February 8, 2013

To: Members of the Municipal Planning Commission
Members of the Architectural Review Board

From: Lynda Bitar, Development Coordinator

Subject: Staff Memo for the Meeting of February 14, 2013

B. Architectural Review Board

1. Unfinished

a. New Residential Buildings – **7227 N. High St.** (M&A Architects/The Shops at Worthington Place) **AR 110-12**

Findings of fact:

1. Overview:

The last time the ARB/MPC saw this application, the applicant was proposing the construction of 150 multi-family residential units on the west and north sides of the Shops at Worthington Place property. Three buildings were proposed: one five-story building in the west parking lot of the Shops; and two buildings along Old Wilson Bridge Rd. with three-story townhouses. As the mall has become more successful, the owners have had concerns with the elimination of parking on the north and west sides of the building. With that in mind, the developers are now proposing development of the former James Tavern site and construction of a smaller building in the west Shops parking lot. The former James Tavern parcel is not in the Architectural Review District, but description is included for review of the project as a whole, and for information for the MPC items pertaining to this project.

2. Site Plan & Parking:

The building (Building One) proposed on the former James Tavern site would cover much of the site, taking the shape of the five sided parcel. The front would extend to the 30' setback line from the Wilson Bridge Rd. right-of-way, and the sides would have smaller setbacks which are not dimensioned.

The building is proposed with 11,220 square feet of office space on the first two floors of the building, along the Wilson Bridge Rd. frontage. Parking decks are proposed behind the offices on both levels. The first level parking would serve the offices and some residential, with the main access from Corporate Hill Dr. and the potential for a second connection to the Insight Bank parking lot. The second deck would be for parking for apartments only, with

gated access from the Shops property. Travel between the decks by motor vehicle would not be possible.

A four-story apartment building (Building Two) is proposed on the west side of the Shops. Secured surface parking is proposed west of the building, and a parking deck is proposed beneath the building. The site plan shows a bay of angled parking between Building Two and the Shops. Subdivision of a parcel surrounding Building Two, including a small connection to the Building One parcel, is proposed.

The parking analysis for the site is being revised and is expected next week.

3. Traffic:

   A traffic study of the entire area, including the Shops and outparcels, existing and proposed residential, and existing and future office buildings along Old Wilson Bridge Rd. and W. Wilson Bridge Rd. has been requested.

4. Landscaping:

   A preliminary landscaping plan is included in the packet.

5. Buildings:

   <u>Building One</u>:

   Building One is proposed as five stories in the front part of the building, and six to the rear. Residential units and the two amenity decks would start on the third floor above the office space and parking decks. On the third floor, fitness and community rooms are proposed to accompany 18 one-bedroom and 19 two-bedroom units. The fourth and fifth floors would have 1 studio, 10 one-bedroom and 20 two-bedroom units each. Residential units would begin on the sixth floor behind the front portion of the building (devoted to office below). A roof deck is proposed for part of that roof area. The unit count for the sixth floor would be 1 studio, 16 one-bedroom and 13 two-bedroom units. The proposed apartment count for Building One is 3 studio, 72 one-bedroom and 72 two-bedroom, or 147 units.

   One amenity deck is proposed with a pool and faces west/northwest. The other deck is in the front part of the building in the interior, and has not been described. Balconies are proposed for most of the units, and would either face out or overlook an amenity deck.

   The building is proposed with a flat roof and parapet with trim. The first two levels would include aluminum storefronts with thin masonry veneer resembling limestone between the windows. The main entry is proposed to include an arched window. For the apartments, a mixture of thin brick veneer, fiber cement paneling and trim, and stucco are proposed. The details for the sides of the parking decks need clarified. Divided light windows are proposed throughout; catalogue cuts for windows and doors are needed.

Building Two:

Building Two is proposed as a four story building plus a parking deck with 44 spaces below. The first floor would have 5 one-bedroom and 9 two-bedroom units; and the second, third and fourth floors would have 6 one-bedroom and 9 two-bedroom units, for a total of 59 apartments. A community room is proposed on the first floor, and a roof-top deck is also proposed. In addition, these residents would have access to the amenities in Building One. Balconies are proposed for every unit.

Building Two also is proposed with a flat roof, but is broken up with different levels. The facades are broken up with a mixture of brick and paneled sections. Design elements are similar to those on Building One, but do not match exactly.

Conclusions:

1. Construction of multi-family housing at this location is consistent with the Wilson Bridge Rd. Corridor Study, which calls for a mix of housing and office/commercial at this location.

2. Placement of residential in the underutilized parking lot on the west side of the Shops is appropriate. Use of the James Tavern parcel for a mixture of office and residential is appropriate.

3. Proposed parking is sufficient. Bicycle parking should be considered.

4. Additional detail about landscape material is needed. A public sidewalk and additional public space amenities should be considered along Wilson Bridge Rd.

5. Long-term viability of this project is very important to the City. Design and materials should work toward that end. More detail will help with that evaluation.

The following motion should be utilized after all information has been evaluated:

THAT THE REQUEST BY M&A ARCHITECTS, INC. FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO CONSTRUCT NEW RESIDENTIAL BUILDINGS AT 7227 N. HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 110-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 110-12, DATED FEBRUARY 1, 2013, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

2. New

a. Alterations – **140 W. New England Ave.** (Sean Kocheran/Cooke) **AR 06-13**

Findings of fact:

1. The applicant is proposing changes to an existing sunroom on the north side of the house, and future replacement of windows and siding for the entire house.

2. The sunroom currently has storm windows with aluminum lap siding below. Aluminum clad wood double-hung windows are proposed. The windows will span the east side as they do now, with a door at the southern end. Four new windows are proposed on the west side. On the north elevation, two windows are proposed at the corners to allow room for an interior gas fireplace with a mantel. A vent is proposed in the middle of the wall.

   A 3' x 5' addition is proposed on the west side that will realign the western sunroom entry to face north, and create an opportunity for a mudroom on the interior.

   Two versions of siding are proposed, board and batten and horizontal lap, both of which would be a cementitious material. The majority of the house has aluminum lap siding, but the garage has board and batten. Both versions are included in the packet, but the homeowner prefers the board and batten.

3. The homeowner would like to replace the other windows in the house with windows to match those proposed for the sunroom. All windows will be divided light to match the existing except those on the rear of the home. Also, replacement of the siding with a cementitious product is proposed.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed changes are appropriate.

Approval of the following motion is recommended:

THAT THE REQUEST BY SEAN KOCHERAN TO MAKE ALTERATIONS AT 140 W. NEW ENGLAND AVE AS PER CASE NO. AR 06-13, DRAWINGS NO. AR 06-13, DATED JANUARY 31, 2013, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

b. Addition – **5750 N. High St.** (St. Michael Catholic Church) **AR 08-13** (Extension of COA #AR 23-11)

This is a request to extend the approved Certificate of Appropriateness for construction of an addition at St. Michael Catholic Church. The addition was originally approved on March 24, 2011, and the approval was good for 18 months. The proposal is still as approved, with the following findings of fact and conclusions as the basis for the previous approval:

Findings of fact:

1. An 8600 square foot addition is proposed for the northwest corner of the church. The addition will include a ground floor level, and a lower level, and will house a number of uses, including the church offices.

2. The addition has been designed to match the church in style and materials, to include red brick with stone accents, copper gutters and downspouts and aluminum clad wood windows. Standing seam metal is proposed for a small gable on the front of the addition, and the sloped roof above windows on the south side of the oratory. Dimensional asphalt shingles are proposed for the rest of the roof, except the inside area to house mechanicals will be membrane. Skylights are proposed at the ridge of the oratory roof. Black metal rails are proposed at the stairs entering the building. Material samples have been submitted.

3. The landscape plan identifies shrubs, perennials and trees to be planted. Three existing trees are proposed for relocation. Pavers are proposed between the addition and the existing rectory and a new sidewalk will be constructed along the north and west sides of the new structure.

4. A brick enclosure will be constructed for the dumpster on the north side of the parking lot, near the church.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed addition is appropriate.

Approval of the following motion is recommended:

THAT THE REQUEST BY CHRISTOPHER MEYERS, AIA TO EXTEND THE APPROVAL OF CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS NO. AR 23-11 BY ALLOWING CONSTRUCTION OF AN ADDITION AT 5750 N. HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 08-13, DRAWINGS NO. AR 08-13, DATED FEBRUARY 5, 2013, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

C. Municipal Planning Commission

1. **Conditional Use Permit** – Unfinished Business

a. Residential Uses in C-2 Zoning District – **7227 N. High St. and 160 W. Wilson Bridge Rd.** (M&A Architects/The Shops at Worthington Place) **CU 09-12**

Findings of fact:

1. This application is a request to have residential uses in the C-2 Zoning District. The facts and conclusions in agenda item B.1.a should also be used for evaluation, as many of the review factors for Conditional Use are the same for Architectural Review.

2. The Wilson Bridge Rd. Study encouraged a mixed of retail, office and residential on this site.

3. The existing sewerage and public facilities are sufficient to accommodate the proposed development.

4. The effect on traffic pattern has not been identified, but should become clearer with the traffic study.

5. Hours of use should be typical for dwelling units.

6. Shielding, screening, appearance and compatibly with the neighborhood must be reviewed.

The following motion should be utilized after all information has been evaluated:

THAT THE REQUEST BY M&A ARCHITECTS, INC. FOR APPROVAL OF A CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT TO ALLOW RESIDENTIAL USES IN THE C-2 ZONING DISTRICT AS PER CASE NO. CU 09-12, DRAWINGS NO. CU 09-12, DATED OCTOBER 26, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

2. **Amendment to Development Plan –** Unfinished Business

a. New Residential Buildings – **7227 N. High St. and 160 W. Wilson Bridge Rd** (M&A Architects/The Shops at Worthington Place) **ADP 11-12**

Findings of fact:

1. In addition to information in agenda items B.1.a and C.1.a, variances will be needed for setback, building height and tract coverage. There may be other variances required for this development that have not yet been identified.

The following motion should be utilized after all information has been evaluated:

THAT THE REQUEST BY M&A ARCHITECTS, INC. FOR APPROVAL TO AMEND THE DEVELOPMENT PLAN AT 7227 N. HIGH ST. BY CONSTRUCTING NEW RESIDENTIAL BUILDINGS AS PER CASE NO. ADP 11-12, DRAWINGS NO. ADP 11-12, DATED OCTOBER 12, 2012, BE RECOMMENDED TO CITY COUNCIL FOR APPROVAL BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

3. **Subdivision** – Unfinished Business

a. Preliminary Plat – **7227 N. High St. and 160 W. Wilson Bridge Rd.** (M&A Architects/The Shops at Worthington Place) **SUB 03-12**

As of the writing of this memo, the preliminary plat had not been submitted. It will be forwarded when received. Part of the subdivision approval will be the decision of whether or not to recapture the created parcel into the Architectural Review District. It appears the parcel for Building Two will be less than 1 acre, so it would not be subject to Development Plan approval once split, making Architectural Review the only tool available for ongoing review.

The following motion should be utilized after all information has been evaluated:

THAT THE REQUEST BY M&A ARCHITECTS, INC. FOR APPROVAL OF A PRELIMINARY PLAT TO DIVIDE THE PROPERTY AT 7227 N. HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. SUB 03-12, DRAWINGS NO. SUB 03-12, DATED OCTOBER 12, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.