

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING
WORTHINGTON ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
WORTHINGTON MUNICIPAL PLANNING COMMISSION

September 27, 2012

The regular meeting of the Worthington Architectural Review Board and the Worthington Municipal Planning Commission was called to order at 7:30 p.m. with the following members present: Richard Hunter, Chair; James Sauer, Vice Chair; Kathy Holcombe, Secretary arrived at 7:38 p.m.; Mikel Coulter; Amy Lloyd and Jo Rodgers. Also present were: Scott Myers, Worthington City Council Representative for the Municipal Planning Commission; Lynda Bitar, Development Coordinator and Clerk of the Municipal Planning Commission. Board member Chris Hermann, and Paralegal, Melissa Cohan were absent.

A. Call to Order – 7:30 p.m.

1. Roll Call
2. Pledge of Allegiance
3. Approval of the minutes of the meetings of September 13, 2012.

Mr. Coulter moved to approve the minutes, and Mrs. Rodgers seconded the motion. All members said “aye”.

4. Affirmation/swearing in of witnesses

B. Architectural Review Board

1. New

- a. Satellite Dish – **679-C High St.** (Worthington Investment Group, LLC) **AR 88-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application and showed photographs of the proposed location. Mr. Hunter asked for the applicant and Mr. Jim Uhlman, 2399 Collins Dr., Worthington, Ohio, approached the microphone. Mr. Hunter asked about an opening date, and Mr. Uhlman said they are hoping to open by the end of October. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. The proposed satellite dish is for the pub at 679-C High St., which is proposed to open in October.

2. Placement will be on the north side of a low gable roof at the back of the building.

Conclusion:

1. Visibility of the dish will be limited, which is the goal for this type of equipment.

Mr. Sauer moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY WORTHINGTON INVESTMENT GROUP, LLC FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO ADD A SATELLITE DISH AT 679-C HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 88-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 88-12, DATED SEPTEMBER 5, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Rodgers seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

b. Window Changes – **51 W. Short St. (Paulette March) AR 89-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Ms. Paulette March approached the microphone and stated she lives at 51 W. Short St., Worthington, Ohio. Ms. March said they are adding an octagon to add interest to the front of the house and add light to the bathroom. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and on one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. As part of a bathroom remodeling project, the homeowner would like to remove a window from a dormer on the west side of the house; and install an octagonal window on the front of the dormer.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed changes are appropriate for this house.

Mr. Sauer moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY PAULETTE MARCH FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO ALTER WINDOWS AT 51 W. SHORT ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 89-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 89-12, DATED SEPTEMBER 6, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Holcome seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

c. Condensing Unit – **107 W. Stafford Ave.** (Wolfe & Sons HVAC/Narazaki) **AR 90-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Timothy Wolfe approached the microphone and stated he is representing 107 W. Stafford Ave., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Wolfe said you cannot really see the unit from the road, and it is quiet. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. Previously window changes were approved as part of an attic remodeling project. The addition of a condensing unit was not considered at the time.
2. This request is for approval for a new condensing unit located on the west side of the house. Other units are in the same location, which is screened from view by vegetation.

Conclusion:

1. The addition of a condensing unit is appropriate in that location.

Mrs. Rodgers moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY WOLFE & SONS HVAC FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO INSTALL A CONDENSING UNIT AT 107 W. STAFFORD AVE. AS PER CASE NO. AR 90-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 90-12, DATED SEPTEMBER 7, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Lloyd seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

d. Roof Replacement – **139 W. South St.** (Kathleen McElwee) **AR 91-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Ms. Kathleen McElwee approached the microphone and stated her address is 139 W. South St., Worthington, Ohio. Ms. McElwee assured the Board members that all roof surfaces, including the garage and shed, would be replaced with matching shingles. Mr. Hunter asked if

there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. New black dimensional shingles are proposed for this roof, which is currently gray in color.
2. There is no indication if the extent of the project also includes the garage.

Conclusion:

1. The proposed shingle replacement is appropriate.

Mrs. Holcombe moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY KATHLEEN MCELWEE FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO REPLACE THE ROOF AT 139 W. SOUTH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 91-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 91-12, DATED SEPTEMBER 10, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Rodgers seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

e. Front Porch Modification – **124 W. North St.** (Gary Moore) **AR 92-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Moore approached the microphone and stated his address is 123 W. New England Ave., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Sauer asked if the steps are existing, and Mr. Moore said yes, the existing steps will stay. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. This proposal involves replacing existing wrought iron columns on the front porch with wood columns, and adding a cornice above the porch.
2. The brick stoop will remain.

Conclusion:

1. The change is appropriate.

Mrs. Rodgers moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY GARY MOORE FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO MODIFY THE FRONT PORCH AT 124 W. NORTH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 92-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 92-12, DATED SEPTEMBER 10, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Sauer seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

f. Fence – **39 W. Stafford Ave.** (Ace Fence & Deck LLC/Stotts) **AR 93-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Rob Bruno of Ace Fence and Deck said he was representing 39 W. Stafford Ave., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Bruno talked about locations for removal of the chain link fence. Mr. Sauer asked for clarification of the proposal, and Mr. Bruno described the project. Mrs. Rodgers said the Board does not usually approve privacy fences between property lines. Mr. Stotts, 39 W. Stafford Ave. said the 6' fence on the east property line is replacing an existing fence. A neighbor pointed out the commercial property behind, and Mrs. Bitar talked about the view from the side of the parking lot. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone else present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. The applicant is requesting approval to remove a chain link fence and two portions of a solid fence at the rear of the property. Existing solid wood fencing will remain along the west side. On the south and east sides, a 6' high wood shadowbox fence is proposed.
2. This property is adjacent to the Griswold Center parking lot.

Conclusion:

1. Six foot high solid fences are appropriate for screening residential properties adjacent to commercial parking lots.

Mr. Sauer moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY ACE FENCE & DECK LLC FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO INSTALL NEW FENCING AT 39 W. STAFFORD AVE. AS PER CASE NO. AR 93-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 93-12, DATED SEPTEMBER 4, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

g. Fence – **41 W. North St.** (Joy & Mike Scholl) **AR 94-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. and Mrs. Scholl approached the microphone and stated their address is 41. W. North St., Worthington, Ohio 43085. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. The homeowners would like to install 6’ solid wood fencing across the rear of the property. The pickets are proposed to be dog-eared.
2. Location is proposed 4’ from the rear property line in order to save some mature trees.
3. The property is adjacent to parking for the strip center that includes Worthington Pizza a Subway.

Conclusion:

1. Six foot high solid fences are appropriate for screening residential properties adjacent to commercial parking lots.

Mrs. Rodgers moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY JOY & MIKE SCHOLL FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO INSTALL NEW FENCING AT 41 W. NORTH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 94-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 94-12, DATED SEPTEMBER 4, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Lloyd seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

h. Fence – **51 W. North St.** (Kevin Turner) **AR 98-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Turner approached the microphone and stated he lives at 51 W. North St., Worthington, Ohio. He thanked the Scholls for including him in the project. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. This homeowner's property is adjacent to the property in the previous application. He would like to add 4' of the same fencing, running from the end of the 41 W. North St. fence to the southeast corner of the property.
2. The property is adjacent to parking for the strip center that includes Worthington Pizza a Subway.

Conclusion:

1. Six foot high solid fences are appropriate for screening residential properties adjacent to commercial parking lots.

Mrs. Lloyd moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY KEVIN TURNER FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO INSTALL NEW FENCING AT 51 W. NORTH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 98-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 98-12, DATED SEPTEMBER 14, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Sauer seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

- i. Porch & Fence – 563 Morning St. (Gilbert & Stephanie Borlaza) AR 95-12

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Gilbert and Mrs. Stephanie Borlaza approached the microphone and stated they live at 563 Morning St., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Borlaza said the existing white fence will be replaced with the proposed black aluminum. He clarified placement of a gate on the south side. He also talked about installing a more substantial landing that meets the Building Code. Mr. Borlaza would like approval to use wood, or composite as shown in the application. Mr. Sauer asked about matching an existing second floor rail on the back of the house for the side porch rail. Mr. Borlaza said there was potential for that. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. This proposal includes construction of a new side porch, and installation of aluminum fencing.
2. Existing wood steps on the south side of the house are proposed for removal, to be replaced with a porch extending 4' from the house, with a landing and steps to the rear. The porch is proposed to be constructed with a fiber cement siding material for the landing, steps, and railing. The spindles on the railing are proposed as metal. The skirting will match the existing skirting on the front porch. The porch will be white, with natural wood color landing and step surfaces.
3. A 4' tall black aluminum picket fence is proposed to enclose a portion of the rear yard, extending from the house to the rear of the garage. Two gates are proposed.

Conclusion:

1. The side porch and fence are appropriate for this property.

Mrs. Holcombe moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY GILBERT AND STEPHANIE BORLAZA FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO CONSTRUCT A NEW PORCH AND INSTALL NEW FENCING AT 563 MORNING ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 95-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 95-12, DATED SEPTEMBER 13, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Lloyd seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

j. Projection Sign – **7227 N. High St., Space 118** (RGLA Solutions/Orvis) **AR 96-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application about the projection sign, and added information about the request to keep the brick unpainted. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Tom Carter, 7227 N. High St., and Ms. Sandi Leamon, 5100 River Rd., Suite 125, Schiller Park, IL approached the microphone. The decorative part of the sign was identified as a non-illuminated applied graphic to look like stained glass by Ms. Leamon. There was a discussion about the graphic proposed for the former mall door that is part of a dressing room.

Mr. Sauer asked about clarification of the proposed colors for the building trim. He said he likes the top band darker rather than a light color that would stand out. Mr. Carter said the light color matches trim on the south side of the building, but he felt they could go with a darker color to

differentiate the building. He also asked that the door graphic be given a try. Mr. Carter said Orvis is planning to open October 19th. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. Orvis was approved to have two wall signs: one above the entrance and one on the east side of the building. This request would add a projection sign at the south end of the storefront.
2. The proposed internally illuminated sign is 2' 6" wide and 5' 5" tall, with "ORVIS" in white lettering on a green opaque background. There is a flowery design proposed at the outside edge.
3. Also addressed in this application is vinyl covering for a glass door adjacent to the main mall entrance. The proposed covering is a landscape drawing. It does not meet the definition of a sign, so does not have to comply with the rule allowing signage covering only 25% of the window.
4. The applicant is proposing leaving the brick unpainted, and will paint the top trim piece in a darker color.

Conclusions:

1. The sign is appropriate.
2. The window covering is allowed, but may be revisited if it is a problem.
2. The changes to the building colors are acceptable.

Mr. Coulter moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY RGLA SOLUTIONS FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO INSTALL A PROJECTION SIGN AT 7227 N. HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 96-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 96-12, DATED SEPTEMBER 14, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING WITH THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS:

- **ALL RIGHT TO LEAVE BRICK UNPAINTED**
- **TOP TRIM TO BE DARKER (GOLDENROD), NOT WHITE**

Mr. Sauer seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

k. New Freestanding sign – **6641 N. High St.** (Sign-A-Rama Worthington) **AR 97-12**

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. Mr. Sauer asked for clarification of the colors. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. Dave Mayer approached the microphone and stated his address is 7282 Innisfree Ln. He presented a color sample, and described the base and cornice as off-white; the lettering as burgundy; and the background as beige. He said they will use the same base and ground mounted exterior illumination. Mr. Mayer said the letters and address will be dimensional. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application but no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. The freestanding sign for this property was damaged in a wind storm this summer. Approval of a replacement is requested with this application.
2. The proposed sign is similar in size (30 square feet in size per side) and style to the previous sign. The proposed colors are: sandy white for the base; beige to match the trim on the building for the cabinet; and burgundy for the top and lettering. A wreath on the previous version will not be replaced.

Conclusion:

1. The sign is complimentary to the building.

Mrs. Rodgers moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY SIGN-A-RAMA WORTHINGTON FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO INSTALL A SIGN AT 6641 N. HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 97-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 97-12, DATED SEPTEMBER 14, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Sauer seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

C. Municipal Planning Commission

1. Conditional Use

- a. Church in R-10 Zoning District – Gable Addition – **110 Park Blvd.** (John Weese/Community of Christ Church) CU 08-12

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. John Weese approached the microphone and stated his address is 110 Park Blvd., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Sauer asked about the color of the metal roof. Mr. Jim Clarker, 2433 Shillingham Ct., Powell, OH, the architect said it would either match the shingle roof or the patina of the steeple. Mr. Sauer asked if the church had been re-roofed recently, and Mr. Weese said about 10 years ago, and said they thought they could match the existing roof shingles. He also said this solution should help with leaking problems on the roof. Mr. Weese said they have already done major repair work, including moving the equipment off the roof.

Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. The Community of Christ Church would like to add gable roof structures over an existing flat roof at the rear of the building. The additional roof structure will have asphalt and metal roofing, and allow for easier maintenance.
2. The roof top mechanical units are proposed to be re-located to the ground behind the building, enclosed with a wood fence.
3. Variances will be required for the gable and mechanicals to be in the rear yard setback area.
4. The operation of the church will not change with this addition.

Conclusions:

1. There will be no effect on traffic patterns; public facilities; sewerage and drainage facilities; and utilities.
2. No safety or health considerations, or environmental hazards have been identified.
3. The changes seem compatible with the existing building and neighborhood.

Mrs. Holcombe moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY JOHN WEESE FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO CONSTRUCT A GABLE ADDITION AT 110 PARK BLVD. AS PER CASE NO. CU 08-12, DRAWINGS NO. CU 08-12, DATED SEPTEMBER 7, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Sauer seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; and Mr. Coulter, aye;

D. Other

Mr. Bill Whitlatch approached the microphone, saying he has lived in the community for 3 years, and is a retired City Planner. He spoke about the United Methodist Children's Home property as a fantastic, rare opportunity to plan for the next 100 years. He felt the City should be involved in the planning, as it was on Wilson Bridge Rd. Mr. Hunter talked about the planning work that had been done for the property as part of the Comprehensive Plan. Mr. Myers talked about the importance of the property, and his appreciation for all of the comments that have been received.

Mrs. Holcombe moved to adjourn the meeting. Mr. Coulter seconded the motion. All members said, "aye". The meeting adjourned at 9:01 p.m.