

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING
WORTHINGTON ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
WORTHINGTON MUNICIPAL PLANNING COMMISSION

March 14, 2013

The regular meeting of the Worthington Architectural Review Board and the Worthington Municipal Planning Commission was called to order at 7:30 p.m. with the following members present: Richard Hunter, Chair; Kathy Holcombe, Secretary; Chris Hermann; Mikel Coulter; Amy Lloyd; and Jo Rodgers. Also present were: Lynda Bitar, Development Coordinator and Clerk of the Municipal Planning Commission; and Melissa Cohan, Paralegal. James Sauer, Vice Chair; and Scott Myers, Worthington City Council Representative for the Municipal Planning Commission were absent.

A. Call to Order – 7:30 p.m.

1. Roll Call
2. Pledge of Allegiance
3. Approval of minutes of the meeting of February 28, 2013

Mr. Hunter noted one change needed to be made. Mr. Coulter moved to approve the minutes. Mrs. Lloyd seconded the motion. All members said, “Aye”.

4. Affirmation/swearing in of witnesses

B. Architectural Review Board

1. New

- a. Disc Golf Course – **300 W. Dublin-Granville Rd.** (Thomas Worthington High School – Student Athletic Leadership Board) **AR 10-13**

Discussion:

Ms. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application and showed pictures of the metal baskets, signage and site. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present.

Three speakers approached the microphone. Mr. Will Byars stated his address is 6667 Masfield St., Worthington, Ohio; Mr. Nicholas Highley stated his address is 1247 Tranquil Dr., Columbus, Ohio; and Mr. James Burpee stated his address is 1377 Collins Dr., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Byars explained the Disc Golf Course will be open to the Community as well as students. He also explained the metal baskets are removable if needed during events. The metal baskets will not interfere with other sports. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone else present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. The Student Athletic Leadership Board from Thomas Worthington High School has planned a disc golf course for the flats. The course is located around the perimeter as to not interfere with any of the sports fields.
2. A 4' x 4' sign is proposed at the entry to the course, which is located between the junior varsity baseball field and the north practice football field. The tee areas will have a 12" x 12" sign identifying the hole number, layout, yardage, and sponsor. All proposed signs will be constructed of molded plastic, having blue backgrounds and white lettering.
3. Each hole will consist of a stainless steel chained basket on a pole and a round sign with the hole number.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed disc golf course is appropriate.

Mrs. Rodgers moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY THE THOMAS WORTHINGTON HIGH SCHOOL STUDENT ATHLETIC LEADERSHIP BOARD FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO INSTALL A DISC GOLD COURSE AT 300 W. DUBLIN-GRANVILLE RD. AS PER CASE NO. AR 10-13, DRAWINGS NO. AR 10-13, DATED FEBRUARY 28, 2013, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. Ms. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

- b. Sunroom – **211 W. Dublin-Granville Rd.** (Brian Zingelmann, Architect/Dineen & Horton)
AR 11-13

Discussion:

Ms. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Brian Zingelman approached the microphone and stated his address is 261 Garden Rd., Columbus, Ohio. Mr. Zingelman said he will be using single sash aluminum windows which will not be insulated. The existing roof was replaced about six years ago, so the new roofing will be matched. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. A 12' x 14' sunroom is proposed to the rear of the home toward the eastern edge of the

existing house. The project will include restoration of an existing paver patio and construction of a new paver stoop for access to the sunroom.

2. The proposed siding for the room is gray double 4” Dutch lap vinyl siding to match the house. The asphalt roof shingles are also proposed to match the house, as will the pitch of the gable roof, and trim style and materials.
3. White vinyl windows and a white aluminum door are proposed.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed addition is appropriate for the house.

Mr. Coulter moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY BRIAN ZINGELMANN, ARCHITECT FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO CONSTRUCT A SUNROOM AT 211 W. DUBLIN-GRANVILLE RD. AS PER CASE NO. AR 11-13, DRAWINGS NO. AR 11-13, DATED FEBRUARY 28, 2013, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Hermann seconded the motion. Ms. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

c. Generator – **65 Wesley Blvd.** (Sunrise Senior Living Management, Inc.) **AR 12-13**

Discussion:

Ms. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application and said at some point the applicant hopes to put screening around the generator, but it is not proposed from the beginning. The generator can only be seen from the parking lot areas between the buildings. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present.

Mr. Adam Mayberry approached the microphone and stated his address is 22 Church Street, Centerburg, Ohio 43011. Mr. Mayberry said he was at the meeting to represent Sunrise Assisted Living. The generator will be tested every Tuesday at 9:30 a.m., which is the same time the generator in the other building is tested. He said they are planning at some point to screen with arborvitae, but the cost of the generator is a capital expenditure, and the owners are not paying for beautification at this time. There are plans to screen the generator at a later date, because they do not want an eye sore as they are trying to sell the property.

Mrs. Holcombe asked if it would be screened with greenery and Mr. Mayberry said yes. Mr. Hunter said normally screening is required for this type of application. Ms. Bitar said there can be a condition to plant the screening within the next eighteen months.

Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. A generator is proposed at the southeast corner of the memory care building, which is located west of the main Sunrise building.
2. The proposed generator will be hidden from neighboring properties with the existing vegetation on the south side of the UMCH site.
3. Arborvitae will be planted to screen the generator within 18 months.

Conclusion:

1. Placement of the proposed generator is appropriate.

Mr. Coulter moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY SUNRISE SENIOR LIVING MANAGEMENT, INC. FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO INSTALL A GENERATOR AT 65 WESLEY BLVD. AS PER CASE NO. AR 12-13, DRAWINGS NO. AR 12-13, DATED MARCH 1, 2013, BE APPROVED AND THAT ARBORVITAE WILL BE ADDED AS SCREENING AROUND THE GENERATOR WITHIN EIGHTEEN MONTHS BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Rodgers seconded the motion. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

- d. Addition – **5750 N. High St.** (Christopher P. Meyers, AIA/St. Michael Catholic Church) **AR 13-13** (Amendment to COA #08-13)

Discussion:

Ms. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. A few weeks ago there was an extension of the previous approval, but changes made to construction drawings did not get included. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present.

Mr. Chris Meyers approached the microphone and stated his address is 232 N. Third St., Columbus, Ohio, and he is an Architect with Meyers & Associates. Board members said they were pleased with the drawings. Mr. Meyers said they added the rail for safety reasons. Mr. Coulter said the hand rail needs to project a foot beyond the end and it is not indicated on the drawing. Mr. Meyer's said it might not be on the renderings, but it definitely is on the construction drawings. He said the ground breaking is scheduled for this coming Sunday. Mr. Meyers said the Bishop of the Diocese of Columbus will be there and he extended the invitation

to the Board members if they would like to attend. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. The Board extended the previous approval for this addition in February. Upon receipt of the construction drawings, a number of modifications were identified. An amended approval is required from the Board before a Building Permit can be issued. Copies of the previously approved drawings as well as the amended drawings are included in the packets.
2. On the west elevation, a metal railing is proposed for the entry ramp.
3. The south elevation previously had a large window area with a metal roof. Smaller windows to match the others in the addition are now proposed, as is a small stone inset.
4. A canopy above the stairs is proposed to extend above the entire stair on the north elevation. Also, a drop chute for donations will be removed.
5. The applicant would like to remove a window; modify the roof structure; remove a brick side wall; and extend the rail at the stairs on the east side of the building.

Conclusion:

1. The changes are appropriate for the project.

Mrs. Holcombe moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY CHRISTOPHER MEYERS, AIA FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO AMEND COA #AR 08-13 BY ALTERING THE APPROVED ADDITION AT 5750 HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 13-13, DRAWINGS NO. AR 13-13, DATED MARCH 5, 2013, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Hermann seconded the motion. Ms. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

2. Unfinished

- a. New Residential Buildings – **7227 N. High St.** (M&A Architects/The Shops at Worthington Place) **AR 110-12**

Discussion:

Ms. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. New drawings were distributed to the Board members. She said a number of changes were made based on the comments from the last

meeting and staff's review. The preliminary plat and the final plats have been amended to show easements necessary for access and utilities on the site. She said between now and April 1st, 2013, when City Council has its hearing regarding the proposal, staff will make sure that all of the necessary easements are part of that drawing. Ms. Bitar said the City has also asked for the right-of-way to be extended to include the sidewalk in front of the building on the Wilson Bridge Road side. A front setback variance will be needed due to that request.

The sidewalk along Old Wilson Bridge Road is not five feet from the curb, so a variance will be needed from City Council. On the recent drawing handed out it shows that sidewalk for future use, but should instead indicate it will be there in the present. There is a lighting plan that is being distributed that includes fixtures that do not seem appropriate and will need to be discussed as part of a future Amendment to the Development Plan application. She said after a cursory review, the light levels seem to be in keeping with what is expected for the district. As the applicant creates construction drawings, there will probably be a number of changes and adjustments, which will be Amendments to the Development Plan.

Ms. Bitar said since the James Tavern was not within the Architectural Review District and Insight Bank is not a part of the district, it is not appropriate to add this project to that district. They are looking at the Wilson Bridge Road Corridor Overlay District which will have some form of review, and feel this project should be included as part of that effort. As part of the development plan there is the opportunity to approve the interior finishes that were given to the Board members, as well as the amenity deck plans and everything else to do with the site, architecture and utilities, providing for a very comprehensive review of the site.

Mr. Hunter said the quality of this project is very important and stated to be as a part of this record. Mr. Hunter also stated as changes are made they can be upgrades, but downgrades will be frowned on severely. He said these apartments need to be well done from the start, and that is a key requirement. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present.

Mr. Nelson Yoder approached the microphone and stated his address is 555 Metro Place North, Dublin, Ohio. Mr. Yoder said he brought some similar slides that were shown at the recent City Council meeting and that he would move through those rather quickly.

Mr. Yoder said the changes since the last meeting include adding a sidewalk out at Wilson Bridge Road; adding sidewalk connections to building number one at the center and to the east entrances; adding a new visitor drop off area in building number two; adding a trellis to soften the entrance space; screening for the electrical gear; and have studied the amenity decks and have a proposal for that as well.

Mr. Yoder said they have been working on the sanitary feeder, and the utility locations with some input from the City. As requested, they added an option for tying into the sanitary sewer. He said he has a memo from Brian Quackenbush stating they have met the City requirements for tying into the sanitary sewer.

They have also put the electrical gear on the civil drawings. They have updated the plat by showing cross access easements. Mr. Yoder displayed a building section that lists all the

materials, which was requested at the previous meeting. It is a blown up view showing where they have all the materials and how they are coming together. They revised the extent of the brick and building elevations. As requested, full brick will be used everywhere. They completed an additional color rendering which shows the exterior colors. A fourth elevator was added to building number one and they updated that and the entry lobby into the architectural plans. They also completed a study showing how two one-bedroom units can be converted to form a two bedroom townhome.

Mr. Yoder discussed the slide presentation previously shared with City Council members. Mr. Yoder said there is approximate private investment of 28.6 million dollars, and about 367,000 man hours, which works out to 150 workers, working 40 hours per week for 15 months.

Also discussed was the new sanitary connection on the north side of the building. Mr. Yoder pinpointed the "Z" at the top of the map and noted it is the desired connection point for the building. He felt the City's concern was the Corporate Hill Drive sanitary sewer line, although it may be able to be dedicated in the future, is not public and technically belongs to the owners of 300 W. Wilson Bridge Road. Mr. Yoder said they can connect to the sewer to the north for building number two and connecting to the existing sanitary sewer to the south for building number one.

Mr. Coulter asked if a lift station would be needed. Mr. Yoder said the building on the north will not need a lift station, but they are going to have a sump pump for the basement, and all the residential units will flow by gravity. The basement of the parking garage will be required to have an oil and sand interceptor and from there it will go through that interceptor, be pumped up, and then drain down with gravity. Mr. Yoder said they do not anticipate much water in the basement. He said the only water will come from just dripping off of the cars in the garage from rain and snow melt.

Ms. Bitar said that the drawings do not seem to show the sewer connections for building number one being to the south, it still shows the connection that goes from the top in between the two buildings. Mr. Yoder asked if that was to the east of the outdoor patio space on Wilson Bridge. Ms. Bitar said no, that is storm discharge. She said that the other connection in the middle is still shown that connects to the stub that comes out. Mr. Yoder said that he would have the drawings updated to reflect the sanitary sewer lines.

Mr. Yoder pointed out for building number one where the switch gear will be located, which includes a transformer and a CT Cabinet. He said it is just off to the right of building number one, between it and the Insight Bank building. It is located in the least visible spot from the right-of-way from any of the public streets. Mr. Yoder said down into the ramp for the parking garage for building number two is where they have tucked the other transformer.

Ms. Bitar said one thing missing is a final plat that shows all of the easements, but that it could be presented to City Council on April 1, 2013.

Mr. Yoder moved on to discuss the elevation that wraps around the western edge of the building.

Mr. Yoder explained they have created a visual separation between the back and front of the building with vertical glass element, the stair. Mr. Yoder continued to show the slide presentation and explained from the front of the building the glass wraps around the parapet as well. Mr. Yoder brought a sample window to show to the Board members, which was an aluminum clad Jeld Wen window. He also brought brick samples. The main brick is the red brick and the accent brick is the more brown brick.

Mr. Hunter said he could not find the fourth elevator that Mr. Yoder had mentioned earlier. Mr. Yoder answered there are three elevators in Building One, and one in Building Two.

Ms. Bitar asked if there was an opportunity to have a window with muntins on the outside. Mr. Hermann asked if the muntins were only on the front elevation. Mr. Yoder said the muntins will be on all the windows. Mr. Hunter felt it was better for a building of that size to have one inch muntins. Mr. Coulter asked if the window was representative of the size that will be installed on the apartment buildings and Mr. Yoder said no, it is just a smaller sample. Mr. Yoder said the typical windows will be five feet high and three feet wide.

Mr. Coulter asked how many lights there would be. Mr. Yoder said the elevations are showing six on the top sash and one on the bottom. He said as far as the simulated divided lights go, they can follow up with their management company for a maintenance perspective. It is fifty feet in the air and it can be a maintenance issue. He said he wants to make sure that they will be comfortable, and from a pricing perspective a window of that size can cost \$500.00 or it can cost \$1,500.00. Mr. Yoder said when you have thousands of those windows it can have quite an impact on cost. He said the sample that is presented is what is affordable to include in the project. It is aluminum clad wood with the interior muntins.

He said going with interior muntins of a larger one inch size is not an upcharge and should not be a problem, but an exterior muntin could be a cost and maintenance issue.

Ms. Bitar asked if Mr. Yoder has used this same window in other projects, and Mr. Yoder said no, they have not used that type of window in other projects. He said they have used vinyl windows in other locations, but due to the concern in Worthington to have aluminum clad windows, they are presenting one for the Board members to view.

Ms. Bitar asked if they could ask the manufacturer to see where this style of window can be viewed in place. Mrs. Holcombe agreed and thought that was a good idea, because it also depends on how it looks with the glass.

Mr. Yoder said they would like to identify what type of window the Board likes, and then leave the door open when they go out to the bid environment. They would like to have three or four options that come close, and then they will make a return trip to the Board after bidding. Mr. Yoder said they did not want to lock themselves into one specific type of window because the pricing will not be competitive. He will see if he can find something that the Board will like, or a similar alternative.

Mr. Hunter said he had additional questions. He said Mr. Yoder referenced a service room on the ground floor plan of building one and what looks like a roll up style of door, and asked if that is a service door. Mr. Yoder said yes, it is where the dumpster location will be, and where supplies will be dropped off and stored.

Mr. Coulter said he would be fine looking at a couple of different window options. Mr. Coulter understood that Mr. Yoder needs to get bids for the windows. He also said he liked seeing the elevations broken up, and feels the large building has some character to it. Mr. Coulter asked Ms. Bitar if the Worthington Fire Department was okay with the Knox Box system set up and Ms. Bitar said yes. The transformer issue was already addressed, but he did not see any screening. Mr. Coulter also asked if there will be any bike racks outside the apartment buildings. Mr. Yoder said there will be bike racks available but nothing is shown on the plans yet. He will make sure the plans get updated. Mr. Yoder said the bike path is on the north end of the site so it makes sense to have them near there.

Mr. Coulter said he is not sure he agrees with the parking study. Mr. Tom Carter approached the microphone and stated his address is 7227 High Street, Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Carter said he just received a revised layout because they would like to change the diagonal parking around Kroger to ninety degree spaces, plus add some spaces along High Street where the pylon sign is. He said the net add will be seventy spaces, plus the new design will give them a pedestrian corridor. Mr. Carter said they currently have 865 spaces on site, and with the addition of Mr. Yoder's development they will have roughly twelve hundred and sixty spaces. Mr. Carter said it is the addition of almost four hundred spaces, of which three hundred and fifty seven spaces supports the apartment and office development. Mr. Carter said with the restriping, there will be about 40 spaces more than today. Mr. Carter said also it will make for a much better lot in front of Kroger.

Mr. Hunter asked if there would be any changes to the widths of the aisles. Mr. Carter said no, they have had the engineers check it and its set up for a ninety degree parking configuration. Mr. Hunter asked if they would have to move the light poles and Mr. Carter said no. Mr. Carter said the center line of the bays is appropriate. He also said they would continue to give information to Ms. Bitar as it becomes available. Mr. Carter said he is currently waiting for Kroger to approve the layout before the plan comes to the City for approval.

Mr. Hermann said at one point Kroger had cart corrals with lots of advertisements across the top. He said the Board did not approve those so Kroger decided not to use them. Mrs. Lloyd said that she had a suggestion for Kroger. She said one of the Kroger locations just uses curbs instead of corrals, and if they are going to restripe the lot it might be helpful for Kroger to update their cart system.

Mr. Hunter asked about the square space by Swan Cleaners and the thought about removing the curbing area there, near the north sidewalk, or if he plans to leave it alone. Mr. Carter said the current plan shows a double loaded parking bay where that sidewalk is currently. He said they are also looking at changing those spaces that go in front of FrontRunner and Swan's to make them ninety degrees. They originally thought that most people were coming in from the north,

but they are mostly coming in from the south. There also might be changes to the median entrance. He said it is not a well-functioning intersection next to Telhio.

Mr. Hunter asked a question about the main western entrance, between the mall and Insight Bank. He asked Mr. Carter if there was any thought about adding a four-way stop at that particular intersection. Mr. Carter said that he was not a fan of three-way stops because most people think that they are a four-way stop. Mr. Hunter said that area needs to be restriped as well. Mr. Carter said that he would take a look at that.

Mr. Yoder referenced back to the 11 x 17 plan that he brought and said that EMH&T was trying to show both options for sanitary service until they understand what they can and cannot do. They are showing the location by Corporate Hill Drive and the alternate sanitary sewer connection to the north of building two to the southeast corner.

Mr. Hunter said Mr. Yoder is not showing the latest drawings for the gated access to the second level of parking. Mr. Yoder said as they took the Board's suggestion to create a drop-off area their initial take was to put the drop-off area inside the building. Then they decided to put the drop-off area outside of the building with five visitor spaces, and forgot to add the gates back on the plan.

Mr. Hermann said they discussed going with full brick earlier but it still says thin brick veneer on some of the sheets. Mr. Yoder will have that updated.

Ms. Bitar asked if Mr. Yoder ever addressed the railings on the balconies. Mr. Yoder said the railing color they are looking at is white to match the white siding. He said it will be a pre-finished white aluminum railing system to match the pre-finished white windows. Ms. Bitar asked if the same railing would be used across the amenity deck. Mr. Yoder said that the amenity deck is its own entity, and he would like to see bronze used there instead of the white color because it will work better with the exterior.

Mr. Yoder said they will be using a combination of bronze and a lighter color for the storefront system. Mr. Hunter asked if the artist put the number 160 on the drawing and Mr. Yoder said yes. Mr. Coulter asked what material the sign would be. Mr. Yoder said it will be solid in the front and halo reverse lit. Mr. Coulter asked about the amenity deck and if there will be a fence around the entire area. Mr. Yoder said yes, to prevent people from going over the side. Mr. Coulter asked if it would be five feet tall. Mr. Yoder said the fence will be at least four feet tall around the perimeter of the deck. He said that 42" would be the legal limit, and Mr. Coulter said he is aware there are certain dimensions for fences around pools.

Mr. Hermann said he had questions about rooftop mechanical enclosures. Mr. Yoder said Envisor screens could be installed if the visibility merited. He said it could be a stipulation of approval to add if necessary. Mr. Yoder said they are placing the equipment back towards the six story volume and he does not think anybody will be able to see them. Mr. Hunter said if it were a roof deck with landscaping it would disappear also.

Mrs. Bitar asked if Mr. Yoder looked at the possibility of a having a green roof. Mr. Yoder said they have not pursued that just yet because they do not have it in their budget, but if they could apply for a City of Worthington LEED Grant they might be able to do that. Ms. Bitar said the City does have a grant if Mr. Yoder can gain LEED certification.

Mr. Hermann asked if Mr. Yoder had planned to do any accent lighting on the building. Mr. Yoder said yes, something subtle, so it does not look lit up, but adds a touch of class to the building. They will be using low voltage lighting.

Mr. Yoder asked if the Board members wanted to go over the combination plans for the units, where two one-bedroom units can be combined to make a two bedroom town home. He said they were able to make some minor adjustments to their typical one bedroom plan. The plan would allow for two one-bedroom units (each unit is 725 sq. ft.) that are stacked on top of one another to be combined to equal 1450 sq. ft., allowing for two or three bedrooms, and two or three bathrooms. Mechanicals would not need to be moved. Closet space would be removed to add a staircase, and a kitchen would be removed to add a large walk-in closet or a bathroom for the master. Mr. Yoder continued to explain that a wall could be left in, or taken out to create a larger living space. If the wall is left in, a third bedroom or den could be created. He appreciated the suggestion, because if a condominium conversion would occur, this would help position the project. Mr. Yoder said for every two one-bedroom units (100 planned one-bedroom units), they would net out 50 two-bedroom townhomes. He said they are also unique in the sense that the square footage would increase from 1100 to 1450 sq. ft. Mrs. Holcombe and Mr. Hermann agreed that it was a helpful idea.

Mr. Yoder said not much has changed to building number two. Mr. Hunter wanted to know how pets would be handled between the two apartment buildings. Mr. Yoder said dogs will only be allowed in building number two, and the weight of the dogs will be limited to 22 to 25 pounds. The tenants in the larger building, building number one, will only be allowed to have cats.

Mr. Hermann said he agreed with Ms. Bitar and said he would like to see the sidewalk on Old Wilson Bridge Road installed along with building number two. Mr. Hunter said he had a question about that. He said that because of the elevation of building number two on the east side there would be a sidewalk to nowhere, because there is no sidewalk currently in front of Insight Bank. He asked if it would be a sidewalk to nowhere or if Mr. Yoder would attach it to something that he is not aware of.

Mr. Yoder said there is a sidewalk to the eastern end of the building. You will be able to loop up to the eastern exit of building number one. Mr. Yoder said they have added some sidewalks.

Mr. Hermann said he remembered requiring the frontage be in compliance with the Wilson Bridge Rd. plan for the Insight Bank application. Mr. Hermann said they discussed taking down the crab apples and they got them to commit taking the crab apples down and match whatever else became a part of that plan. Ms. Bitar asked if it was just for landscaping or including a sidewalk. Mr. Hermann said his intentions were streetscape, and that would include a sidewalk. Mr. Hunter said he was not sure where a sidewalk could be added without destroying what vegetation is there in front of Insight.

Mr. Hunter asked if Mr. Yoder had floor elevations for both buildings. Mr. Yoder said one is 861, and the other one is 881 for the garage finished floor. Mr. Yoder said for the record, he spoke with Brian Quackenbush today and his plat is showing 892 and the correct finished floor is 890 for building number two at the north end. He said that allows them to have an at grade transition at the exit for building number two out toward the mall, so people that want to go to Kroger can exit there. There is only a one foot grade change at that location. It also makes the grade change much more manageable on the parking lot side. He said that for the record, they have 890 first floor finish elevation for building number two, and then 861 is their first floor finish elevation for building number one.

Ms. Bitar asked if that leaves enough height in the garage level for any sort of truck. Mr. Yoder said he discussed that with Mr. Quackenbush and he said he could make that elevation number work. Mr. Yoder said that the garage finish floor elevation will lower from 881 to 879.

Ms. Bitar asked about the right-of-way in front of building number one. Mr. Yoder said in the spirit of cooperation with the City and in anticipation of reaching a TIF Agreement, they would be happy to deed that over to the City.

Mr. Hermann asked about the landscaping on building number two. He said there is a hedge that runs in front of the park that goes to the bollard entrance on the east side, and he feels that should continue as a screening hedge on the west side to screen that last row of parking on the south side of the lawn. Mr. Yoder asked to see the slide showing the dog park, and said he understood what Mr. Hermann was talking about.

Ms. Bitar said with subdivisions, sidewalks are required at every right-of-way. Because the shops parcel is part of the subdivision, a variance will be needed unless they are going to require a sidewalk all along Old Wilson Bridge Road and all along High Street around the mall parcel. She said there are a lot of trees on Old Wilson Bridge Road, and a lot of landscaping along High Street. Ms. Bitar said they have discussed continuing the bike path along Old Wilson Bridge Rd. and the east side of the mall parcel, with the possibility to connect to the corner through the Chase property.

Mr. Hermann asked if the bike path would be on the south side, and if they should have the bike path there instead of a sidewalk. Ms. Bitar said it should be left that way for now, that sharrows are being considered for that stretch. She said it could get approved this way for now.

Mr. Hermann thanked Mr. Yoder for looking at the grades. There were no other questions from the Board. Mr. Hunter asked the audience if there was anyone else that wanted to speak either for or against this application. A few people raised their hands.

The first speaker was Ms. Joanna Kralian and she said her address is 245 St. Antoine St., Worthington, Ohio. Ms. Kralian asked Mr. Yoder to extend the sidewalk from the top of the street all down. Secondly, she asked if this new community would be a non-smoking community. Ms. Kralian then read from a drafted letter. She said she would like to comment on the current proposal to develop the former James Tavern site on Wilson Bridge Road. She is wondering how this project will set the standard and define the vision for the future. She asked

if everything has been done to make this a future landmark that Worthington residents can look at with pride. Worthington wants sustainability and to become greener. What attributes are incorporated into the design and functionality of these buildings to encourage and promote those ideas? She asked if the project is going to end up being a good neighbor to the community and environment. She asked if any of the green building practices or LEED policies are utilized in the design, and if a green roof was considered. She said she recently heard from Megan Welsh who is the Green Roof Program Coordinator at Ohio State University, and a Certified Green Roof Professional. Ms. Welsh gave Ms. Kralian six points to discuss with the developer, including storm water management. Starting this year the EPA has increased the regulations to be met for storm water management. Since the building owner will have to manage the storm water runoff one way or another, developers are starting to use green rooftops as a two in one benefit. Additionally the City of Columbus offers a green infrastructure credit up to 80% of the storm water fee to commercial building owners who implement green rooftops or other green methods of keeping the storm water on site. There are other opportunities and incentives for loans and credits depending on partners on the project. If the City or another government is involved the ODOD offers low interest loans as incentives for alternative storm water use.

Property value increases and rents go up when sustainable architecture is implemented, especially visible amenities such as a green roof. She said Ms. Welsh listed a few other things. She discussed carbon offsets, and mentioned that Walgreen is implementing a new program where they are putting in solar panels in their new building in Evanston, Illinois. If this is successful, the company will start retrofitting all of their buildings. They will actually generate more electricity than they will use. It is a consciousness that is being raised, you cannot just continue with business as usual. Small increments make a difference.

Ms. Kralian said she also wondered if FLOW, Friends of the Lower Olentangy Watershed, were consulted for input in calculating the amount and volume of storm water runoff and ways this could be managed to have a positive impact on the Olentangy River. Amy Dutt, owner of Urban Wild, and an Engineering Consultant with FLOW, explained to Ms. Kralian that while the site is out of the special permit area, Ohio has a General Construction Permit, under National Pollution Discharge Elimination System (or NPDES) that covers storm water discharge from a new or re-development. She explained that erosion and post-construction runoff can be mitigated. Ms. Kralian said the City of Upper Arlington used parking lot infiltration for its Kingsdale Shopping Center Redevelopment. She said it is important to incorporate as much of the advancements of technology as possible, and have the understanding of the absolute interconnectivity of our actions to our environment.

Ms. Kralian asked if there is an obligation to make decisions based on information that will be of the best benefit to the community in as many aspects as possible. She urged the Board to think about the impact a six story building will have on that site. To think about the amount of water being consumed by 200+ toilets, 200+ washing machines, and how much pollution 200+ autos will add to Wilson Bridge Road. Ms. Kralian said everyone knows progress is going to come, and the land will be developed and things will change, but she urged the Board to set a higher standard of sustainability than what has been presented so far.

The next speaker was Ms. Gina Connor. Ms. Conner stated her address is 226 St. Pierre St., Worthington, Ohio. Ms. Conner said she could not tell from the plans that the new development

will be very pedestrian friendly. She felt that it is very important to have a sidewalk that will go all the way up to the mall.

Mr. Hermann said that there is a sidewalk on Corporate Hill Drive, but he would like to see a sidewalk on Wilson Bridge Road too.

Ms. Connor asked how far back this building will sit back from Wilson Bridge Road. Ms. Bitar said the building will be 50 feet from the right-of-way, and they are asking the developer to give some of the property in the front as right-of way, so that is why a variance is required.

Ms. Connor asked how far back Insight Bank is, and Ms. Bitar said quite a bit further. Mr. Hunter said the front line of this building is roughly two parking places deep into the flat area of Insight Bank parking lot. Ms. Connor feels the building will still stick out quite a bit. Ms. Bitar said that landscaping has been proposed, plus a patio area that will have landscaping around it, a sidewalk, and street trees between the sidewalk and the curb which will help soften the view. She is concerned that the building sits too close to Wilson Bridge Road as if it is the Wall of China.

Mr. Coulter said what is not reflected in the drawings are the trees that are going to be planted along Wilson Bridge Road to help soften the edge. He said that he agrees with her concerns.

She asked if the three lane road that feeds into the area will be changed at all. It currently has one lane going in and two lanes going out. Mr. Hunter asked if she meant Corporate Hill Drive, and Ms. Connor said yes. Mr. Hunter said that area is private property and will not be changing for now. That area belongs to the owners of 300 W. Wilson Bridge Road.

Mr. Coulter asked Mr. Yoder if he was pursuing LEED Certification. Mr. Yoder said no, not at this time. He just heard this evening that there is a grant available from the City of Worthington. If the grant can offset the cost of registration and the professional engineering fees they would incur, they may apply. He said they would have to prepare a LEED scorecard after preparing an analysis and see where they are at. He feels they would be able to pick up a lot of sustainable site credits.

Mr. Coulter said building materials that are common in the market today are LEED stickered. Whether or not they go for LEED Certification or not, it is more common that the materials that are purchased are LEED credited.

Mr. Yoder said that they have the Ohio EPA requirements and they are stricter than LEED so they will be managing storm water quality and quantity.

There were no other speakers.

Findings of fact:

1. Overview:

The applicant is proposing development of the former James Tavern site and construction of a smaller building in the west Shops parking lot. The former James Tavern parcel is not in the Architectural Review District, but description is included for review of the project as a whole, and for information for the Conditional Use Permit, Amendment to Development Plan, and Subdivision applications pertaining to this project.

2. Site Plan & Parking:

The building (Building One) proposed on the former James Tavern site would cover much of the site, taking the shape of the five sided parcel. The front of the building would extend to about 30' from the new Wilson Bridge Rd. right-of-way line. The right-of-way is increasing by 20' across the property to encompass the proposed sidewalk. A front patio area will extend about 25' beyond the front of the building. The sides of the building will be 12' – 15' from the property lines.

The building is proposed with 11,660 square feet of office space on each of the first two floors of the building, along the Wilson Bridge Rd. frontage. Parking decks are proposed behind the offices on both levels. The first level parking would serve the offices and some residential, with the main access from Corporate Hill Dr. The second deck would be parking for the apartments only, with gated access. Travel between the decks by motor vehicle would not be possible.

A four-story apartment building (Building Two) is proposed on the west side of the Shops. Secured surface parking is proposed west of the building, and a parking deck is proposed beneath the building. The site plan shows a bay of parking between Building Two and the Shops. A subdivision to create a separate parcel which incorporates both buildings is proposed.

Several parking studies have been completed, with the results showing sufficient parking is proposed for the apartment/office site, and the existing shops businesses.

3. Traffic:

The results of a traffic study of the entire area, including the Shops and outparcels, existing and proposed residential, and existing and future office buildings along Old Wilson Bridge Rd. and W. Wilson Bridge Rd. have been submitted. The conclusion is the proposed development will have a negligible effect on existing traffic. An additional conclusion is that outbound left turn movements onto Wilson Bridge Rd. from Old Wilson Bridge Rd. currently operate at a poor level of service.

4. Landscaping:

Landscape/hardscape plans include creation of an entry plaza in front of Building One; streetscape design in the mall parking lot and along Corporate Hill Dr.; and a dog park on the north side of Building Two. Pedestrian connections are proposed throughout.

5. Buildings:

Building One:

Building One is proposed as five stories in the front part of the building, and six to the rear. Residential units and the two amenity decks would start on the third floor above the office space and parking decks. On the third floor, fitness and community rooms are proposed along with residential units. The total apartment count is 144 for the building. A plan is included that would allow two-story townhome conversions if desired in the future.

One amenity deck is proposed with a pool and faces west/northwest. The other deck is in the front part of the building in the interior, and the details will be provided. Balconies are proposed for most of the units, and would either face out from the building or overlook an amenity deck.

The building is proposed with a flat roof and parapet with trim. The first two levels would include aluminum storefronts with thin masonry veneer resembling limestone between the windows. The main entry is proposed to include an arched window. For the apartments, proposed is a mixture of brick veneer; fiber cement paneling and trim; and metal rails and coping. The windows and doors are proposed to be aluminum-clad wood windows, with interior muntins. Further review of windows will be needed. The first level of the parking deck will have an aluminum rail, and the second a patterned brick veneer. The same brick pattern is proposed between apartment windows on the third and fourth floors.

Building Two:

Building Two is proposed as a four story building plus a parking deck with 45 spaces below. A total of 59 apartments are proposed. A community room is proposed on the first floor, and a roof-top deck is also proposed. In addition, these residents would have access to the amenities in Building One. Balconies are proposed for every unit.

Building Two also is proposed with a flat roof, but is broken up with different levels. The facades are broken up with a mixture of brick and paneled sections. Design elements are similar to those on Building One, but do not match exactly.

Conclusions:

1. Construction of multi-family housing at this location is consistent with the Wilson Bridge Rd. Corridor Study, which calls for a mix of housing and office/commercial at this location.
2. Placement of residential in the underutilized parking lot on the west side of the Shops is appropriate. Use of the James Tavern parcel for a mixture of office and residential is appropriate.
3. Long-term viability of this project is important to the City. Design and materials work toward that end, with some details needing further review.

Mr. Coulter moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY M&A ARCHITECTS, INC. FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO CONSTRUCT NEW RESIDENTIAL BUILDINGS AT 7227 N. HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 110-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 110-12, DATED MARCH 8, 2013, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING WITH THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS:

- DECK AROUND AMENITY DECK TO HAVE A FENCE
- FENCING AROUND TRANSFORMER VAULTS
- THAT BOTH BUILDINGS WILL BE BUILT IN THE SAME TIME FRAME
- SIDEWALK ON BOTH OLD AND NEW WILSON BRIDGE ROAD WILL BE CONSTRUCTED
- LIGHTING DETAILS, EXTERIOR BIKE RACKS, PUBLIC SPACE AMENITIES, ANY CHANGE TO EXTERIOR DESIGN AND MATERIALS, AND INTERIOR CONCEPTUAL DRAWINGS MUST BE PRESENTED IN THE FUTURE
- LANDSCAPE SCREENING ON OLD WILSON BRIDGE ROAD FOR PARKING TO BE EXTENDED
- SCREENING AT ROOFTOP UNITS TO BE SUBMITTED IF NECESSARY
- WINDOWS TO BE EXCLUDED, AND REVIEWED IN THE FUTURE

Mr. Hermann seconded the motion. Ms. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

C. Municipal Planning Commission

1. Conditional Use Permit – Unfinished Business

- a. Residential Uses in C-2 Zoning District – **7227 N. High St. and 160 W. Wilson Bridge Rd.** (M&A Architects/The Shops at Worthington Place) CU 09-12

Findings of fact:

1. This application is a request to have residential uses in the C-2 Zoning District. The facts and conclusions in agenda item B.2.a, including the motion amendments, should also be used for evaluation, as many of the review factors for Conditional Use are the same for Architectural Review.
2. The Wilson Bridge Rd. Study encouraged a mixed of retail, office and residential on this site.

Conclusions:

1. This development will effect traffic patterns due to the building placement in the way of traffic that currently flows on The Shops private property.
2. The Engineering Department will evaluate the adequacy of the utilities, including sanitary sewer, to the site.
2. Shielding, screening, appearance and compatibly with the neighborhood is being addressed with landscaping and site design.

Mr. Hermann moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY M&A ARCHITECTS, INC. FOR APPROVAL OF A CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT TO ALLOW RESIDENTIAL USES IN THE C-2 ZONING DISTRICT AS PER CASE NO. CU 09-12, DRAWINGS NO. CU 09-12, DATED MARCH 8, 2013, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. Ms. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; and Mr. Coulter, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

2. Amendment to Development Plan – Unfinished Business
 - a. New Residential Buildings - **7227 N. High St. and 160 W. Wilson Bridge Rd. (M&A Architects/The Shops at Worthington Place) ADP 11-12**

Findings of fact:

1. In addition to information in agenda items B.1.a and C.1.a, including the motion amendments, required variances are outlined in the exhibit from M+A Architects that was included in the packet. Additionally, a variance for front yard setback is required.

Mr. Coulter moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY M&A ARCHITECTS, INC. FOR APPROVAL TO AMEND THE DEVELOPMENT PLAN AT 7227 N. HIGH ST. BY CONSTRUCTING NEW RESIDENTIAL BUILDINGS AS PER CASE NO. ADP 11-12, DRAWINGS NO. ADP 11-12, DATED MARCH 8, 2012, BE RECOMMENDED TO CITY COUNCIL FOR APPROVAL BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. Ms. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; and Mr. Coulter, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

3. Subdivision – Unfinished Business
 - a. Preliminary Plat – **7227 N. High St. and 160 W. Wilson Bridge Rd. (M&A Architects/**

The Shops at Worthington Place) SUB 03-12

Findings of fact:

1. The proposed subdivision divides off a portion of the west parking lot of The Shops, and combines it with the former James Tavern property. The total acreage of the combined parcel is 2.714 acres.

Conclusion:

1. While the resultant parcel is irregular in shape, it meets the dimensional requirements for the C-2 Zoning District.

Mr. Hermann moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY M&A ARCHITECTS, INC. FOR APPROVAL OF A PRELIMINARY PLAT TO DIVIDE THE PROPERTY AT 7227 N. HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. SUB 03-12, DRAWINGS NO. SUB 03-12, DATED MARCH 8, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Ms. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; and Mr. Coulter, nay. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.