



MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING
WORTHINGTON ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
WORTHINGTON MUNICIPAL PLANNING COMMISSION
July 28, 2016

The regular meeting of the Worthington Architectural Review Board and the Worthington Municipal Planning Commission was called to order at 7:00 p.m. with the following members present: Michael Coulter, Chair; James Sauer, Vice-Chair; Kathy Holcombe, Secretary; Amy Lloyd; and David Foust. Also present were: Scott Myers, Worthington City Council Representative to the Municipal Planning Commission; Lee Brown, Director of Planning & Building; Lynda Bitar, Planning Coordinator and Clerk of the Municipal Planning Commission; and Melissa Cohan, Paralegal. Board members Thomas Reis and Edwin Hofmann were absent.

A. Call to Order – 7:00 p.m.

1. Roll Call
2. Pledge of Allegiance
3. Approval of minutes of the July 14, 2016 meeting.

Mr. Sauer moved to approve the minutes and Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. All Board members voted, "Aye." The minutes were approved.

4. Affirmation/swearing in of witnesses – Members of the audience were sworn in by Mrs. Bitar.

Mr. Coulter asked Mr. Foust to explain the historical photograph and Mr. Foust said the building in the photograph is where Snap Fitness is located today and where Worthington Hardware was located. The picture dates back to 1948 or 1949, and shows the building next door which was the original Kroger food store built around 1915. In 1939, there was an addition built on to the hardware store. Where the Bag of Nails is located now, there used to be an alley way that went back to the Snouffer Brothers car repair facility and there were gas pumps located on High Street. Similar today, there is concrete out by the street and the dark section of sidewalk were intricate pavers, a few of which still remain around the Worthington Inn, which were used for decorative purposes. Mr. Foust also discussed the original architecture of the building where the furniture store is now located.

B. Architectural Review Board

- a. Directional Sign – **933 High St.** (Sign Vision Co., Inc./Fresh Thyme) **AR 94-16**

Findings of fact & Conclusions

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the following from the staff memo:

Background & Request:

InSite Real Estate, LLC received approval from the ARB in July of 2014 to construct a new building on the site to house Fresh Thyme Farmer's Market. The property, formerly zoned C-3 and containing 2 office buildings, was rezoned as a PUD to accommodate the project. In September of 2015, Fresh Thyme opened its doors to the public.

This is a request to add a directional sign near the High St. drive entrance.

Project Details:

1. The proposed double-sided 2' wide x 1'4" high sign would be installed on the north side of the drive, perpendicular to High St. Total height would be 3'.
2. The sign faces would be constructed of aluminum, with applied vinyl graphics. Yellow is the proposed background color, with green and brown lettering, and a brown tractor and arrow. The 3" square support posts would be brown.

Land Use Plans:

Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance

While the regulations permit a certain maximum square footage of signs for a business, try to minimize the size and number of signs. Place only basic names and graphics on signs along the street so that drive-by traffic is not bombarded with too much information. Signs must be distinctive enough to be readily visible, but bright color shades generally are discouraged in favor more subtle and toned-down shades. The appropriateness of signage to the building is a standard for review in the Architectural District ordinance.

Worthington Planning and Zoning Code

"Directional sign" means a sign used to direct on-site traffic and identify services such as restrooms, hours of operation, etc., and of which no more than fifty-percent of the graphic area is non-directional information. The display area for such signs shall not exceed twenty-four inches in height or width, and the above grade height for freestanding directional signs shall not exceed thirty-six inches. The total area for all such signage shall be no more than 20 square feet per parcel. Directional signs are excluded in the computation of sign area.

Recommendation:

Staff is recommending *approval* of this application, as the proposed sign is complimentary to the building and other signage, and meets the Code requirements for directional signs.

Discussion:

Mr. Coulter asked if the applicant was present. Ms. Linda Patrick, representing her brother's business, stated she is a school bus driver and has driven past the entrance a couple of times, not sure of the location. She believes the directional sign will help people find the parking lot. Board

members did not have any questions or concerns. Mr. Coulter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Motion:

Mr. Sauer moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY SIGNVISION CO., INC. FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO INSTALL A DIRECTIONAL SIGN AT 933 HIGH ST., AS PER CASE NO. AR 94-16, DRAWINGS NO. AR 94-16, DATED JULY 6, 2016, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Foust seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Coulter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mr. Foust, aye. The motion was approved.

- b. Removal of Railings – **614 Oxford St.** (Kristen & AJ Senff) **AR 95-16** (Amendment to AR 61-16)

Findings of Fact & Conclusions

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the following from the staff memo:

Background & Request:

This farmhouse was constructed in the late 1800's, and there have been modifications and additions over the years. The house is a contributing building in the Worthington Historic District. The front porch was added to connect the 2 side porches in 1998, with the design matching the side porches. In April, the owners received approval to change the style of the railings. This request would allow for elimination of the railings.

Project Details:

1. The front porch continues around the sides of the house, and matching balustrades were around the porch and on the sides of the porch roof. The previous balusters were round with a patterned finished, and painted multiple colors with narrow rails. Approved in April were thicker rails with square balusters and simple square columns. When the railings were removed, the homeowners decided they liked the look better, and so are asking for approval to leave them off. The railings would not be required by the Building Code because the porch is close enough to the adjacent grade.
2. Other parts of the project, such as painting and the addition of lights by the garage, are still proposed.

Land Use Plans:

Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance

From about 1915 on, porches generally were simplified and more integrated into the design of the house. Simple square or tapered columns were common. New porches (located where one is

missing or there has not been a porch in the past) should be built in a simple design. Avoid ornamentation such as spindles and scrollwork unless they were traditionally used on the porches of similar buildings.

Recommendations:

Staff is recommending *approval* of this application, as the absence of railings would be an appropriate treatment for a farmhouse of this era.

Discussion:

Mr. Coulter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. AJ Senff stated his address is 614 Oxford St., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Senff said when they took the railings down they realized they liked the open look of the porch, and knows the Building Code does not require the railing. Mr. Coulter said he recently drove past the property and he liked the openness of the front porch too because the house looked more like a farmhouse. Mr. Sauer, Mrs. Holcombe and Mr. Foust agreed and thought that the house looked much better. Mr. Coulter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Motion:

Mr. Foust moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY KRISTEN & AJ SENFF TO AMEND CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS #AR 61-16 BY ELIMINATING THE PORCH RAILS AT 614 OXFORD ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 95-16, DRAWINGS NO. AR 95-16, DATED JULY 7, 2016, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Coulter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mr. Foust, aye. The motion was approved.

c. New Doors – **571 Evening St.** (Spencer & Katie Budros) **AR 97-16**

Findings of Fact & Conclusions

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the following from the staff memo:

Background & Request:

This house was constructed in 1954, and is a contributing property in the Worthington Historic District. The ARB approved total renovation, including an addition, for this house last year. With construction complete, the new owners would like to replace the doors.

Project Details:

1. The existing exterior wood doors are reportedly difficult to open. The front door has 3 square panels arranged vertically, with the top square being glass, and there is a storm door with the top two-thirds glass. The side and rear doors have 2 vertical panels at the bottom

with three horizontal window panes above. All three existing doors are white on the exterior.

2. Pella fiberglass doors are proposed to replace the existing doors, and would be sized to fit in the existing openings. The front door would be an Iron Ore colored 6-panel door with no lights, and a full view screen door is proposed. On the south side, a white 6-panel door with lights at the top is proposed. To the rear, the proposed door would be white with the bottom two panels solid, and glass for the top half.

Land Use Plans:

Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance

It is important that any doors and the entrances in which they are set should be compatible with the style and period of a building. Compatibility of design and materials and exterior detail and relationships are standards of review in the Architectural District ordinance.

Staff Analysis:

While the proposed 6-panel door style is commonly used for newer construction and replacement doors, the character is different than would typically have been used in a 1950's era home.

Discussion:

Mr. Coulter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Spencer Budros and Mrs. Katie Budros stated they are the new owners of 571 Evening St., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Budros said the doors need to be replaced for safety and weather reasons. He said all of the windows, including the front window have been replaced by the Pella Company and that is why they wanted to keep the window brand consistent with the doors. They would also like to have a solid glass storm door in the front. Mr. Budros said they are trying to be as conservative as possible.

Mr. Coulter welcomed the Budros' to the neighborhood. Mr. Sauer said he did not have any concerns. Mr. Foust said that he believed there are many different styles that would work well with this type of house and he did not have any concerns either. Mrs. Lloyd asked what color the door would be. Mr. Budros explained the door will be iron ore, and showed a sample to the Board members. The color of the door will be dark to blend with the roof, and the storm door will be white to match the windows. Mr. Coulter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Motion:

Mr. Sauer moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY SPENCER AND KATIE BUDROS FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO REPLACE THE DOORS AT 571 EVENING ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 97-16, DRAWINGS NO. AR 97-16, DATED JANUARY 29, 2016, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Coulter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye;

Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mr. Foust, aye. The motion was approved.

d. Siding, Gutters, Downspouts – **125 W. New England Ave.** (Scott Hamilton) **AR 98-16**

Findings of Fact & Conclusions

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the following from the staff memo:

Background & Request:

This English Cottage Revival style house was constructed in 1928, and is a contributing building in the Worthington Historic District. The 2 ½ car detached garage was constructed in 2007. Both structures have aluminum 4” lap siding, but the white garage was never painted to match the tan color of the house. The house has wood siding beneath the aluminum; the condition is not known. This is a request to replace the siding on the house and garage.

Project Details:

1. The plan involves removal of all siding on both structures.
2. New siding would be Hardie 7” lap siding and trim. The color would be brown, with trim, new gutters and downspouts being white.

Land Use Plans:

Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance

If replacement siding is installed over or in place of wood siding, it should be located only where the original siding was used. Avoid removal of or damage to window and door surrounds, ornamental elements such as eave brackets, and decorative panels or shingled areas. The new siding should match the thickness and width of the old as closely as possible. Consider removal of existing replacement siding, including cement-asbestos, but only if the underlying original siding is in good condition or can be repaired. The Guidelines call for outbuildings to be compatible in appearance to the house they accompany. The ARB reviews the compatibility of design and materials.

Recommendation:

Staff is recommending *approval* of this application. Without knowing the width and condition of the original siding, it seems the proposed siding width and material are appropriate for this style of house.

Discussion:

Mr. Coulter asked if the applicant was present. Ms. Brittany Zerhusen stated her address is 5300 Riverside Dr., Apt. 209, Upper Arlington, Ohio 43220. She said she is representing Scott Hamilton and she brought a sample of the siding with her to the meeting. Mr. Coulter asked Mrs. Bitar if she knew the size of the width of the original wood siding and Mrs. Bitar said she did not know. Ms. Zerhusen said the trim around the doors, windows and downspouts will be white.

Mr. Foust said a lot of the homes built during that era had very narrow siding. He said before ordering the siding, please take the aluminum siding off to see what size siding is underneath and then decide what makes architectural sense. Mr. Foust said 7" is not bad, but is about double the size of what is on the house now. Mrs. Lloyd said the size of the siding will make this house look very different. Mr. Coulter said he has always thought the siding was too narrow on this house. Mr. Sauer said he was fine either way. Mr. Foust felt this was an opportunity to make it look as originally intended. Mr. Coulter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Motion:

Mrs. Lloyd moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY SCOTT HAMILTON FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO INSTALL NEW SIDING ON THE HOUSE AND GARAGE AT 125 W. NEW ENGLAND AVE. AS PER CASE NO. AR 98-16, DRAWINGS NO. AR 98-16, DATED JULY 14, 2016, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Sauer seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Coulter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mr. Foust, aye. The motion was approved.

e. Sign – 7170 N. High St. (Signcom Inc./SportClips) AR 96-16

Findings of Fact & Conclusions

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the following from the staff memo:

Background & Request:

This commercial building was constructed in 2002, with COSI being the only original tenant still in this location. At the time of development, the building owner agreed to a unified theme for signage which included similar sizes, coordinated colors, and internally illuminated channel letters. Text styles were allowed to be different. As tenants have changed over the years, the basic premise of the sign package has been followed, except a larger variety of colors has been allowed. The awnings are burgundy; and the signs are burgundy, blue, green, white and black.

This application is a request for a new sign for SportClips, which is moving into the space formerly occupied by T Mobile.

Project Details:

1. The proposed sign would be about 9' 8" wide x 2' 4" high (~23 square feet in area), consisting of individually mounted, internally illuminated channel letters spelling "SportClips". There is also a 5' 5.15" wide x 8.88" high box below with "HAIRCUTS".
2. "Sport" is proposed as red; "Clips" is proposed as black that will illuminate white; and the "HAIRCUTS" box would have a white background with black lettering. A sample of

the red is needed.

Mrs. Bitar showed pictures of the center from its opening until now, illustrating the different tenants. She pointed out the window signs that exceed the allowable in the Code.

Land Use Plans:

Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance

The Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance recommend signs be efficient and compatible with the age and architecture of the building.

Recommendation:

Staff is recommending *approval* of this application, if the shade of red is complementary to the rest of the building and other signage.

Discussion:

Mr. Coulter asked Mrs. Bitar if the sign is within Worthington's code limitation and Mrs. Bitar yes, but they do not allow illuminated backgrounds so a determination will have to be made. Box signs with illumination are not allowed.

Mr. Coulter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Bruce Sommerfelt stated his address is 527 W. Rich St., Columbus, Ohio. Mr. Sommerfelt said his company had nothing to do with the signs in the windows but he will try to get a message to the owner of the business. Mr. Sommerfelt said the red used in the SportClips sign is the same red that is used for the Jimmy John sign. He said this sign is part of SportClips logo. The background of the sign does illuminate white, but is secondary in nature to the SportClips letters. He said there are a thousand of these stores across the country and these letters are part of the national branding.

Mr. Coulter explained that most of their concerns are what Mrs. Bitar already discussed about the haircut sign. He asked Mr. Sommerfelt if the entire sign would be internally illuminated. Mr. Sommerfelt said the red is fabricated, and very similar to the Jimmy Johns sign, which is illuminated in the background. The Board took a look at the other signage in the strip center to compare with what the new sign will look like. Mrs. Bitar said Mr. Sommerfelt was correct, the new sign will be similar to the COSI sign. Mr. Coulter asked if COSI had gotten a variance and Mrs. Bitar said no, the sign was only approved by the Architectural Review Board. Mr. Foust felt the sign was appropriate because the look is consistent with the other signs in the strip mall. Mrs. Holcombe said she agreed with Mr. Foust. Mr. Coulter asked if the business will be open in the evening and Mr. Sommerfelt said yes, but he was not sure what their hours of operation will be. Mr. Coulter said Mr. Sommerfelt needs to take back the message to the tenants that they need to remove the signs from inside the store front windows. Mrs. Bitar explained the City is already pursuing the window signage as a violation. She said the City is waiting for a response from the business.

Mr. Sauer said when he looked at the strip mall signage when the center was originally created, he saw something disturbing. He said the vertical placement of the letters on the sign bands vary

somewhat. The center lines match up for three of the signs, and that looked okay, but the Jimmy Johns sign is too high. Mr. Sauer said he realized the Board is not going to make Jimmy Johns re-do their sign, but he thought the look was disturbing. Mr. Sauer wanted to make sure that the new sign aligns properly with the other signs in the strip mall. Mr. Sommerfelt said they are also planning to add a security light that will be almost hidden behind the sign. Board members had no other questions. Mr. Coulter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Motion:

Mr. Sauer moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY SIGNCOM INC. FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO INSTALL A SIGN AT 7170 N. HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 96-16, DRAWINGS NO. AR 96-16, DATED JULY 8, 2016, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING WITH THE ADDITIONAL PROVISION THAT THE HORIZONTAL CENTER LINE, FROM THE VERY TOP TO THE BOTTOM, WILL ALIGN WITH THE CENTER LINE OF THE COSI SIGN AS CLOSE AS POSSIBLE.

Mr. Foust seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Coulter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mr. Foust, aye. The motion was approved.

- f. Sign – **2245 W. Dublin-Granville Rd., Suite 103** (Signcom Inc./Linworths Pharmacy)
AR 100-16

Findings of fact & Conclusions

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the following from the staff memo:

Background & Request

In 2014 & 2015, the property owner of this land at the southwest corner of W. Dublin-Granville Rd. and Linworth Rd. annexed, rezoned, subdivided, created a Development Plan, and received Architectural Review Board approval to redevelop the property as a neighborhood commercial site. Construction of Linworth Crossing is well underway, and as the project moves forward approval of amendments and additional ARB items is needed.

Sign Criteria were developed as outlined in the details below. Inclusion of a logo as part of a tenant wall sign requires approval from the ARB.

Project Details:

1. Approved Sign Criteria per the Development Plan:
 - Tenants in a 20' wide space are allowed 28 square feet of sign area. The formula for sign area is 70% of the usable sign band. Maximum character height is 24"
 - Black gooseneck LED lights will be above all signs.

- All signs will consist of 1 ½” thick non-illuminated dimensional letters and logos, centered in the sign band area. The font style can vary.
 - The proposed color palette for the signs is red, blue, green and black. The storefront material was approved as green, as were the awnings on the buildings.
 - Proposed logos must be approved by the ARB.
2. Proposed Tenant Sign:
- Linworths Pharmacy is locating in Suite 103, adjacent to Worthington Urgent Care which will occupy 2 suites in the northeast corner of Building A. The Worthington Urgent Care sign was approved as red and blue. Lettering identifying “PHARMACY DRIVE-UP” was approved for the rear of the building.
 - The proposed sign for the front of the building would have 24” high, individually mounted HDU 1 ½” thick letters in green spelling “Linworths Pharmacy” with a black and green mortar and pestle logo between the words.

Land Use Plans:

Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance

While the regulations permit a certain maximum square footage of signs for a business, try to minimize the size and number of signs. Colors for signs should be chosen for compatibility with the age, architecture and colors of the buildings they serve. Bright color shades generally are discouraged in favor of more subtle and toned-down shades.

Recommendations:

Staff is recommending *approval* of this application, as the sign meets the criteria developed for this development.

Discussion:

Mr. Myers asked Mrs. Bitar if that was the correct spelling of the name for the new pharmacy because the application stated the applicant was “Linworth Pharmacy” and not “Linworths” Pharmacy with an “s”. Mr. Sommerfelt explained that is the way his client wanted the sign to be spelled. Mr. Coulter said he agreed with Mr. Myers and said he did not understand why the sign would not have an “s” at the end. Mr. Coulter said he has lived in the area for many years and has never heard anyone call the Linworth area “Linworths”. Mr. Sommerfelt said he has asked his client many times if they intended to spell the sign that way. Mr. Sommerfelt said he was responsible for the misspelling on the original application and should have spelled Linworth as Linworths. Mr. Foust said from a marketing standpoint people might have a difficult time trying to find the information for the store online if Linworth is spelled with an “s.”

Mr. Sommerfelt said he is not sure why his client wants to spell the name without an apostrophe. Mrs. Bitar and Mrs. Lloyd looked the business up on the Ohio Secretary of State’s website, and said the actual registered trade name is “Linworths.” Mr. Coulter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Motion application:

Mr. Foust moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY SIGNCOM INC. FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO ADD A WALL SIGN AT 2245 W. DUBLIN-GRANVILLE RD. , AS PER CASE NO. AR 100-16, DRAWINGS NO. AR 100-16, DATED JULY 15, 2016 BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Coulter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mr. Foust, aye. The motion was approved.

Mr. Sauer asked if they wanted to add an apostrophe would the sign need to come back for approval and Mrs. Bitar said no.

g. Sign – **652 High St.** (Amy Nguyen/A Taste of Vietnam) **AR 102-16**

Findings of Fact & Conclusions

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the following from the staff memo:

Background & Request:

A Taste of Vietnam is proposed for this space which was formerly occupied by Rivage Atlantique. The other businesses in the building are RIDEhome, ELLI Nail Spa, The Candle Lab, House Wine and Graeter's. In 2008 the building was renovated, creating the storefront façade that exists today.

A sign for the front of the building was approved at the last ARB meeting for the new restaurant. On this agenda are applications for a projection sign at the rear entrance, and a Conditional Use Permit application for the restaurant.

Project Details:

1. The proposed projection sign would be 24" x 14" and installed on the existing bracket above the rear door. Sign material is proposed as 1" thick PVC. The sign would have a green background with light lettering saying "the Back Room", and have bamboo near the edges.
2. The restaurant is expected to be open as early as 9:00 am and as late as 11:00 pm. The bar would be open at 4:00 pm (expect earlier on Saturdays), and close as late as 2:30 am on Fridays and Saturday.
3. Parking would be as it is for the other businesses in this location. Patrons would typically look for a place in the lot in front of the building, and if full, would look in the municipal lots or on the streets.

Land Use Plans:

Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance

The Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance recommend signs be efficient and compatible with the age and architecture of the building.

Recommendation:

Staff is recommending approval of these applications. The sign is appropriate to identify the rear entrance. A restaurant has operated in this location for many years, and is compatible with the other uses. Other than painting and signage, the building exterior, including parking, would not change.

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar added a proposed change to the front wall sign was added to the application. Pictures were shown. She felt the sign was similar to the previously approved sign. Also, the front trim would be painted green.

Mr. Coulter asked if the applicant was present. Ms. Amy Nguyen stated her address is 1968 Waterbrook Lane, Columbus, Ohio. She said she would like to clarify that the door in the photograph is not black, the door is actually a dark green. Mr. Coulter asked if the front trim will be more consistent with the word “Vietnam,” and Ms. Nguyen said yes. She said the neighboring store also has a dark front door, and their door is black. Mr. Coulter said he liked the sign in the back that Ms. Nguyen plans to use. He asked her if she planned to use the same bracket for the sign and she said yes.

Mr. Sauer asked Ms. Nguyen what the business hours will be and Ms. Nguyen stated she planned to keep the restaurant open until 11:00 p.m., and the bar in the back would remain open until 2:30 a.m. Mr. Sauer asked if patrons will be able to walk back and forth between the restaurant and the bar area after the restaurant closes and Ms. Nguyen said no, she plans to close the restaurant at 11:00 p.m. She is planning to install some type of screening so that the patrons will still have access to the restrooms after the restaurant closes. Mr. Coulter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

ARB Motion:

Mrs. Holcombe moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY AMY NGUYEN FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO INSTALL A SIGN AT 652 HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 102-16, DRAWINGS NO. AR 102-16, DATED JULY 15, 2016, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING AND THAT THE TRIM ON THE FRONT OF THE BUILDING WILL MATCH THE COLOR OF THE WORD VIETNAM ON THE SIGN.

Mr. Foust seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Coulter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mr. Foust, aye. The motion was approved.

C. Municipal Planning Commission

Page 12 of 20

ARB/MPC Meeting July 28, 2016

Minutes

1. Conditional Use

- a. Restaurant in C-5 - **652 High St.** (Amy Nguyen/A Taste of Vietnam) **CU 12-16**

Findings of Fact & Conclusions

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the following from the staff memo:

Background & Request:

A Taste of Vietnam is proposed for this space which was formerly occupied by Rivage Atlantique. The other businesses in the building are RIDEhome, ELLI Nail Spa, The Candle Lab, House Wine and Graeter's. In 2008 the building was renovated, creating the storefront façade that exists today.

A sign for the front of the building was approved at the last ARB meeting for the new restaurant. On this agenda are applications for a projection sign at the rear entrance, and a Conditional Use Permit application for the restaurant.

Project Details:

1. The proposed projection sign would be 24" x 14" and installed on the existing bracket above the rear door. Sign material is proposed as 1" thick PVC. The sign would have a green background with light lettering saying "the Back Room", and have bamboo near the edges.
2. The restaurant is expected to be open as early as 9:00 am and as late as 11:00 pm. The bar would be open at 4:00 pm (expect earlier on Saturdays), and close as late as ~~2:30~~ 1:00 am on Fridays and Saturday.
3. Parking would be as it is for the other businesses in this location. Patrons would typically look for a place in the lot in front of the building, and if full, would look in the municipal lots or on the streets.

Land Use Plans:

Worthington Conditional Use Permit Regulations

The following basic standards apply to conditional uses in any "C" or "I" District: the location, size, nature and intensity of the use, operations involved in or conducted in connection with it, its site layout and its relation to streets giving access to it, shall be such that both pedestrian and vehicular traffic to and from it will not be hazardous, both at the time and as the same may be expected to increase with increasing development of the Municipality. The provisions for parking, screening, setback, lighting, loading and service areas and sign location and area shall also be specified by the applicant and considered by the Commission.

Discussion:

Mr. Sauer had additional questions. He asked Mrs. Bitar for clarification on the hours of the business in the back. Mrs. Bitar stated the bar would be open until 2:30 a.m. Ms. Nguyen stated her Ohio Liquor License Permit allows her business to be open until 2:30 a.m. Mr. Sauer asked

Mrs. Bitar what the hours of the former restaurant were and Ms. Nguyen stated the former restaurant owner kept the bar in the back open until 12:30 a.m. The restaurant was open from 4:00 p.m. until 11:00 p.m.

Mr. Sauer asked the other Board members if they had any concerns about this business being open until 2:30 a.m. Mr. Foust said he would not be voting, but as a neighbor of the businesses near downtown Worthington, he said there are a number of issues, such as noisy bar patrons that leave, and then employees leave and the nearby residents only get a couple hours of sleep because garbage and delivery trucks start arriving at 7:00 a.m. Mr. Foust said he would have a problem with a business being open after midnight. He said he believes the neighbors on the other side of High Street have experienced some similar issues.

Ms. Nguyen said the former restaurant may have been noisier than her restaurant will be because the former restaurant had live bands that would play in the evening, but she will not be playing live music. She said she understands the need to be polite to the neighbors, and she will be installing a security camera also to try to control any problems. Mrs. Holcombe asked if there were any other businesses nearby that were open that late and Mrs. Bitar said no.

Mr. Myers said he is not a business owner but from his perspective he feels that Ms. Nguyen will have a hard time trying to attract customers passed midnight. He explained that Worthington is not a typical bar area. Ms. Nguyen felt her new restaurant would help fill an untapped market for international foods. She said when she was in college she had to drive a long way to find a place to eat food that she was normally accustomed to. She said there is a large Asian population in the Columbus area but not many Vietnamese restaurants. Ms. Nguyen said the Asian restaurants in Chicago are open until 5:00 a.m. She is hoping to cater to an underserved market. She said if she has a hard time attracting clients at the later hours, she would close the bar early like the former restaurant owner did. She felt it was easier to reduce hours than extend.

Mr. Coulter said if there were noisy patrons then the situation could be problematic, so he asked Ms. Nguyen if it would be okay to stay open until 1:00 a.m., and then if no problems have occurred and she has the customers to support the business then she could come back and ask the Board for permission to extend her hours at a later time.

Mr. Sauer said he envisioned patrons coming and going from the back entrance at late hours and said he was uncomfortable supporting the approval to stay open until 1:00 a.m. He said he would feel more comfortable with the business closing at midnight. If there were no problems, then Ms. Nguyen could come back at a later time to ask for permission to extend the hours of operation if there were no complaints from the neighbors.

Ms. Nguyen thought there was a sign that said there was only a three hour parking limit in the parking lot. Mr. Foust said as long as a business is open later, there will be cars, people will be slamming their doors, and locking their cars with car horns and will wake people up from their sleep.

Mrs. Holcombe said since this is more of a food oriented place, maybe the motion could be adjusted to allow patrons to just come through the front entrance after a certain period of time. Ms. Nguyen said she could make up a sign that says emergency exit only after a certain period of time and place that on the back door. Mrs. Holcombe asked if there was a problem would the MPC have authority to change the conditions. Mrs. Bitar explained if there is a problem with noise, people will call the police. Mr. Myers explained if complaints are made about the noise level that could put Ms. Nguyen's Liquor License renewal in jeopardy. Mr. Sauer said he is not comfortable with something being open past midnight.

Mr. Coulter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Mrs. Bitar said there are only three members present, the Municipal Planning Commission recesses for the month of August, and this business would like to open next week. She suggested a compromise would be better than denial based on one member who does not want to approve the application. Ms. Nguyen said she just graduated from college in May, and she took over the restaurant in June. The landlord is charging her rent and the rent is very expensive. If she does not open next week, then her investor will not allow her to open until October. Mr. Foust said if a time would be agreed to for now, and there were no problems, the applicant could back to asked for longer hours in the future if needed. Mr. Sauer said he would rather start with earlier hours. Mrs. Holcombe asked Ms. Nguyen if she was okay with closing the business at 1:00 a.m. and Ms. Nguyen said yes. Mrs. Holcombe continued to say that if things are going well for the business then Ms. Nguyen can come back to the Board to ask for permission to extend the hours of operation.

MPC Motion:

Mr. Sauer moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY AMY NGUYEN FOR A CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT TO OPERATE A RESTAURANT AT 652 HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. CU 12-16, DRAWINGS NO. CU 12-16, DATED JULY 15, 2016, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING WITH THE PROVISION THAT THE BACK BAR AREA WILL CLOSE NO LATER THAN 1:00 A.M.

Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Coulter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye. The motion was approved.

B. Architectural Review Board (continued)

1. New (continued)

- h. Sign – **661 High St.** (Matt Davis/Bubbles Tea & Juice Co.) **AR 99-16** (Amendment to AR 96-15)

&

C. Municipal Planning Commission (continued)

1. Conditional Use (continued)

b. Restaurant in C-5 – **661 High St.** (Matt Davis/Bubbles Tea & Juice Co.) **CU 14-16**

Findings of Fact & Conclusions

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the following from the staff memo:

Background & Request:

This building was originally constructed in 1875 and remodeled in the late 1900's. Over the last couple of years, the Worthington Hardware space has redeveloped and now houses Grid Furnishings, Igloo Letterpress, Vernacular and Snap Fitness, and will house COhatch on the second floor at the south end of the building. Snap Fitness would like to include Bubbles Tea and Juice Co. on the first floor of its space, and is requesting ARB approval for a projection sign and a Conditional Use Permit.

Project Details:

1. Instead of the rectangular projection sign previously approved for Snap Fitness, a circular wood sign as was approved for COhatch is proposed. The sign would have a black background with a logo and “bubbles” in green shades, and “the tea & juice company” in white.
2. Bubbles Tea and Juice Company makes smoothies, juices and teas, and currently has locations at the North Market, Easton and Polaris. The store would provide its product to the customers of Snap Fitness, COhatch, possibly other local restaurants and the general public.
3. There is no seating proposed with the use, so the product would primarily be consumed off the premises. Less than 25% of the Snap Fitness floor area would be used by the business, which would consist of a counter for customer sales and preparation space.
4. One to two employees would typically work at the business.
5. The proposed hours of operation would generally be between 7:00 am – 10:00 pm.

Basic Standards and Review Elements: The following general elements are to be considered when hearing applications for Conditional Use Permits:

1. Effect on traffic pattern – Additional foot traffic could be expected.
2. Effect on public facilities – No effect has been identified.
3. Effect on sewerage and drainage facilities – The effect would be minimal.
4. Utilities required – No new utilities would be required.
5. Safety and health considerations – None have been identified.

6. Noise, odors and other noxious elements, including hazardous substances and other environmental hazards – None have been identified.
7. Hours of use – Generally 7:00 am – 10:00 pm.
8. Shielding or screening considerations for neighbors – Not applicable.
9. Appearance and compatibility with the general neighborhood – The business would be unique in Old Worthington and should be compatible.

Land Use Plans:

Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance

The Worthington Design Guidelines recommend signs be efficient (as small as necessary to get the business message across to the public) and compatible with the age and architecture of the building. Use of traditional sign materials such as wood, or material that looks like painted wood, is the most appropriate material for projecting and wall signs. Traditional sign types most appropriate for Old Worthington include projecting, wall, awning and non-illuminated window signs. Colors for signs in Old Worthington should be chosen for compatibility with the age, architecture and colors of the buildings with which they are associated. Compatibility of design and materials and exterior detail and relationships are standards of review in the Architectural District ordinance.

Worthington Conditional Use Permit Regulations

The following basic standards apply to conditional uses in any "C" or "I" District: the location, size, nature and intensity of the use, operations involved in or conducted in connection with it, its site layout and its relation to streets giving access to it, shall be such that both pedestrian and vehicular traffic to and from it will not be hazardous, both at the time and as the same may be expected to increase with increasing development of the Municipality. The provisions for parking, screening, setback, lighting, loading and service areas and sign location and area shall also be specified by the applicant and considered by the Commission.

Worthington Comprehensive Plan

A good mix of restaurant and niche retail shops are appropriate for Old Worthington. Market to desired retail users that are targeting the authentic town center with pedestrian-oriented store plans and products.

Recommendation:

Staff is recommending approval of these applications. The proposed business and projection sign are appropriate for this location.

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar swore in the applicant. Mr. Coulter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Ryan Fogelman stated his address is 4566 Village Club Dr., Powell, Ohio. Mr. Coulter said he likes the sign, and is pleased with the changes made to the old hardware store in such a short time period and Mr. Fogelman said thank you. Mr. Fogelman said the Bubbles Company has been around for ten years in the Short North, Easton and Polaris areas and is a growing local brand. Mr. Foust

asked if the business will be open to the public and Mr. Fogelman said yes. Mr. Sauer said he was pleased that a retail shop moved into the space that is occupied below Snap Fitness.

Mr. Fogelman said Bubbles sells clean teas and juices, but they also have smoothies and other things. Mr. Coulter asked what Bubble Tea is and Mr. Fogelman said the bubble is a tapioca ball that goes into a sugary type of drink. They will be catering to all different tastes.

Mr. Coulter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

ARB Motion:

Mr. Sauer moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY MATT DAVIS TO AMEND CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS AR 96-15 BY CHANGING THE PROJECTION SIGN AT 661 HIGH ST., AS PER CASE NO. AR 99-16, DRAWINGS NO. AR 99-16, DATED JULY 13, 2016, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Coulter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mr. Foust, aye. The motion was approved.

MPC Motion:

Mrs. Holcombe moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY MATT DAVIS FOR A CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT TO OPERATE A TEA AND JUICE BUSINESS IN THE C-5 ZONING DISTRICT AT 661 HIGH ST., AS PER CASE NO. CU 14-16, DRAWINGS NO. CU 14-16, DATED JULY 13, 2016, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Sauer seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Coulter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; and Mrs. Holcombe, aye. The motion was approved.

c. Personal Services in C-3 – **71 E. Wilson Bridge Rd. #A3 (Xinli Shi) CU 13-16**

Findings of Fact & Conclusions

Background & Request:

Three multi-tenanted office buildings were constructed on this property in 1985. The suites are owned as condominiums. The applicant is requesting approval to locate a massage business in the building closest to E. Wilson Bridge Rd. Because a Licensed Massage Therapist is not part of the business, it would be considered a personal service which is a conditional use in the C-3 Zoning District.

Page 18 of 20

ARB/MPC Meeting July 28, 2016

Minutes

Project Details:

1. The proposed business would have 2-3 employees offering relaxation massage and acupressure.
2. Approximately 4-5 clients per day would be expected, each of which would have 30-60 minute sessions.
3. The hours of use are 10:00 am to 9:00 pm, 7 days a week.
4. Parking is available in the lot adjacent to the building.

Zoning Code:Worthington Conditional Use Permit Regulations

The following basic standards shall apply to conditional uses in any "C" or "I" District: the location, size, nature and intensity of the use, operations involved in or conducted in connection with it, its site layout and its relation to streets giving access to it, shall be such that both pedestrian and vehicular traffic to and from it will not be hazardous, both at the time and as the same may be expected to increase with increasing development of the Municipality. The provisions for parking, screening, setback, lighting, loading and service areas and sign location and area shall also be specified by the applicant and considered by the Commission.

Recommendation:

Staff is recommending *approval* of this application. The proposed business should be compatible with other office uses.

Discussion:

Mr. Coulter asked if the applicant was present. Ms. Xinli Shi, along with her interpreter, stated her office address is 71 E. Wilson Bridge Rd., Suite A3, Worthington, Ohio. Her home address is 2385 Bayside Dr., Apt. 102, Hilliard, Ohio 43026. Board members had no questions or concerns.

Mr. Coulter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Motion:

Mrs. Holcombe moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY XINLI SHI FOR A CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT TO OPERATE A PERSONAL SERVICE IN THE C-3 ZONING DISTRICT AT 71 E. WILSON BRIDGE RD., AS PER CASE NO. CU 13-16, DRAWINGS NO. CU 13-16, DATED JULY 14, 2016, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Sauer seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Coulter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; and Mrs. Holcombe, aye. The motion was approved.

D. Other

There was no other business to discuss.

E. Adjournment

Mrs. Holcombe moved to adjourn the meeting at 8:24 p.m. and Mr. Sauer seconded the motion. All Board members voted, "Aye." The meeting was adjourned.