



MEMORANDUM

TO: Members of the Architectural Review Board
Members of the Municipal Planning Commission

FROM: R. Lee Brown, Director
Lynda Bitar, Planning Coordinator

DATE: July 3, 2019

SUBJECT: Staff Memo for the Meeting of July 11, 2019

B. Architecture Review Board – Unfinished

1. Landscaping, Signage and Painting the Canopy, Bollards & Bike Rack – **6600 N. High St. (FC Bank)** (Amendment to AR 06-17 & AR 45-16)

Findings of Fact & Conclusions

Background & Request:

Approval was granted on May 14, 2015 for demolition of the 3 buildings on the site, and construction of a new two-story office building to serve as the corporate office and a bank branch with drive-thru for FC Bank. On June 25, 2015 lighting, landscaping and window details were approved. A permit was issued in October of 2015 to begin construction on the site. In February of 2016 amendments to the windows and roof screen, and a flagpole were approved. On May 12, 2016 the signage was approved and amended again on January 26, 2017. The Board of Zoning Appeals approved a variance for two wall mounted signs and for a monument sign that exceeded size requirements. The building opened for business in November 2016.

New signage was installed on the site without Architectural Review Board approval in 2018. City staff notified the applicant that they needed to get approval for their new signage and that there were issues with the existing landscaping. The recently installed signage is to actually be replaced as part of this application. FC Bank recently went through a rebranding process and is in the process of updating all exterior signage and exterior features at their facilities and would like to replace and update landscaping on the site.

Project Details:

1. A freestanding sign and one wall sign are included with this application. Variances were previously granted for having a freestanding sign larger than is allowed and having more than one wall sign and for total sign area.
2. The freestanding sign will remain and have new letters and logo attached.

- The existing free-standing sign is 8' wide x 51" high cabinet faced with smooth cast stone, on an 8' wide x 2'8" high base with brick veneer to match the building. Cast stone caps are proposed for the top of the base and sign and would extend slightly beyond the edges. Sign area would be approximately 55 square feet per side, including the base.
 - Clarification needed on how they plan to fill in the holes left by the previous sign.
 - Cardinal red, slate gray and black border painted aluminum reverse channel letters and logo are proposed to be mounted on the sign faces. White LED illumination would shine to the rear from inside the letters giving a halo effect. The depth of the characters is proposed to be 3.5" and the distance between the back of the letters and the sign face is proposed as 1.5".
3. A cast stone panel with the bank's logo raised 1/2" is in the center of the front elevation. The raised panel is 8' wide x 3'8" high (29.3 square feet in area). The cast stone logo appears to have the desired separation from the soldier course and lintels.
 - a. The application states that the previous "Bridges" logo will be replaced by the bank's new logo (Cardinal). The design will be a cardinal head. The color and size of the stone area is to remain the same. Information was not provided with the dimensions of the Cardinal; however the panel area would not exceed previous approval.
 4. Five inch deep non-illuminated channel letters with the logo were originally installed at the edge of the canopy above the entrance. The letters were 75" wide x 20" high, and the logo was 51" wide x 24" high. Sign area would be 75" x 44" or 22.9 square feet. The aluminum letters and logo are proposed to be green and gray.
 - a. The current canopy sign is 72" wide x 15" high with a sign area of 7.5 square feet.
 - b. The proposed sign is 96" wide x 19" high with a sign area of 12.6 square feet.
 5. Exterior Changes:
 - a. The green metal canopy which wraps around the southwest corner of the building will be painted slate gray to complement the signage.
 - b. Twenty-seven bollards located in the drive-thru area on the east side of the building will be painted slate gray.
 - c. The bike rack located at the southeast corner of the building will be paint slate gray.
 6. Landscaping:
 - a. Proposing to install ornamental grasses (35 Karl Forester Grasses) along the eastern portion of the site on the east side of the retaining wall.
 - b. Replacing dead and dying shrubs throughout the site with the following:
 - i. Spirea – 5
 - ii. Barberry – 1
 - iii. Karl Forester Grasses – 6
 - iv. Liriope Variegated – 21
 - v. Mint – 3
 - vi. Juniper – 1
 - vii. Sawtooth Oak – 2

Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance

While the regulations permit a certain maximum square footage of signs for a business, try to minimize the size and number of signs. Place only basic names and graphics on signs along the street so that drive-by traffic is not bombarded with too much information. Free-standing signs should be of the “monument” type; they should be as low as possible. Such signs should have an appropriate base such as a brick planting area with appropriate landscaping or no lighting. Colors for signs should be chosen for compatibility with the age, architecture and colors of the buildings they serve, whether placed on the ground or mounted on the building.

While the architecture is of prime importance in a commercial district such as Worthington’s, landscaping of building sites is also important. Landscaping works with other site elements such as paving and street furniture to create the district’s sense of high quality.

A small amount of landscaping can have a positive impact; this is already easy to see in the many well-landscaped spots in Worthington’s commercial district. Small, well-executed and well-maintained landscaping is appropriate for the relatively small spaces here and provide relief from the “hardscape” of buildings, streets, and other man-made elements. Plant materials should be selected for appropriate size, shape, color, and “pedestrian friendliness” (avoid, for example, thorny species that can catch dresses or scratch children). Pots or planters permit moving plants and flowers around for best effect.

Have a regular maintenance program for landscaping, paving, furniture and other streetscape elements. Small details such as weed-filled planters or accumulated litter can give a strong negative impression. Do not plant any more than can be maintained easily. Fences may be helpful for screening transformers, gas meters, and communication equipment. Also consider using plantings for this purpose but be sure they do not interfere with meter-reading or maintenance of equipment. Keep functional items such as trash containers, transformers and electrical boxes orderly and well screened.

Color can have a significant impact upon a building’s design and appearance, and the Architectural Review Board encourages the use of colors appropriate to the buildings and the overall character of Worthington. There is a policy of flexibility in color use, and the Board can provide information on appropriate selections. There are no hard and fast requirements for particular colors or color combinations. Once again, however, it will be instructive to study Worthington’s existing commercial/institutional building stock to get a sense of appropriate colors and combinations of colors.

For new brick buildings, consider letting the natural brick color be the body color, and select trim colors that are compatible with the color of the bricks. It may be acceptable to paint new brick walls. Generally, lighter colors should be used for this purpose, with darker colors for trim. Prepare a color board showing proposed colors. The Architectural Review Board encourages early reviews of such elements before planning goes very far.

Staff Analysis:

- Clarification is needed on how the holes will be filled in from the previous sign.
- Information is needed concerning the cast stone panel that will replace the existing

“bridges” stone panel.

- Exterior color changes continue to complement the existing architecture and color scheme on the building. The rooftop standing seam metal roof will remain green. The use of the slate gray on the canopy trim, bollards and bike rack will complement the building and tie it to the colors found in the rebranding efforts of FC Bank.
- The proposed landscaping will replace and complement the existing vegetation on the site and provide an additional screening to the property to the east.

Recommendation:

Staff is recommending approval of this application, as the proposed sign modifications, exterior color adjustments and landscape improvements are compatible with the Design Guidelines.

Motion:

THAT THE REQUEST BY FC BANK FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR LANDSCAPING, SIGNAGE AND PAINTING THE CANOPY, BOLLARDS AND BIKE RACK AT 6600 N. HIGH ST., AS PER CASE NO. AR 17-19, DRAWINGS NO. AR 17-19, DATED MAY 8, 2019, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

C. Architectural Review Board – New

1. Addition, Front Porch, Siding – **46 W. North St.** (Residential Design Solutions/Karen Hughes) **AR 64-19**

Findings of fact & Conclusions

Background & Request:

This house was constructed in 1951 and is Colonial Revival Influence in style per the Worthington Historic District nomination. The house has 1 ½ stories with a gable running east and west and is just over 1200 square feet in area. The previous owner replaced most of the windows in 2016 and gained approval to replace the garage door this year but sold the house before doing the replacement.

The new owner would like to add onto and renovate the house, and replace the garage.

Project Details:

1. The main gable of the existing house would not change, but the front cross gable is proposed to be replaced with a larger version. A new nested gable would then be constructed above the existing front door. The porch roof is proposed to be supported with round columns and extend out from the front of the house. Red cedar composite shakes are proposed in the gables. All new double 4” straight lap vinyl siding is proposed in Indigo for the whole house. The existing siding appears to be old pressboard siding that is reportedly rotting.
2. To the rear, a cross gable is proposed that would extend at the height of the main house gable about 30’ before lowering to accommodate the rear entrance and a screened porch.

A shed dormer is proposed on the rear roof to create additional living space on the second floor. The new first floor would go from 910 sf to 1577 sf, and the second floor would be 314 sf to 658 sf.

3. Weathered Wood GAF Timberline roof shingles are proposed for the entire structure.
4. The windows from 2016 are an all-vinyl product with flat grids between the panes. Some windows have an 8 over 8 pattern and some have a 6 over 6 pattern. The new windows would generally match, except the front larger picture window would have 3 single-hung windows grouped together. The front window to the west is shown on the drawing as 6 over 6 but is actually 8 over 8 lights.
5. Demolition of the existing single-car garage and construction of new 22' x 22' garage further to the rear is proposed. Materials and colors would match the house. A Clopay door with recessed panels is proposed on the south side.

Land Use Plans:

Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance

Residential additions are recommended to maintain similar roof forms; be constructed as far to the rear and sides of the existing residence as possible; be subordinate; and have walls set back from the corners of the main house. Design and materials should be traditional, and compatible with the existing structure.

Staff Analysis:

- The basic form, massing and style of the house seem to be in keeping with the Design Guidelines.
- The combination of vinyl siding and windows does not typically produce a structure that looks like it would have originally been part of Old Worthington. In this case, most of the existing windows in the house would be matched, and the existing siding is not very attractive. Therefore, the proposed vinyl might be an improvement.
- The mixture of “Red Cedar” composite shakes and indigo vinyl lap siding does not seem to give a traditional look that would fit into the Architectural Review District.
- Replacement of the garage is typical.

Recommendation:

The basic structure is fitting, but some additional thought should be put into materials and colors for the renovation of this house.

Motion:

THAT THE REQUEST BY RESIDENTIAL DESIGN SOLUTIONS, INC. ON BEHALF OF KAREN F. HUGHES FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO CONSTRUCT ADDITIONS AND RENOVATE THE HOUSE AT 46 W. NORTH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 64-19, DRAWINGS NO. AR 64-19, DATED JUNE 14, 2019, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

2. Remove Existing Fence – **45 Short St.** (Todd Musgrove) **AR 71-19**

Findings of Fact & Conclusions

Background & Request:

The structure is a one-story wood shake craftsman influence residence that was constructed in 1930 on the south side of Short St. In 2010 the Board approved the replacement of the roof and wood shake siding with a HardieShingle siding. The property owner would like approval to remove an existing wood fence that is in poor condition on the site.

Project Details:

1. The property owner would like to remove the fence on the east and west sides of the property, along with a gate by the front of the house.
2. No immediate plans for replacement of the fence or installation of landscaping at this time.

Land Use Plans:

Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance

Fences have long been used to mark property boundaries, to restrict access to properties by people and animals and for decorative purposes. They serve these traditional purposes in Worthington and can add to the character of a neighborhood when they are well executed and properly cared for. The Codified Ordinances of Worthington do not allow front yard fences, with the goal of maintaining an open, friendly feel and avoiding barriers between neighbors. However, there are many other kinds of fences, both natural and man-made, that can be used to protect and enhance a property.

Many traditional fence types are appropriate for use in Worthington. Earlier examples, typical of early- to mid-19th century homes, include rail fences, vertical board fences, and low masonry walls. From the mid-19th century into the early 20th century, cast and wrought iron fences were very popular, especially located in side yards. After about World War II, newly built homes often had metal “cyclone” type fencing or wood stockade fences, but these would be appropriate only for back yards of homes from this period. In some locations, vinyl may be a suitable substitute for traditional fence materials. It is best used in simple designs without extensive ornamentation.

Select fencing appropriate for the house’s period and style. As noted, front yard fences are not permitted by city ordinance. Side yard fences should be open in style (avoid solid, opaque fences that block all views) and three to four feet in height. In the back yard, generally avoid fences over four feet in height; higher fences are discouraged but may be appropriate where a commercial use abuts a residential property. In all cases, no fences higher than six feet are permitted. Brick masonry walls should use the best quality of brick, since they are so exposed to weathering. Avoid salvaged brick that may include “interior wall” brick that can disintegrate rapidly.

Consider using natural plant materials instead of fences. Various bushes and shrubs can be used to mark property lines or to set off private areas such as rear patios. Some of these may be evergreens; some may lose their leaves in the fall. Get good advice from a nursery or professional arborist about plant size, shape, rate of growth and care before choosing a natural fencing material.

Whether natural or man-made, all fencing materials require maintenance. Do not let plants get overgrown or full of litter; keep wood fences painted or coated with opaque stain; keep metal fences from rusting; and watch for mortar loss and other deterioration in masonry walls.

Staff Analysis:

1. The existing fence adds character and charm; however, the condition of the fence needs to be maintained, repaired or replaced.
2. Landscaping is typically a better option than a fence and can help define a space and provide needed screening.
3. The existing HVAC unit on the side of the house will be required to be screened. The Planning & Zoning Code requires that the equipment be effectively screened on the front and sides by an evergreen hedge or dense planting of evergreen shrubs not less than the height of the equipment, or by a fence or wall of similar height.
4. No additional landscaping has been proposed at this time.

Recommendation:

Staff is recommending approval of this application as presented, as the removal of an existing fence in poor condition would be an improvement with the following condition:

- HVAC unit be screened by vegetation.

Motion:

THAT THE REQUEST BY TODD MUSGROVE FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR THE REMOVAL OF A FENCE AT 45 W. SHORT ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 71-19, DRAWINGS NO. AR 71-19, DATED JUNE 25, 2019, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING WITH THE CONDITION THAT THE HVAC UNIT BE SCREENED BY VEGETATION.

3. Window Replacement – 112 E. New England Ave. (John & Ellen Scherer) AR 73-19

Findings of Fact & Conclusions

Background & Request:

This structure is a cape cod constructed in 1935 and is a contributing structure to the Worthington Historic District. In the 1960's, the house was renovated, and a 230 sq. ft. sunroom addition was added to the rear of the home. The applicants would like to replace the existing Anderson casement windows in the rear sunroom addition at this time.

Project Details:

1. Only replacing the existing Anderson casement windows with new Pella windows in the rear sunroom addition. All other windows will remain.
2. Double hung Pella Lifestyle aluminum glad wood windows will be installed.
3. No muntin's are proposed, this will allow for more light and a better view of the rear yard.
4. Existing Anderson casement windows are in poor condition. The existing windows are beyond re-puttying and painting and need to be replaced.

5. Replacing with double hung windows instead of casement windows. The existing casement windows pose a potential hazard when rolled out for those walking by on the sidewalk and patio.
6. The remaining wood windows in the house will remain.

Land Use Plans:

Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance

Residential additions are recommended to maintain similar roof forms; be constructed as far to the rear and sides of the existing residence as possible; be subordinate; and have walls set back from the corners of the main house. Design and materials should be traditional, and compatible with the existing structure.

Retention and repair of existing historic windows is always preferable to replacement. Because they usually comprise so much of a building's exterior surface, windows are a major part of its character. Keeping them is one of the most important ways to protect that character. Even non-original windows may be of sufficient age and design quality to warrant their retention. If historic windows are too deteriorated to repair cost effectively and replacement is justified, the preferred option is an in-kind replacement in the same material and design. This usually means real wood windows with true through-the glass muntins (if appropriate) in dimensions and profiles that duplicate the originals. Window suppliers have become very good at doing such work at reasonable prices, but this still may take some persistence and hunting around. New windows made of substitute materials such as aluminum, vinyl, or clad wood can be an acceptable second choice if they provide a reasonably good match for the windows being replaced. Number of panes, real muntins, and correct profiles still are important.

Some earlier houses may have been re-done with later windows -- 1-over-1 sash in a Federal style house, for example. In general, it is better to retain the older non-original windows (since they probably are quite old themselves, even if not original) than to replace them with new ones. If the nonoriginal windows are deteriorated and require replacement, it would be appropriate either to return to an original window design (with true muntins; again, refer to the style guide) or to install new 1-over-1 windows.

Be sure that window and door designs are appropriate for the style or time period of the house. Design and materials should be traditional, and compatible with the existing structure.

Staff Analysis:

1. The existing windows in the sunroom are in poor condition.
2. Functionality in the use of the windows would be greatly improved for the homeowners with the new windows.
3. The proposed windows are compatible with the existing structure.
4. Only the rear sunroom has casement windows, the remaining windows are the original wood windows that are 6 over 6 and 8 over 8 with storm windows and are in great condition.
5. The original wood windows are not part of this application and will remain.

Recommendation:

Staff is recommending approval of this application, as the request is consistent with the Design Guidelines.

Motion:

THAT THE REQUEST BY JOHN AND ELLEN SCHERER FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO REPLACE WINDOWS ON A REAR SUNROOM ADDITION AT 112 E. NEW ENGLAND AVE., AS PER CASE NO. AR 73-19, DRAWINGS NO. AR 73-19, DATED JUNE 26, 2019, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

D. Municipal Planning Commission

1. Conditional Use Permit

- a. Ancillary On-Premise Dining/Waiting Area (Nonalcoholic) – **897 High St.** (DeBerry Fitness 360 LLC) **CU 05-19**

Findings of Fact & Conclusions

Background & Request:

This building was constructed in 1965, having a two-story structure to the south and a one-story structure to the north. In recent years the owner has made improvements to the façade and signage. A mix of uses has always been present in this neighborhood commercial building.

This business, 360 Fitness Meals, prepares meals for delivery and pickup, and would like to have the ability to accommodate customers in the space.

Project Details:

- 1. The business owner anticipates 5-7 customers per hour who would stay no longer than 20 minutes each.
- 2. There is parking in front of and behind the building to accommodate such traffic.

Basic Standards and Review Elements: The following general elements are to be considered when hearing applications for Conditional Use Permits:

- 1. Effect on traffic pattern – The number of trips to the property would increase.
- 2. Effect on public facilities – No effect has been identified.
- 3. Effect on sewerage and drainage facilities – The effect would not change.
- 4. Utilities required – No new utilities would be required.
- 5. Safety and health considerations – None have been identified.
- 6. Noise, odors and other noxious elements, including hazardous substances and other environmental hazards – None have been identified.
- 7. Hours of use: Monday – Friday 10:00 am – 6:00 pm; Saturday 9:00 am to 4:00 pm; and Sunday 10:00 am – 4:00 pm.
- 8. Shielding or screening considerations for neighbors – No changes are necessary.

9. Appearance and compatibility with the general neighborhood – Change to sign only.

Land Use Plans:

Worthington Conditional Use Permit Regulations

The following basic standards apply to conditional uses in any "C" or "I" District: the location, size, nature and intensity of the use, operations involved in or conducted in connection with it, its site layout and its relation to streets giving access to it, shall be such that both pedestrian and vehicular traffic to and from it will not be hazardous, both at the time and as the same may be expected to increase with increasing development of the Municipality. The provisions for parking, screening, setback, lighting, loading and service areas and sign location and area shall also be specified by the applicant and considered by the Commission.

Definition:

"Ancillary on-premise dining/waiting area" (nonalcoholic) means a dining or waiting area that is clearly incidental and subordinate to the primary use of the structure and with seating limited to a counter or table(s) in conjunction with carry out food service such as doughnuts, ice cream, sandwich or pizza shop not selling or serving alcoholic beverages.

Worthington Comprehensive Plan

A good mix of restaurant and niche retail shops are appropriate for Old Worthington.

Recommendation:

Staff is recommending *approval* of this application. The proposed business would meet the basic standards for conditional uses, and the increased traffic to the site may be beneficial to other businesses.

Motion:

THAT THE REQUEST BY DEBERRY FITNESS 360 LLC FOR A CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT TO ALLOW ANCILLARY ON-PREMISE DINING/WAITING AREA IN THE C-1 ZONING DISTRICT AT 897 HIGH ST., AS PER CASE NO. CU 05-19, DRAWINGS NO. CU 05-19, DATED JUNE 29, 2019, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE PLANNING GOALS OF THE CITY, AS REFERENCED IN THE LAND USE PLANS AND ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

E. Other

F. Adjournment