

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING
WORTHINGTON ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
WORTHINGTON MUNICIPAL PLANNING COMMISSION

March 8, 2012

The regular meeting of the Worthington Architectural Review Board and the Worthington Municipal Planning Commission was called to order at 7:30 p.m. with the following members present: Richard Hunter, Chair; James Sauer, Vice-Chair; Kathy Holcombe, Secretary; Chris Hermann; Mikel Coulter; Amy Lloyd; and Jo Rodgers. Also present were Lynda Bitar, Development Coordinator and Clerk of the Municipal Planning Commission and Melissa Cohan, Paralegal. Scott Myers, Worthington City Council Representative for the Municipal Planning Commission was absent.

A. Call to Order – 7:30 p.m.

1. Roll Call
2. Pledge of Allegiance
3. Approval of the minutes of the meetings of February 23, 2012.

Mr. Coulter moved to approve the minutes, and Mr. Sauer seconded the motion. All members said “aye” to approve the minutes.

4. Affirmation/swearing in of witnesses

B. Architectural Review Board

1. New

- a. Exterior Alterations and Additions – **700 E. Granville Rd.** (Architectural Alliance/Jack Maxton Chevrolet) AR 12-12

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application and showed drawings and photographs. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present.

Mr. John Oney approached the microphone and stated he lives at 587 Morning St., Worthington, Ohio, and has been a Worthington resident for thirty-nine years. Mr. Oney said the improvements will be done on the run down areas of the dealership and they will be using quality materials. He said the owners of the dealership were getting pressure from General Motors to move to a new location unless they invested up to one million dollars in improvements for the current location. The new entryways are part of General Motors branding.

Mr. Sauer asked Mr. Oney if the rest of the building will be painted white, and Mr. Oney said yes, most of the building will remain white, with dark silver trim. Mr. Sauer asked if there will be any improvements made to the other buildings on the site and Mr. Oney said not at this time, but General Motors is offering incentives to update at a later time.

Mr. Coulter asked if the new signs will be illuminated with LED lights. Mr. Oney said that the sign will be illuminated but he was not sure if LED lights would be used, he said he would check on that.

Mr. Sauer asked if the letters would project out from the building and be illuminated, and Mr. Oney said yes, the letters will project out and be backlit, and show up at night.

Mr. Hermann asked if the sign pole out in front of the building would be changing and Mr. Oney said no. Mr. Sauer asked if the mullions would be all white and Mr. Oney said no, they are clear aluminum and they will be staying.

Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. This request involves façade changes and several small additions to better accommodate customers.
2. On the front of the main building, the applicant is proposing to replace the roof railings and stucco with a silver aluminum solid fascia system with blue trim at the bottom. The same fascia, without the blue trim, is proposed for the “towers” and service area. Existing vertical elements will match.
3. A new 30’ wide x 22’ high aluminum structure is proposed for the main entry to the showroom, extending above the showroom roof. The color will be blue with silver trim around the door, and the structure is not illuminated.
4. A canopy is proposed for the west side of the building and will be constructed in the same silver material, which will serve as a cover for delivery of new cars.
5. To the rear of the service area, a 25’ x 6’ addition is proposed to extend the drop off area for customers. The material will match the existing on the building.
6. Three signs are proposed, each consisting of internally illuminate channel letters. Blue letters spelling “JACK MAXTON” are proposed at the bottom of the new fascia material west of the main entrance. Above the entrance, white individual letters spelling “CHEVROLET” and a gold logo are proposed. Finally, blue letters identifying “Certified Service” are proposed at the service entrance. The blue in the new signs is intended to match the blue proposed for the building. There is no indication the freestanding sign will change,

and it is not clear if the shades of blue are the same. Variances approved previously for number of wall signs and total area will be identified to determine if a new Board of Zoning Appeals application is needed.

7. The plans indicate the rest of the building will be painted a shade of white.

Conclusions:

1. The proposed treatment of the façade will be complimentary to the rest of the building and site.
2. The two small additions are in character with the rest of the building.
3. Proposed signage is similar to the existing. The blue shade used for signage should match the building blue.
4. The new main entry will be the most noticeable new element.

Mr. Sauer moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY ARCHITECTURAL ALLIANCE FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO ALTER THE BUILDING AT 700 E. GRANVILLE RD. AS PER CASE NO. AR 12-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 12-12, DATED FEBRUARY 22, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye; and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

- b. Generator – **515 High St.** (GW Engineering, Inc./Rutherford-Corbin Funeral Home)
AR 13-12

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application, and said it is typical of other generators that have been approved in the District. Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present.

Mr. Gary Wallace approached the microphone and stated his address is 7995 Storrow Rd., Westerville, Ohio 43081. Mr. Wallace said he was hired because of improper wiring. All of the service equipment is being removed and he is relocating and consolidating the services with the power company. Mr. Sauer stated the required testing time for generators is between 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m., Monday through Friday. Mr. Hunter asked if a permit was originally issued and Mrs. Bitar said no. Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak either for or against this application and no one came forward.

Findings of fact:

1. The applicant is requesting approval for a generator that was installed at the southwest corner of the funeral home.
2. The unit is mostly screened on the south and east sides by a brick retaining wall.
3. Testing of the unit will be Monday – Friday, between 8:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m.

Conclusion:

1. Placement of the generator is acceptable.

Mrs. Rodgers moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY GW ENGINEERING, INC. FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO RETAIN A GENERATOR AT 515 HIGH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 13-12, DRAWINGS NO. AR 13-12, DATED FEBRUARY 23, 2012, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING WITH THE CONDITION THAT THE TESTING FOR THE GENERATOR WILL TAKE PLACE BETWEEN 8:00 A.M. AND 5:00 P.M., MONDAY THROUGH FRIDAY.

Mr. Hermann seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Hunter, aye; Mr. Sauer, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Hermann, aye; Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Lloyd, aye; and Mrs. Rodgers, aye. Mr. Hunter said it has been approved.

C. Demolition and New Building – 640 High St. (Dewey's Pizza) AR 14-12

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the facts from the application. Mrs. Bitar said per the Design Guidelines, two stories are appropriate for this area and the design of new structures should take cues from other buildings in downtown. The applicant is proposing a one story building with parking in the back. Mrs. Bitar said the gasoline storage tanks have already been removed and a company is testing the soil now for contamination. The property was remediated not too long ago. The Masonic Lodge next door is concerned with the view of the Lodge building from the north, and sent e-mails to that effect. The lodge has recently fixed some needed repairs. Mrs. Bitar said there are approximately five or six feet between the lodge and the property line. The exact measurements are not available because the area has not been surveyed yet. The applicant would like hear what the community would like to see for the new location.

There have already been some discussions about parking and the applicant would like to have some restrictive parking signs such as the ones behind House Wine. The applicant plans to have a public area that anyone can use and the tables and chairs will be permanent structures. If the applicant plans to serve alcohol outside, the area would be fenced off, but there are no plans for

that at the present time. There have been some discussions about using the public area for the Farmer's Market and different hardscape options should be considered. The parking lot will also be somewhat screened from High St. No bike racks have been planned at this time, but the applicant is willing to put them in. Two of the curb cuts will be closed to help with circulation. The right-of-way is proposed to be filled with the same brick pavers already in the Central Business District. There is a grassy strip of land in the back that is owned by the lodge.

Mr. Sauer asked who the retaining wall belonged to. Mrs. Bitar said she believes it belongs to the station property.

Mr. Hunter asked if the applicant was present. Mr. David Hodge, an attorney from Smith & Hale approached the microphone and stated his address is 37 W. Broad Street, Columbus, Ohio. Mr. Hodge mentioned his client Dewey's is aware of the many competing interests such as the Architectural Review Board, the Worthington Historical Society, Sustainable Worthington, and the Old Worthington Business Association. He said he and his client have reviewed the Design Guidelines and have come up with a thoughtful site plan. Mr. Hodge said he researched the property when it was originally developed as a gas station in 1922 when the roads were first bricked. He said Standard Oil Company was the owner of the station. Mr. Hodge said his client would like to have some parking spaces with time limits such as across the street, and reserve spaces for carry out orders. He said they welcome the use of the open area for the Farmer's Market. Mr. Hodge introduced Mr. Andrew Dewitt, the owner of Dewey's.

Mr. Hunter asked Mr. DeWitt if he had a time table prepared, and Mr. DeWitt said he has a confident team of professionals and believes a four to six month build out would be possible after receiving approval.

Mr. Scot Rogers approached the microphone and stated he is Mr. DeWitt's architect and his address is 6730 Main St., Newtown, Ohio. Mr. Rogers said he felt a two story building would block the view of the Masonic Lodge, so the one story works better for the site.

Mr. Hunter said each of the board members had questions for the owner, Mr. DeWitt. Mrs. Rogers was the first to speak. Mrs. Rogers said it was a great start. She appreciated the time he took to research the design standards and she is excited to have the new restaurant in town. She would like to see the lighting match the style of the historic area, the softer tone. She also liked the brick. Mrs. Rogers felt the design was a little more enhanced than the nearby buildings and asked where the architect got his ideas from. Mr. Rogers said the design is not as complicated as she might think and discussed a few more details. Mr. DeWitt said they were trying to make the building look like it had been there for a while and to blend in.

Mrs. Lloyd asked if the other Dewey's Pizza restaurants looked similar to the one proposed for Worthington. Mr. Rogers said the brick work is common but they do not have brand guidelines. They are open to ideas and willing to explore styles that would fit in to the community. Mrs. Lloyd said she likes the redevelopment of this corner and the open plaza that the community can use. She said she has struggled with the placement of the building on this site. She said she is concerned about the façade, but likes the concepts.

Mr. Coulter suggested the dumpster be rotated forty five degrees so it will be easier to empty. He also felt it was more appropriate to use brick pavement and liked the outdoor seating. Mr. Coulter agreed that a one story building would work better at this location. He said the restaurant and plaza are a destination, a place people will want to come to. He said he also liked the brick and the hardiplank siding. He said he did not see a down side to this project. Mr. Coulter said he would like to know the heights of the roof top equipment, and strongly suggested using soft LED for the lighting.

Mr. Hermann said he likes the details with the brick design. He said to keep an open mind in the event the lot behind theirs was sold, and also about the potential to add on to the building in the future. Mr. Hermann also said he liked the idea of framing the corner, and suggested running the pergola along the corner of the property. He asked if the architect would consider outdoor restaurant seating along High Street between the building and the sidewalk. He also suggested using garage or folding-style doors that would allow them to be opened up in nice weather, similar to what Marcella's has done in the Short North. Mr. Hermann said it is important to provide enough parking, bike parking, and pedestrian seating and strolling space is important to the success and attractiveness of the entire area. Mr. DeWitt agreed with Mr. Hermann and said it is a very iconic corner.

Mrs. Holcombe said when she heard Dewey's Pizza was coming to Worthington she went to the Grandview location so she could try the pizza and said it was excellent. She felt the hardiplank in the back could use a little more fine tuning, but loves the arbor with wisteria.

Mr. Sauer said he agrees with the other comments. He asked if there is a bus stop at that location and Mrs. Bitar said yes, and the bus stop will remain. Mr. Sauer discussed the grade change and suggested using a brick base all the way around the building under the Hardieplank. Mr. DeWitt asked if the City maintains the trees, and Mrs. Bitar said only those in the right-of-way. Mr. Sauer asked where they would be hiding the equipment, and that it is important for it not to be seen. Mr. Rogers said the mechanicals would be on the top of the building. Mr. Sauer mentioned the parking lot lights should not overwhelm the plaza area.

Mr. Hunter said there should be zero light at the lot lines, and he would also like to see what is proposed for outdoor seating. Mr. DeWitt asked if this process is to be approved in phases and Mr. Hunter said no, the board members like to see the whole project. Mr. Hunter said he would like to see the lights lowered to match the plaza area, and he liked Mr. Hermann's idea about the perimeter pergola. Mr. Hunter said he applauded Mr. DeWitt for creating a pocket park and that it would be nice to see bike racks installed.

Mr. Hunter asked if there was anyone present that wanted to speak about this matter and Ms. Amber Decker approached the microphone and stated her address is 583 Hartford Ave., Worthington, Ohio. Mrs. Decker said she and her family are super excited to have a family style restaurant moving into the area, and she would also like to see a fenced in area so people could sit outside and have a drink. Mrs. Decker also asked to keep the lighting as low as possible in the lot so it would not spill over into the neighboring properties.

Mr. Fred Yaeger approached the microphone and stated his address is 285 Bryant Ave., Worthington, Ohio. Mr. Yaeger said he thinks Dewey's is going to be very cool. He applauds that Mr. DeWitt is a community player and that he seems to be passionate about sustainability. He likes reserving space for community events and happy that bike racks will be installed. Mr. Yaeger said he did not hear anyone ask about the mitigation of storm water and asked if a small rain garden and/or pervious pavement could be installed because the corner will generate water. Mr. Coulter said that pervious paving is very expensive, but there are other solutions available. Mr. Yaeger asked the Board to think outside the box, and said if the building could be moved back, the lodge would be more visible, and there would be more room for the Farmer's Market. He also asked if it would be possible to use the extra space on the roof for community meetings, build a green roof, or possibly have outdoor seating on the second floor like some of the restaurants in the Dublin area.

Mr. Hunter said he appreciated Mr. Yaeger's comments. Mr. DeWitt expressed an interest in sharing an additional dumpster and Mrs. Bitar suggested contacting the Masonic Lodge next door. Mr. Coulter moved to table the application and Mr. Sauer seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll, and all members voted "aye" to table the application.

D. Other

After brief discussion, Mr. Sauer moved to appoint Mrs. Holcombe to the Worthington CRA Housing Council, with Mr. Hunter as the back-up. Mr. Hermann seconded the motion and all MPC members voted aye thereon.

Mrs. Holcombe moved to adjourn the meeting at 9:50 p.m. and Mr. Hermann seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. All members voted "aye" to adjourn the meeting.