.

Mr. Hermann motioned:

THAT THE REQUEST BY MCCONNELL ARTS CENTER FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO AMEND THE LANDSCAPING PLAN AT 777 EVENING ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 73-10, DRAWINGS NO. AR 73-10, DATED OCTOBER 15, 2010, BE APPROVED ON THE CONDITION THAT ADDITIONAL BOXWOOD PLANTS WILL BE PLANTED IN BETWEEN THE EXISTING BOXWOOD PLANTS BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Rodgers, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

- b. Demolition and New Building – **6902 N. High St.** (Children’s Design Group – Mark D. Pavey, AIA) **AR 76-10**

At the last meeting, the ARB asked for modifications to the lighting and landscaping plans, and a minor change to the front elevation. The new plans were submitted to the Board members and discussed further at the meeting.

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar said that Children’s Design Group has added a six foot wood sided fence the length of the parking lot for privacy. They have also moved the dumpster to the south side of the parking lot, and have added additional plant material and arborvitae. Four light poles have been removed from the original plan and the poles will be sixteen feet high instead of twenty feet high. The light poles will have shields so there will not be any light spillover. The gable was clipped so it does not go down to the trim around the window. In addition, Mrs. Bitar said that fifteen feet of the brick wall will be removed. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Ted Tillman approached the microphone and stated that he lives at 3607 Canberra Way, Mt. Juliet, TN.

Mr. Myers mentioned that last week the Board discussed that Ohio School buildings are now being built with LEED certification. Mr. Myers said that since Primrose is a child care center, it is similar to a school, and he would like to see it have a few things such as LEED light switches, a rain barrel with a soaker hose to help water the landscape, and explain to the kids how they are helping the environment. Mr. Tillman said that they are already using some recycled materials to build the building, but he will see what additional green things can be done.

Mr. Sauer asked Mr. Tillman if it was necessary to have the Primrose logo on all of the structures. Mr. Tillman said yes, it is part of the distinction of the company. Mr. Sauer said that might make Primrose over the limit for the number of signs they are allowed to have on the property.

Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that would like to speak either for or against this application. Mrs. Jennifer Haney approached the microphone and stated that she lives at 72

Rockwell Way, Worthington, Ohio. Mrs. Haney asked Mr. Tillman if there was any asbestos that has to be removed, and if so how will they keep that from spilling into the neighborhood. Mr. Tillman said that an asbestos study will be done; it's a federal regulation and will be done before the demolition of the building. Mrs. Haney was also concerned about the amount of noise that will be created during the demolition. She explained she is due to have a child in March. Mr. Tillman said that they plan to begin demolition in March, but it will be very quick, and done during the middle of the day. Mrs. Haney asked if the playground will be fenced in, and Mr. Tillman confirmed that it would be.

The next speaker was Joyclyn Dong. Ms. Dong approached the microphone and stated that she lives at 59 Highland Ave., Worthington, Ohio. Ms. Dong said that she is an eighth grade student at Worthingway Middle School. Her house is located on the north side of where the new building will be. She disagrees with the demolition of the building. She said her family moved to their current location about five and a half years ago and it used to be very private. Ms. Dong said that she did not want to wake up looking at a parking lot, and asked Mr. Tillman if they could find an already existing building to create their day care center. Mr. Jeff Dong approached the microphone and stated that he also lives at 59 Highland Ave., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Dong was concerned about the traffic issues with cars exiting to the east from the CF Bank drive. Mrs. Bitar confirmed that there will be no changes to the traffic pattern – traffic must exit west only from that drive. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone else that wanted to speak, and no one else came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. The existing HER building is proposed to be demolished. A memo is included in the packet from the Building Department regarding the condition of the structure as is required by Code.
2. Construction of a new building and site to house a Primrose day care center is proposed. In addition to the building, the site will include various playground areas around the perimeter and parking areas.
3. The existing parking area will be reworked and a new area will be added along the north property line. A 5' high evergreen hedge and 6' solid wood fence are proposed along the new parking area, which is adjacent to residential. The new plan shows the correct size parking spaces and meets the Code requirement for parking lot landscaping.
4. The proposed building consists of an east/west gable making up the main part of the building, and a matching gable extends to the south in the middle of the main gable. The entry on the west side and dormers along the north, south, and west sides have higher pitched gables. The front gable has been modified so the roof line stops at the windows.
5. There is a proposed water table around the entire building that will be faced in stone. The remainder of the building is proposed to be brick. The roof will have dimensional shingles. A small standing seam metal awning is proposed above the front window. Tate

olive colored shutters are proposed on all sides of the building. Samples of all materials were presented at the last meeting.

6. Lighting is proposed for the parking area and around the building. One pole light is proposed on the north side of the new parking area. The pole will be 16' high and the fixture will be cutoff and have a shield to protect residential neighbors.
7. A 4' high solid vinyl fence is proposed to enclose the mechanicals, which will be located on the east side of the south building wing. A 6' high black ornamental fence will enclose the property, and 4' high fencing of the same style will separate various areas between the building and the 6' fence.
8. A mixture of evergreen and deciduous trees is proposed along the south and east property lines. Additional evergreen trees have been added to the previous plan to increase the amount of screening. Shrubs, grass, ornamental grass and perennials are proposed at the front of the site.
10. A white panel with bronze lettering and a beige and olive colored logo is proposed to be added to the existing freestanding sign. The existing sign currently has a white background and trim.
11. At the access drive to CF Bank, the existing brick wall will be removed 16' in both directions.

Conclusions:

1. The proposed design for Primrose is appropriate.
2. The residential scale building and landscape screening are acceptable designs for this location, which is in close proximity to residential properties.
3. The modifications to the lighting and landscaping plans are appropriate.

Mr. Coulter motioned:

THAT THE REQUEST BY CHILDREN'S DESIGN GROUP FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO DEMOLISH THE EXISTING BUILDING AND CONSTRUCT A NEW BUILDING AND SITE AT 6902 HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 76-10, DRAWINGS NO. AR 76-10, DATED NOVEMBER 2, 2010, INCLUDING THE CHANGES THAT WERE LISTED IN THE EMAIL AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Lloyd seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Rodgers, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

2. New

- a. Addition Details – **692 High St.** (WJI Enterprises Ltd./Worthington Jewelers) **AR 77-10**
(Amendment to AR 71-10)

Conceptual approval was given again for this project at the October 28th meeting. New drawings will not be submitted for this meeting. Instead, the applicant has requested the ARB members give details about what they would still like to see in the project. Mrs. Bitar mentioned that an Appeal had been filed by City Council member David Norstrom.

Discussion:

Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Joe Davis approached the microphone and stated that he lives at 127 E. Wilson Bridge Rd., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Davis asked the Board what were the most important things that needed to be addressed.

Mr. Hunter said that the details of the actual design are still needed. He said that the sample that was brought to the previous meeting was nice, but where does it go, where does it fit in. He would like to see the details as to how it will fit facing High Street, and seemed concerned about the elevation. Mrs. Lloyd agreed with Mr. Hunter and said that she too was concerned about the elevation, the roof line and the display cases. Mr. Hermann said that he believes that it would look better as a two story building. He likes the windows and the details on the storefront, but he too is concerned about the elevation and roof line. Mr. Sauer mentioned that he and Mr. Davis had talked earlier in the week and discussed a few ideas. Mr. Sauer said that he would like to see the top of the base to align. He said the bottom over hangs, the roof over hangs, and he doesn't like the way the building slams into the old building. Mr. Sauer has concerns about the display cases and said that they look like saddlebags. He would like to see more details on signage, window treatments, and how water will be collected off of the roof, downspouts, and details of the railings. Mrs. Holcombe said she echoed the desire to see more details of how it will fit in. She said she likes what she has seen, but just has some doubt how it will fit without seeing more details. Mr. Coulter said that all he wanted to say had already been said, he just wants to see more details. Mrs. Rodgers said ditto, she'd like to see more details as well. She said it didn't bother her that the building was slammed into the other one, and that it seemed similar to the way the buildings are so close together in downtown Worthington.

Mr. Myers said that he wanted to be clear as to the message he will make to Worthington City Council about the Craftsman style building. He said that it is not what one would think of as a glass atrium.

Mr. Davis said that the building will consist of forty percent (40%) glass along the walls, and three percent (3%) glass along the roof line.

Mr. Sauer doesn't see where the Craftsman label applies.

Mr. Myers felt that it is more of a political issue. He said that he would like to see Mr. Davis sell lots of jewelry and pay lots of taxes.

Mr. Hermann said that he is also concerned about the corner view.

Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that would like to speak either for or against this application. Mr. Chris Chakroff approached the microphone and stated his address of 7100 N. High St., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Chakroff said he liked doing business with Worthington Jewelers, and in fact bought his wife's wedding ring from Mr. Davis, but he doesn't think the current design reflects the old Worthington style.

Mr. David Norstrom was the next speaker. Mr. Norstrom stated that he lives at 210 Hardy Way, Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Norstrom said that he did not think that this is a political issue. Mr. Norstrom said that he has received a number of comments that they like Joe, but just not the concept of the building design. Mr. Norstrom said that he is going to file an Appeal regarding the Boards decision to approve the conceptual design.

There were no other speakers.

Findings of fact:

- 1. An addition is proposed for the north side of the Worthington Jewelers building. The new structure is designed as a conservatory that allows a view of the existing north side of the building, as well as into the new retail space which will include plant material. The addition will add much needed retail space, as well as a handicap access for the jewelry store. The existing Worthington Jewelers front façade will remain unchanged.*
- 2. Architectural lighting is proposed at the front columns and corners of the addition. Internally illuminated signs with a gold metal background and clear letters are proposed for the west and north faces. Also, the applicant would like to put a sign pole at the corner.*
- 3. The exterior space around has been designed with landscape and hardscape elements to complement the existing and new structures, and the business. A bridal garden is proposed between the addition and existing rear structure.*

Conclusions:

- 1. The proposed will be an attractive and interesting new element in Old Worthington, if the appropriate details become part of the design.*

2. *The proposed outdoor space will be an enhancement to Old Worthington.*

Mr. Sauer motioned to table this application. Mr. Hermann seconded the motion. All members voted aye, and Mr. Hunter said this application has been tabled.

b. Fence – **788 Evening St.** (Tyler North) **AR 78-10**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. The applicant has already added fencing along the south property line but did not have the appropriate approvals. The fence is natural color and matches the fencing that the neighbors have. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Tyler North approached the microphone and stated that he lives at 788 Evening St., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. North said that he would like to do more fencing in the future, but only fencing just a portion of the yard at this time. Mr. Sauer said that if Mr. North gets the approval now, he'll have eighteen months to complete the project.

Findings of fact:

1. The applicant added fencing along the south and east property lines, but did not have the appropriate approvals.
2. The style is a 4' high wood picket fence with 3 ¾" pickets. The spacing between pickets is not specified, but from the photos it appears to be close to the picket width. The supporting members are on the inside as required by Code.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed fence seems appropriate.

Mrs. Holcombe motioned:

THAT THE REQUEST BY TYLER NORTH FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO ADD A FENCE AT 788 EVENING ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 78-10, DRAWINGS NO. AR 78-10, DATED OCTOBER 11, 2010, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Sauer seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Rodgers, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

c. Replace Windows – **41 W. South St.** (William & Rosanne Yang) **AR 79-10**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. William Yang approached the microphone and stated that he lives at 41 W. South St., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Yang said that he wants to install energy efficient windows. The windows will have the same look, only the windows will be vinyl instead of wood.

Findings of fact:

1. The applicants are proposing replacement of 11 windows in the house.
2. Proposed are vinyl windows in the same basic style, but with what appears to be more detailed trim.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed change is appropriate.

Mrs. Rodgers motioned:

THAT THE REQUEST BY WILLIAM AND ROSANNE YANG FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO REPLACE WINDOWS AT 41 W. SOUTH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 79-10, DRAWINGS NO. AR 79-10, DATED OCTOBER 18, 2010, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Lloyd seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Rodgers, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

- d. Roof, Dormer, Porch & Garage – **587 Oxford St.** (Corinne Meyer) **AR 80-10**

Mr. Sauer motioned to table this application. Mr. Hermann seconded the motion. All members voted aye to tabling the application.

- e. Solar Tube, Window & Door – **661 Evening St.** (Joanne Dole & Allen Eiger) **AR 81-10**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar discussed the facts from the application. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Allen Eiger approached the microphone and stated that he lives at 661 Evening St., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Eiger said that he would like to replace the old windows on his house with new Pella windows. Mr. Sauer asked what type of windows were going to be used, double hung, casement, awning? Mr. Eiger said his original windows are single pane aluminum windows, and he plans to install some casement windows and some awning windows. Mr. Eiger said that he won't be replacing the sunroom's windows. Mr. Sauer discussed the solar tube with

Mr. Eiger and said that it doesn't have to be straight down, it can be on an angle. Mr. Eiger responded that he wants to catch the morning light and brighten the darker (east side) section of his house, so placement is necessary where shown. Mr. Hunter asked what the diameter of the tube is, and Mr. Eiger said that it is ten inches wide. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that was either for or against this application, and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. A solar tube is proposed for placement on the roof of this house, to allow natural light to enter the home. The visible piece on the roof is 10" in diameter, 4" high and black.
2. A new window is proposed on the south side of the house. The dimensions are 6' x 6', and it will be divided into 3 lights.
3. The addition of a service door on the south side of the garage is proposed.

Conclusion:

1. Placement of the solar tube will not harm the character of the neighborhood, and is an energy efficient addition to the home.
2. The addition of a window and door will add interest to the south elevation.
3. All windows in the house can be replaced with this approval.

Mrs. Lloyd motioned:

THAT THE REQUEST BY JOANNE DOLE AND ALLEN EIGER FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO ADD A SOLAR TUBE AND REPLACE WINDOWS AND A DOOR AT 661 EVENING ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 81-10, DRAWINGS NO. AR 81-10, DATED OCTOBER 29, 2010, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Coulter seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Rodgers, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

- f. Replace Windows & Door – **694 Hartford St.** (Daniel Srsic) **AR 82-10**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar discussed the facts from the application. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Daniel Srsic approached the microphone and stated that he lives at 694 Hartford St., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Srsic said that his front door has melting issues, and badly needs

replaced. He also wants to replace some of the windows on his house with more efficient vinyl windows. Mr. Sauer said that he didn't think that the door matched the style of the house. Other ARB members agreed with the style of the proposed door not matching the house. Mr. Srsic said that the door matches similar styles in the neighborhood and that he and his wife like the door.

Findings of fact:

1. The applicant is proposing replacement of 4 vinyl windows on the front of the house and 2 on the side. The new vinyl windows will be more energy efficient, but will have the same basic look.
2. Replacement of the metal front door with a fiberglass door in a different style is also proposed. The new door will look like mahogany with a glass design in the middle.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed window and door replacements are appropriate.

Mrs. Rodgers motioned:

THAT THE REQUEST BY DANIEL SRIC FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO REPLACE WINDOWS AND A DOOR AT 694 HARTFORD ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 82-10, DRAWINGS NO. AR 82-10, DATED OCTOBER 29, 2010, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Sauer seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, nay; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Rodgers, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

g. Front Porch, Roof, Gate & Pergola – **132 E. Granville Rd.** (Jeff DeVille) **AR 83-10**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar discussed the facts from the application. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Jeff DeVille approached the microphone and stated that he lives at 132 E. Dublin-Granville Rd., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. DeVille said that he'd like to put a gate across his walkway, replace the roof on his house, and install a porch with speakers. He said it would be nice to listen to soft music while he sits on his porch, and be able to play spooky music when the kids come trick-or-treating. Mr. DeVille said the roof will have wood framing with wood columns. He said he likes the columns that the Worthington Inn has. Mr. Sauer said that the rail on the porch roof is okay, but would suggest eliminating the second column. Mr. Coulter said he liked the second column, as did Mrs. Lloyd. Mr. Coulter felt that the second column would be needed for strength, and thought it set off the entry to the walkway. Mrs. Holcombe liked the simple design that was presented, and thought it looked appropriate for a farm house. Mrs.

Rodgers said simple is better; she felt the simple design looked best as well. Mr. Hermann asked Mr. DeVille what type of material was going to be used for the roof. Mr. DeVille said that he plans to use dimensional asphalt shingles, and that the original roof is 160 years old and badly needs replaced.

Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application, and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. The applicant is requesting approval for a number of changes: the addition of a front gate and front porch; replacement of the roof; and a pergola.
2. The gate is proposed to be 6' behind the side, across the walkway to the front door. It will be constructed of wood painted white and will have black hardware. The height is 3 ½' – 4'.
3. For the front porch, the applicant is proposing to fill in the open area at the southeast corner of the house with a porch that includes a roof with a railing. The area is 10' x 14'. The floor will be concrete either stained or stamped and wrapped in brick, and will include a brick step. The roof will be wood framing with wood columns, a tongue and groove ceiling and rubber on top. A railing with decorative spindles is proposed around the roof. Several styles choices for the spindles have been identified. This is a modification of a previous approval in 2005. Also included are adding a ceiling fan, can lights and speakers.
4. The roof will be replaced with dimensional shingles that are gray or green in color.
5. A wood pergola is proposed for the northeast corner of the property. The structure is proposed to be 8' high, with the top 2' lattice and the bottom tongue and groove cedar. The sections are each 9' wide.
6. Variances will be required for the gate, porch and pergola to be constructed in the required setbacks. This lot is unusually small, being 57' x 110'.

Conclusions:

1. Although a bit uncommon, the gate may enhance the look of the front yard.
2. The addition of a front porch will be an enhancement.
3. A new roof will be a nice improvement.
4. Typically, the ARB does not allow solid structures at the property line. With such a small

lot, some screening may be warranted.

Mr. Coulter motioned:

THAT THE REQUEST BY JEFF DEVILLE FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO MAKE CHANGES TO THE HOUSE AND PROPERTY AT 132 E. GRANVILLE RD. AS PER CASE NO. AR 83-10, DRAWINGS NO. AR 83-10, DATED OCTOBER 29, 2010, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Rodgers seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Rodgers, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

h. Addition & Renovation – **849 Oxford St.** (Terry Boling) **AR 84-10**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Terry Boling approached the microphone and stated that he is the architect that has been hired for this project, and he lives at 695 Reynard Ave., Cincinnati, Ohio 45231. Mr. Boling brought a three dimensional model of what the proposed addition to the house will look like. Mr. Boling said that an arborist will be coming to inspect the trees to see if the trees will be able to withstand the new addition to the house.

The foundation and retaining wall material Mr. Boling plans to use is weathered zinc. Mr. Sauer asked if it was similar to veneer. Mr. Boling said yes, it will be layered like stone, and bonded with mortar in between. Mr. Boling said the north side of the property will be level and then drops off to a natural slope. He said arborvitae will be planted for privacy screening. Mr. Hunter was concerned about the trees, including the neighbor's trees. He thought that adding a new drive might disturb the root system and kill the trees. Mr. Boling said that they plan to do everything possible to take care of the trees. Mr. Coulter asked how big the addition will be, and Mr. Boling said that it will be six hundred square feet. Mr. Hermann said that he liked the addition, but was also worried about the trees, and a little concerned about the doorway and the street view.

Mrs. Lloyd said that she was a little concerned about the dark color. Mr. Coulter said that he likes the color, and it's a better color than it currently is now. Mr. Sauer said he was concerned with how the addition could be built without disturbing the neighbor's vegetation, and would like to see a letter from an arborist before voting on this application.

Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that would like to speak either for or against this application. Mr. Michael McVey approached the microphone and stated that he lives at 101 W.

Clearview Ave., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. McVey said that he doesn't object to the addition, but he doesn't feel that it would fit in character with the rest of the neighborhood. He said he actually likes the green color of the house and wants the new driveway moved. Mr. McVey said he is also concerned about the trees. Mr. Coulter asked if the roof was similar, and if the windows were more normal, would your concerns go away?

The next speaker that approached the microphone was Alli Gentile McGary and stated that she is the owner of 849 Oxford St., Worthington, Ohio. Mrs. McGary said that she grew up in Ohio, and lived here until her husband moved her to Florida. She said she has missed Ohio ever since moving to Florida, and has been searching for houses in Ohio since the day she moved. Mrs. McGary feels that the architect has done a very good job of retaining the elements, it is very eclectic, just like the rest of the neighborhood, which includes other styles such as farm houses, tudors, and Cape Cod styles. Mrs. McGary said she is pregnant with their first child and wants to raise her family in Worthington. She said she has always liked the area. Mrs. McGary said that she and her husband are both very environmentally conscious. She said while they lived in Florida, they frequently picked trash up on the beach, and helped save nesting turtles. Mrs. McGary said that an arborist will be inspecting the property; they care about the trees too.

The next person to speak was a man named Ken who said that he lived on W. Stafford. Ken said that he did not think that the house fit in Worthington. Mr. Sauer said that he agrees that there are a variety of homes in Worthington, and it is an eclectic area. Mr. Sauer asked if it was possible to table the application because he would like assurance from an arborist before making a decision.

Mr. Brian McGary approached the microphone and stated that he is Mrs. McGary's husband and lives at 849 Oxford St., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. McGary said he was unfamiliar with the term tabling, so Mr. Hunter explained that the application could be put on hold until hearing from the arborist. Mr. Hunter suggested that the arborist come in person and give a testimony at the next meeting. Mrs. Holcombe said that she liked the additions, with maybe a few concerns about the windows and trees, but liked that they plan to use high quality materials. Mr. McGary said that he believes the architect worked very hard to comply with the one hundred and thirty two pages of necessary materials. Mr. Coulter suggested that if Mr. McGary gives a little, the Board will give a little with their decisions too.

Mr. Sauer motioned to table the application and Mr. Coulter seconded the motion. All members voted aye to tabling the application.

j. Renovation of Existing Mall – **88 Worthington Square** (M & A Architects) **AR 85-10**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar discussed the facts from the application, and introduced the applicants, Architects Lori Bongiorno and Tom Carter. A week prior to this meeting, both Ms. Bongiorno and Mr. Carter took the Architectural Review Board and Members of City Council on a walking tour of Easton Town Center to discuss architectural concepts that may be incorporated into their proposed plans

for Worthington Square. Ms. Bongiorno said that plans for the renovation include removing part of the roof and adding more landscaping for an outdoor pedestrian experience, and retail streetscapes. Sign changes were discussed, and they will be of high quality and a variety of styles. It is not yet known who the tenants will be. There will be a variety of storefronts; some will have hard canopies or awnings. There are plans for flexible space to hold small community events for music and plays, outdoor furniture, and possibly an outdoor fireplace. Also discussed were site criteria for lighting and signage. Mr. Carter said that it would be nice to have pylon signs to let people know what stores are there. Mrs. Bitar said that the development plan for the whole site will include variances for all signage and parking.

Mr. Coulter asked Mr. Carter if he has talked with the Kroger store about the walk up window. Mrs. Bitar said that she will discuss this in more detail with Mr. Carter. Mr. Carter said they will be freshening up the entrances, and there are plans for at least one of the buildings to be demolished. Mr. Carter said he plans to close on the property in December of this year, work on the project during the winter, and then begin construction in the spring. Mr. Hunter said he is happy to see that things are moving forward, and thanked both Ms. Bongiorno and Mr. Carter for their time on the tour.

Findings of fact:

1. This request is for conceptual approval to renovate and rejuvenate Worthington Square in a manner different than was previously approved at this site.
2. The applicant is showing removal of the roof that runs east/west over the northern part of the mall to create an outdoor pedestrian street and public park space. Also, conversion of the service areas on the east side to create additional tenant spaces and continuation of the road between Kroger and the mall are proposed. An overall site plan and close ups of different areas are included in your packet.
4. Preliminary Design Standards are also included. The applicant is suggesting adoption of standards as a basis for approval of tenant spaces. The standards would include such elements as: signage, awnings, building materials and design, lighting and landscaping. The concept would allow the individual tenants to have differently designed storefronts that must meet the basic standards. The example given for this type of design is Easton.
5. Conceptual approval would mean agreeing with the concept of using different design styles for each storefront; the re-design of public areas, with an emphasis on outdoor seating, landscaping and decorations; and with the proposed changes shown on the site plan.

Conclusions:

1. The presented concepts are appropriate.
2. The plan will hopefully be just the first step to revitalize the whole property, not just the

current mall building area.

Mrs. Rodgers motioned to table the application and Mr. Coulter seconded the motion. All members voted aye to tabling the application.

Mrs. Bitar said that she has a meeting with the owner of G. Worthy's on December 9, 2010 to discuss signage, and that an Urgent Care business has moved into 33 E. North St.

Mr. Coulter motioned to adjourn the meeting and Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. All members voted aye to adjourning the meeting. The meeting adjourned at 11:00 p.m.