**MEMORANDUM**

TO: Members of the Architectural Review Board
Members of the Municipal Planning Commission

FROM: Lynda Bitar, Planning Coordinator

DATE: July 2, 2015

SUBJECT: Staff Memo for the Meeting of July 9, 2015

---

**B. Architectural Review Board**

**1. New**

a. Pergola – **373 W. Dublin-Granville Rd.** (Tim Cave) **AR 49-15**

**Findings of fact & Conclusions**

**Background & Request:**
This house is a 1960's split level located along the service road on the south side of W. Dublin-Granville Rd. There is an existing patio to the rear and the homeowner would like to add a pergola adjacent to the house and patio.

**Project Details:**
1. The proposed pergola would be a 23' x 14' structure attached to the house, with a 24" overhang on the south side.
2. Pressure treated pine is proposed for the pergola material, which would be stained white to match the wood picket fence in the rear yard.

**Land Use Plans:**
Worthington Architectural District Ordinance
Compatibility of design and materials and exterior details and relationships are standards for review in the Architectural District ordinance.

**Recommendation:**
Staff is recommending *approval* of the application. The proposed pergola is appropriate at the rear of the house.

**Motion:**
**THAT THE REQUEST BY TIM CAVE FOR APPROVAL OF A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO CONSTRUCT A PERGOLA AT 373 W. DUBLIN-GRANVILLE RD., AS PER CASE NO. AR 49-15, DRAWINGS NO. AR 49-15, DATED JUNE 24, 2015, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.**

b. Porch Alteration – **100 E. New England Ave.** (Tim & Natalie McCarthy)
**AR 50-15**

**Findings of Fact & Conclusions**

**Background & Request:**
Built in 1928, this house is two-stories with a front-facing gabled roof, and a front porch with a matching gable. The porch was last renovated in 2003, when the door was moved from the side to face the front. The owners are now proposing some alterations to the porch.

**Project Details:**
1. Replacement of the screens with new fiberglass screen panels is proposed.
2. A new concrete slab is proposed.
3. New cedar railing with a crisscross pattern would be installed at the bottom of the screens.
4. A black aluminum handrail is proposed adjacent to the existing front steps.

**Land Use Plans:**
Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance
Compatibility of design and materials, exterior details and relationships are standards of review in the Architectural District ordinance.

**Staff Analysis:**
The proposed cedar design at the bottom of the porch, and the aluminum handrail may be out of character with the house. Simpler design and use of a wood rail may be warranted given the features of the house.

**Motion:**
**THAT THE REQUEST BY TIM & NATALIE MCCARTHY FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO ALTER THE FRONT PORCH AT 100. E. NEW ENGLAND AVE., AS PER CASE NO. AR 50-15, DRAWINGS NO. AR 50-15, DATED JUNE 25, 2015, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.**

c. Windows – **690 Evening St.** (Timothy Shaw) **AR 51-15**

**<u>Findings of fact & Conclusions</u>**

**Background & Request:**
This house was built in the early 1900's and is a two-story Colonial Revival style house. The house is in disrepair, and the outbuildings have been demolished as was approved by the ARB in May 2015. This application is a request to replace the windows.

**Project Details:**
1. Forty-two windows are proposed for replacement, 35 are original to the house and 7 were added later. The owner reports the existing windows to be in deteriorated condition. All would be replaced with windows that match the style of the original windows.
2. The proposed windows would be manufactured by Hurd and sized to fit the original openings. The windows would be aluminum clad wood windows with simulated divided lights (muntins on the inside, outside, and with spacers between the panes of glass.) The outside of the windows is proposed to be white.
3. One of the rear windows is proposed for replacement with a Hurd patio door in the same style as the windows.
4. Glass block windows are proposed for 3 of the basement windows. Two of the windows are on the north side of the house, and 1 is to the rear. The glass in the block would have a wavy pattern and the grout lines would be minimal.

**Land Use Plans:**
<u>Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance</u>
The Worthington Design Guidelines recommend if historic windows are too deteriorated to repair cost-effectively and replacement is justified, the preferred option is an in-kind replacement in the same material and design. New windows made of substitute materials such as clad wood can be acceptable if they provide a reasonably good match for the windows being replaced. Be sure that window designs are appropriate for the style or time period of the house. Avoid use of inappropriate window designs. Avoid enlarging or downsizing window openings to accommodate stock sizes of replacements. Also avoid permanent blocking in of windows.

Retention and repair of existing basement windows, or replacement with a modern version of the same style window is preferred, but replacement with glass block could be acceptable if the windows are hidden and/or camouflaged appropriately. The following measures may lessen the impact:
1. Recessing the glass block as deeply as possible in the foundation wall;
2. Using block sizes and glazing patterns to follow as closely as possible the original basement window style, or other window styles in the structure;
3. Placing a screen or storm window over the basement windows to obscure the glass block;
4. Leaving one or more openings with original windows or like replacements to allow for adequate ventilation; and
5. Arranging landscaping to lessen the visibility of the glass block.

Compatibility of design and materials, exterior detail and relationships, and window treatment are standards of review in the Architectural District ordinance.

**Recommendation:**
Staff is recommending *approval* of the application. The proposed windows would be a good match for the existing. The basement windows are not readily seen.

**Motion:**
**THAT THE REQUEST BY TIMOTHY SHAW FOR APPROVAL OF A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO REPLACE THE WINDOWS AND ADD A DOOR AT 690 EVENING ST., AS PER CASE NO. AR 51-15, DRAWINGS NO. AR 51-15, DATED JUNE 25, 2015, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.**

d. Deck Walkway – **581 Oxford St.** (Sabone & Robert Holub) **AR 53-15**

**Findings of Fact & Conclusions**

**Background & Request:**
This Farmhouse was originally constructed in 1857, and has been added onto over the years. This property is 97' wide, which is larger than many lots in the neighborhood. The homeowners gained approval in 2014 to construct a 3 season room addition and deck to the rear, and a breezeway between the garage and a side entrance. The owners would now like to construct a walkway connecting the deck to the breezeway.

**Project Details:**
1. The walkway would be constructed with Timbertech composite decking material, just as was used for the deck.
2. Placement would be about 8" above grade, and include steps following the grade.

**Land Use Plans:**
Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance
There are recommendations in the Guidelines for additions and decks to be located as far to the rear as possible. Design and materials should be traditional, and compatible with the existing structure.

**Recommendation:**
Staff is recommending *approval* of this application. The walkway would be located to the rear, and match the deck material.

**Motion:**
**THAT THE REQUEST BY SABONE & ROBERT HOLUB FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO CONSTRUCT A WALKWAY AT 581 OXFORD ST., AS PER CASE NO. AR 53-15, DRAWINGS NO. AR 53-15, DATED JUNE 26, 2015 , BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.**

e. Condensing Unit – **617 Hartford St.** (Jim & Lindsay Roop) **AR 54-15**

**Findings of Fact & Conclusions**

**Background & Request:**
This Homestead style home was built in the early 1900's, and the current homeowners have received approval recently for modifications to the rear part of the structure, the site and the windows. This application is for the addition of a condensing unit.

**Project Details:**
1. The condensing unit is proposed on the north side of the house, hidden from the front by a portion of the house.
2. Evergreen landscaping is proposed to screen the unit.

**Land Use Plans:**
Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance
Keep functional items such as trash containers and mechanical equipment well screened with fences or plantings.

**Recommendation:**
Staff is recommending *approval* of this application. The placement and screening of the new condensing unit is appropriate.

**Motion:**
**THAT THE REQUEST BY JIM AND LINDSAY ROOP FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO ADD A CONDENSING UNIT AT 617 HARTFORD ST., AS PER CASE NO. AR 54-15, DRAWINGS NO. AR 54-15, DATED JUNE 26, 2015, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.**

f. Sign – **888 High St.** (DaNite Sign Company/Gwynn Vaughan) **AR 55-15**

**Findings of Fact & Conclusions**

**Background & Request:**
This building was constructed in 1875, and has been used as an office building for decades. Replacement of the sign faces on the existing freestanding sign is proposed.

**Project Details:**
1. Reuse of the existing sign structure is planned, which may need repainted.
2. The proposed faces would be formed aluminum, with routed logo and copy backed with acrylic and vinyl graphics. The proposed colors are white, black and blue.
3. The sign would display the logo and tag line for Nationwide Insurance, with the agent's name below. One style of text plus a logo and three sizes including the logo are proposed.

**Land Use Plans:**
Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance
Place only basic names and graphics on signs along the street so that drive-by traffic is not bombarded with too much information. Free-standing signs should be of the "monument" type (standing vertically, mounted on a ground-level base and not on a pole); they should be as low as possible. Such signs should have an appropriate base such as a brick planting area with appropriate landscaping or no lighting.

Colors for signs should be chosen for compatibility with the age, architecture and colors of the buildings they serve. Signs must be distinctive enough to be readily visible, but avoid incompatible modern colors such as "fluorescent orange" and similar colors. Bright color shades generally are discouraged in favor more subtle and toned-down shades. Signage, including the appropriateness of signage to the building, is a standard of review per the Architectural District ordinance.

**Recommendation:**
Staff is recommending *approval* of this application. Reuse of the existing sign is acceptable and the proposed sign faces are appropriate.

**Motion:**
**THAT THE REQUEST BY DANITE SIGN COMPANY ON BEHALF OF HERBERT VAUGHAN FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO INSTALL NEW SIGN FACES AT 888 HIGH ST., AS PER CASE NO. AR 55-15, DRAWINGS NO. AR 55-15, DATED JUNE 29, 2015, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.**

g. Site Lighting – **7227 N. High St.** (M+A Architects) **AR 56-15** **To be tabled**

h. New Entrance, Windows and Awning Removal – **661 High St.** (Jonathan Barnes Architecture and Design) **AR 57-15**

**Findings of Fact & Conclusions**

**Background & Request:**
This building was originally constructed in 1875 and remodeled in the late 1900's. The building currently houses Sassafras Bakery and the Old Bag of Nails, and the former Worthington Hardware space is being divided, with 2 of the suites spoken for by Grid Furnishings and Igloo Letterpress. An application for a Conditional Use Permit for Snap Fitness to operate a recreational facility in 1510 square feet of the first floor and in the 1945 square foot second floor space was approved by the MPC on June 11, 2015. A separate 1000 square foot space for retail was part of the proposal. This application is a request for approval of the exterior changes to the building.

**Project Details:**

1. As requested by the City, the applicant is proposing retention of the existing exterior door to the space and creation of a small vestibule to allow access to the separate suites inside the space.
2. Removal of the muntins in the storefront windows has already been done, but still needs approval. Removal of the awning is proposed.
3. Replacement is proposed for the second floor windows, some of which were boarded over/filled in years ago. Vinyl clad wood windows to match the existing are proposed. The front second story windows would only be replaced if repair is not possible. A manufacturer has not been identified.
4. A new entrance is proposed for the rear of the space. The opening would be through the rear block wall and would have steel stairs to allow access to the sidewalk. The style of door has not been identified. The stairs may be required to have a different style of railing due to Building Code requirements. The color of the stairs has not been identified.
5. No changes to the signage have been identified.
6. On the interior, a new stairway to the second floor is proposed at the northeast corner of the building; and many of the existing materials would be retained.

**Land Use Plans:**

Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance

There are recommendations in the Worthington Design Guidelines to use exterior materials traditionally used on commercial building in Worthington.

The Worthington Design Guidelines recommend if historic windows are too deteriorated to repair cost-effectively and replacement is justified, the preferred option is an in-kind replacement in the same material and design. New windows made of substitute materials such as clad wood can be acceptable if they provide a reasonably good match for the windows being replaced. Be sure that window designs are appropriate for the style or time period of the building. Avoid use of inappropriate window designs. Avoid enlarging or downsizing window openings to accommodate stock sizes of replacements. Also avoid permanent blocking in of windows.

Compatibility of design and materials and exterior detail and relationships are standards of review in the Architectural District ordinance.

**Recommendation:**

Staff is recommending *approval* of this application if the window and rear entrance details are satisfactory.

**Motion:**

**THAT THE REQUEST BY JONATHAN BARNES ARCHITECTURE AND DESIGN FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPROPRIATENESS TO MAKE MODIFICATIONS AT 661 HIGH ST., AS PER CASE NO. AR 57-15, DRAWINGS NO. AR 57-15, DATED MAY 1, 2015, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.**

## C. Municipal Planning Commission

### 1. Conditional Use

a. Vocational Instruction in I-1 – **7020 D Huntley Rd**.(Megan A. Ramage) **CU 17-15**

**<u>Findings of Fact & Conclusions</u>**

**Background & Request:**
This site has two multi-tenanted buildings constructed in the late 1960's. This request would allow a non-profit organization called Pathways to Independence of Central Ohio to conduct vocational instruction in Suite D at the southeast corner of the site. The applicant will also be applying for a Conditional Use Permit for a Dog Day Care center once the Code change is in place that would allow that use in I-1. The vocational instruction for the business involves using the day care business to prepare young adults with disabilities for employment and to become more self-sufficient.

**Basic Standards and Review Elements**: The following general elements are to be considered when hearing applications for Conditional Use Permits:

1. Effect on traffic pattern – Parking is provided adjacent to the building, and should be ample to accommodate the use. In the beginning, the plan is to have 2 employees, volunteers, and no more than 10 clients a day at the facility.
2. Effect on public facilities – No effect has been identified.
3. Effect on sewerage and drainage facilities – The effect would be minimal.
4. Utilities required – No new utilities would be required.
5. Safety and health considerations – None have been identified.
6. Noise, odors and other noxious elements, including hazardous substances and other environmental hazards – None have been identified.
7. Hours of use – Hours would mainly be weekdays from 9:00 am to 5:00 pm, with occasional special events.
8. Shielding or screening considerations for neighbors – No change to the building or site is proposed.
9. Appearance and compatibility with the general neighborhood – No change to building or site.

**Land Use Plans:**
<u>Worthington Conditional Use Permit Regulations</u>
The following basic standards apply to conditional uses in any "C" or "I" District: the location, size, nature and intensity of the use, operations involved in or conducted in connection with it, its site layout and its relation to streets giving access to it, shall be such that both pedestrian and vehicular traffic to and from it will not be hazardous, both at the time and as the same may be expected to increase with increasing development of the Municipality. The provisions for parking, screening, setback, lighting, loading and service areas and sign location and area shall also be specified by the applicant and considered by the Commission.

Worthington Comprehensive Plan Update & 2005 Strategic Plan
An area plan focusing on the Proprietors/Huntley Road corridor should be developed that makes recommendations for repositioning it in the market place to make it attractive and competitive in the region. Because of the age and types of uses located here, this compact area is experiencing significant change and has the opportunity to reinvent itself. Issues such as building renovation, aesthetics, and possible road and infrastructure improvements should be addressed.

**Recommendation:**
Staff is recommending *approval* of this application. There should be minimal effect on traffic patterns; public facilities; sewerage and drainage facilities; and utilities. No safety or health considerations or environmental hazards have been identified.

**Motion:**
**THAT THE REQUEST BY MEGAN A. RAMAGE FOR A CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT TO CONDUCT VOCATIONAL INSTRUCTION AT 7020 D HUNTLEY RD., AS PER CASE NO. CU 17-15, DRAWINGS NO. CU 17-15, DATED JUNE 24, 2015, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.**