



MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING
WORTHINGTON ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
WORTHINGTON MUNICIPAL PLANNING COMMISSION
May 10, 2018

The regular meeting of the Worthington Architectural Review Board and the Worthington Municipal Planning Commission was called to order at 7:00 p.m. with the following members present: Mikel Coulter, Chair; Kathy Holcombe, Secretary; David Foust; and Richard Schuster. Also present were: Scott Myers, Worthington City Council Representative to the Municipal Planning Commission; Lee Brown, Director of Planning & Building; and Lynda Bitar, Planning Coordinator and Clerk of the Municipal Planning Commission. Planning Commission members Thomas Reis, and Edwin Hofmann, and Architectural Review Board member Amy Lloyd were absent.

A. Call to Order – 7:00 p.m.

1. Roll Call
2. Pledge of Allegiance
3. Approval of minutes of the April 26, 2018 meeting

Mr. Schuster moved to approve the minutes, seconded by Mr. Foust. All Board members voted “Aye,” and the minutes were approved.

4. Affirmation/swearing in of witnesses

B. Architectural Review Board

1. Garage Door – **70 W. North St.** (Neil & Nan Gant) **AR 25-18**

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the following from the staff memo:

Findings of Fact & Conclusions

Background & Request:

This house was built in 1933 and is on a property that includes two 50’ wide lots that are both 412.9’ deep. The house is a contributing building in the Worthington Historic District and listed as Colonial Revival Influence in style. It spans the width of the eastern 50’ lot, sitting about 30’ from the front property line. A two-car freestanding garage is on the western lot and is further back than the house. The garage is not a contributing building in the Historic District. The owners

report the garage was originally constructed behind the house and moved to its current location in the 1950's. This application is a request to replace the garage doors.

Project Details:

1. The existing single doors each have 24 vertically oriented panels, with two windows in the second row from the top. Rather than the panels being raised, the panels are flat with only the framing raised. The opening at the top corners of the doors are clipped at the corners.
2. The owners originally proposed is a double garage door in steel, with 32 raised panels and divided lights spanning the top row. Proposed now is a double door with recessed panels and raised framing. Windows are proposed at the top. The corner of the framing would no longer be clipped.

Land Use Plans:

Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance

For repair work on older outbuildings, use new materials that match the old as closely as possible. Avoid modern materials that are incompatible with the original designs of these structures. It is important that doors be compatible with the style and period of a building. Compatibility of design and materials and exterior detail and relationships are standards of review in the Architectural District ordinance.

Recommendation:

Staff recommended approval of this application, as the proposed door would be compatible with existing doors and provide easier maneuverability for the owners.

Discussion:

Mr. Coulter asked if the applicant was present. Nan Gant, 70 W. North St., Worthington, Ohio, brought a sample of what the door would look like. Mr. Coulter asked if there was anyone present who wanted to speak about this application and no one came forward.

Motion:

Mr. Schuster moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY NEIL & NAN GANT FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO REPLACE THE GARAGE DOOR AT 70 W. NORTH ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 25-18, DRAWINGS NO. AR 25-18, DATED MAY 4, 2018, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Foust seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Foust, aye; Mr. Schuster, aye. The motion was approved.

2. Signage – **7007 N. High St.** (The Witness Group) **AR 32-18** (Amendment to AR 32-16)
To remain tabled

3. Renovation for Drive-in Bank – **923 High St.** (DEI Incorporated) **AR 19-18**

&

C. Municipal Planning Commission

1. Conditional Use Permit – Unfinished

a. Drive-in Bank in C-4 – **923 High St.** (DEI Incorporated) **CU 05-18**

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the following from the staff memo:

Findings of Fact & Conclusions

Background & Request:

This 1769 square foot building sits on just under ½ acre at the northwest corner of High and North Streets. Constructed in the early 1970's, the building housed a gasoline service station for many years and then was converted into an oil change business, most recently operating as Sprint Lube. The property is zoned C-4, Highway and Automotive Services.

The property was purchased by City National Bank from West Virginia, and conversion of the existing building and site to a bank branch is now proposed.

At its April 12th hearing, the Architectural Review Board discussed the applications. The Board felt the proposed landscaping plan would be a big improvement, but expressed concerns with the building changes. Changes have been made and are now being presented. New information is in bold in the memo.

Project Details:

1. Site:

- The existing site has two drive approaches on High St. and one on W. North St. The plan involves closing the High St. entrance nearest to North St. and replacing it with a planting area. New planting areas are also proposed on the north, east and west sides of the building; adjacent to parking at the southeast corner of the building; and adjacent to parking at the south property line. At the northwest and northeast corners of the site, existing planting beds would be enhanced, and a curved section of pavement along the west property line is proposed for removal, and would be replaced with plants. Deciduous and evergreen trees, shrubs and perennials are proposed for the planting areas. Existing Junipers along the north property line are proposed to be pruned and thinned.
- Existing guardrail along the north and south property lines is proposed for removal.
- The existing monument sign near High St. is proposed for removal.
- The existing flagpole near the intersection would remain and be utilized.
- A new concrete sidewalk is proposed in front of the building between the parking and

planting area.

- An 18" high brick seat wall with a limestone cap is proposed at the southeast corner of the site. Brick would be installed at grade from the wall to the curb.

2. Building:

- The applicant plans to remove the existing roofing, including the cupola, dormers, and chimneys, the existing exterior windows and doors, and all HVAC, plumbing and electrical in the building.
- The building is now proposed with weathered wood colored asphalt shingles, and white trim, gutters, downspouts and 5" Hardie siding in the gables. The openings on the front of the building are proposed with white 9 light windows with transoms above and solid panels below. Andersen (or Pella) vinyl clad wood windows are proposed. The size of the lights in the windows differ by opening.
- New brick veneer to match the existing brick as closely as possible is proposed in a gable above the entrance. A sign with blue letters spelling "City" and ~6" high black letters spelling "NATIONAL BANK" below is proposed. The proposed sign is 2' 8 5/8" tall x 7' 8 1/4" wide. A black gooseneck light is proposed above the sign.
 - Existing brick will remain, and abandoned door and window openings on the south and west sides are proposed to be infilled with similar brick. The infilled brick would be "toothed" in rather than having definite vertical lines of grout. On the south side a drive up ATM is proposed with a blue fabric awning above. Two black goose-neck lamps are proposed above the awning. Details of the ATM and its signage have not been provided. A bollard is shown at the southwest corner of the building, but the color has not been identified. On the rear, three windows are now proposed that are a similar style to the front windows, only with 12 lights and no transoms. A replacement door is also proposed to the rear, with a blue awning and light above. A new condensing unit would be placed to the rear.

3. Site Lighting:

- Seven 12' high pole lights with 3500K LED flat fixtures are shown on the photometric plan. The plan indicates the highest light levels are to the rear, but the illumination level is 0 footcandles at the property line. The concrete bases are to be no more than 3" above grade.
- The color of the poles and fixtures has not been identified.

4. Use:

- Bank hours have not been provided, but should be typical. The drive-thru lane would allow 24 hour ATM access.
- The number of employees and the number of customers per day has not been identified.
- Existing landscape screening on the west side would remain.

Land Use Plans:

Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance

- Windows: If windows are missing or must be replaced, use new windows of the same size, design and profile (cross-section), to the greatest extent possible; wood windows are

preferred.

- Roofing: When doing roof system repairs, retain historic materials as much as possible; when replacement is necessary, try to match the historic materials.
- Building Color: As is the case with some of Worthington's houses, the use of white or cream-colored trim on brick commercial buildings is a long tradition. Masonry which has been painted in the past should remain painted, since removal of paint can be difficult and damaging. However, walls that have not been painted in the past should remain unpainted.
- Landscaping: While the architecture is of prime importance in a commercial district such as Worthington's, landscaping of building sites is also important.
- Lighting: Use of fairly small lighting fixtures, and as few as possible, is recommended. Fixtures should not be overly ornate. Simple and smaller usually is better. Avoid excessive brightness.
- Signage: The Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance recommend signs be efficient and compatible with the age and architecture of the building. Use of traditional sign materials such as painted wood, or material that looks like painted wood, is the most appropriate material for projecting and wall signs. Colors for signs should be chosen for compatibility with the age, architecture and colors of the buildings they serve, whether placed on the ground or mounted on the building. Signs must be distinctive enough to be readily visible, but avoid incompatible modern colors such as "fluorescent orange" and similar colors. Bright color shades generally are discouraged in favor more subtle and toned-down shades.

Worthington Code Basic Standards and Review Elements The following general elements are to be considered when hearing applications for Conditional Use Permits:

1. Effect on traffic pattern
2. Effect on public facilities
3. Effect on sewerage and drainage facilities
4. Utilities required
5. Safety and health considerations
6. Noise, odors and other noxious elements, including hazardous substances and other environmental hazards
7. Hours of use
8. Shielding or screening considerations for neighbors
9. Appearance and compatibility with the general neighborhood

Worthington Conditional Use Permit Regulations

The following basic standards apply to conditional uses in any "C" or "I" District: the location, size, nature and intensity of the use, operations involved in or conducted in connection with it, its site layout and its relation to streets giving access to it, shall be such that both pedestrian and vehicular traffic to and from it will not be hazardous, both at the time and as the same may be expected to increase with increasing development of the Municipality. The provisions for parking, screening, setback, lighting, loading and service areas and sign location and area shall also be specified by the applicant and considered by the Commission.

Worthington Comprehensive Plan

Buildings at North St. and High St. should frame the pedestrian space and street, invite browsing, create second story-office or residential opportunities, and locate and screen the parking in the rear of the site

Staff Analysis:

- The style of the building is more traditional with this application due to the colors, materials and basic design, however, the front windows could be more symmetrical.
- Infilled brick areas could be used as more of an architectural feature than expecting the brick and mortar will match exactly. Of most concern are the front gable and south door.
- The proposed light poles would be appropriate in black or bronze.
- The landscaping/site plan, including the area at the intersection, is an enhancement for the property and Old Worthington.
- A bank at this location would provide a low impact use for a busy area. As online banking is widely used, traffic to the site should not be excessive, and parking should be ample. The drive up ATM should not cause a problem. Elimination of the southern curb cut would be beneficial for traffic at the intersection.

Recommendations:

Staff recommended approval of these applications, after discussion about the front windows and the new brick.

Discussion:

Mr. Coulter asked if the applicant was present. Thomas Montchai, 923 High St., Worthington, Ohio, said he is an architect with DEI. Craig Stillwell, 25 Gatewater Rd, Cross Lanes, West Virginia, Executive Vice-President for City National Bank, said they are thrilled to be in Worthington. He said they have been involved in some commercial business in the Columbus area but have not had an actual loan office until now. Mr. Stillwell said he does not anticipate much traffic at first, and they will only have three employees to begin with, mainly to handle the commercial customers. They have five hundred and eighty-five other branches, and will do all they can to build a beautiful facility. Mr. Stillwell said they have used DEI on ten projects in the past and all ten have used bronze lighting. Mr. Coulter said he appreciated all of the efforts they have gone through to improve the building. Mr. Foust asked if the window on the left side could be more balanced. Mr. Montchai said he would have to take a look at the structure to see whether or not the column could be removed.

Mrs. Karen Wasserman, 696 Oxford St., Worthington, Ohio, said she wanted to echo the comments of the board members because she drives through the area all the time, and it would bother her to see the face of the bank not balanced. Mr. Coulter asked if there was anyone else to speak for or against this application and no one came forward.

ARB Motion:

Mrs. Holcombe moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY DEI INCORPORATED ON BEHALF OF CITY NATIONAL BANK FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO RENOVATE THE BUILDING AT 923 HIGH ST., AS PER CASE NO. AR 19-18, DRAWINGS NO. AR 19-18, DATED APRIL 26, 2018, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING AND THAT THE WINDOWS ON THE LEFT SIDE WILL BALANCE TO MATCH THE WINDOWS ON THE RIGHT, AND THE LIGHT POLES WILL BE BRONZE.

Mr. Foust seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Foust, aye; Mr. Schuster, aye. The motion was approved.

MPC Motion:

Mrs. Holcombe moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY DEI INCORPORATED ON BEHALF OF CITY NATIONAL BANK FOR A CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT TO OPERATE DRIVE-IN BANK IN THE C-4 ZONING DISTRICT AT 923 HIGH ST., AS PER CASE NO. CU 05-18, DRAWINGS NO. CU 05-18, DATED APRIL 26, 2018, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE PLANNING GOALS OF THE CITY, AS REFERENCED IN THE LAND USE PLANS AND THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Foust seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; and Mr. Foust, aye. The motion was approved.

2. Subdivision

- b. Preliminary & Final Plats – **800 Proprietors Rd.** (The Griffin 105 Group, LLC)
SUB 02-18

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the following from the staff memo:

Findings of Fact & Conclusions

Background & Request:

Worthington Foods was a manufacturing facility that occupied 8.75 acres at the northeast corner of Proprietors and E. Granville Roads. The property was sold in 2005 and the plant and most other buildings were demolished to allow for redevelopment of the site into 88,000 square feet of office condominiums. The northern building, which was a retail store that sold the Morningstar Farms products manufactured at the facility, was split from the larger parcel and has housed several businesses since that time. The southern 7.75 acres was comprised of many tax parcels, but viewed by the City as one lot as part of the 2005 subdivision. The tax parcels were never combined at the Franklin County offices. The land began to develop in 2005 with four office condominiums being constructed over the following four years, covering roughly 3 acres. For various reasons, a small

piece of land (~0.34 acre) on the north side (comprised of 3 tax parcels) and the southern ~4.8 acres (comprised of 3 tax parcels) were never developed.

In January, the City Council approved rezoning the southern ~4.8 acre property as a Planned Unit Development (PUD) to allow for construction of the Kemper House, an Alzheimer's/Dementia/Memory Care Facility. PUD Final Plan and Architectural Review Board approval were given for the project at the April 12, 2018 meeting.

This application for Subdivision approval would allow the sale of the Kemper House property and the northern 1/3 acre lot at the north end of the site to the developer, and require combination of tax parcels and dedication of right-of-way.

Project Details:

1. The Preliminary Plat information was represented as part of the PUD. Copies of the pertinent plans have been included with this application such as plans showing existing and proposed conditions, tree preservation, utilities, grading and landscaping.
2. Lot #1 would be 4.517 acres at the south end of the site. Dedication of 0.261 acre area that is currently in a highway easement as right-of-way is proposed. No direct vehicular access is allowed along the south property line and around the curve. On the west side, a 4' wide, 0.998 acre strip of land is being dedicated as right-of-way to allow for construction of a recreation path. Also dedicated on the plat would be an access easement to allow traffic to the railroad property to the east.
3. Lot #2 would be 0.366 acre at the north end of the site. Dedication of 4' of property (0.008 acre) is also proposed along the Proprietors Rd. frontage of this lot.
4. The Final Plat has been approved by the Franklin County and City of Worthington engineering offices.

Land Use Plans:

Worthington Comprehensive Plan Update & 2005 Strategic Plan

An area plan focusing on the Proprietors/Huntley Road corridor should be developed that makes recommendations for repositioning it in the market place to make it attractive and competitive in the region. Issues such as building renovation, aesthetics, and possible road and infrastructure improvements should be addressed. In any case it is critical that the City protect the industrial corridor as an employment center. As long as the industrial corridor continues to be economically attractive to investment and production, it will continue to be a vital part of Worthington's success.

Worthington Design Guidelines

New development sites generally are larger than existing sites and may involve one large or many smaller land parcels. These sites often have natural and man-made features that serve as enhancements to a development or that blend in with the existing built environment of the city. Natural features include watercourses, distinct topography, and mature trees. Man-made features include fences, stone walls, gardens and plantings, and historic buildings. Planning for the development of a site should include an inventory and evaluation of features, and the development

should retain those that add scenic or historic value or that help integrate the new development into the existing cityscape.

Connecting new development with what has come before is an important consideration. In the past, new commercial development tended to extend the urban fabric, building at the edges of existing development. Most development after the mid-20th century, which had an automobile orientation, went to the edge of town and grew as separate shopping centers or individual buildings with little to connect them physically. In Worthington, new developments should build upon and extend the pedestrian scale and walkability of the city's commercial heart. Efforts to establish this connection can include multiple pathways to existing streets, following traditional grid street patterns in commercial developments, and extending amenities such as sidewalks, lawns and shade trees into new developments.

Recommendation:

Staff recommended approval of these applications to be recommended to the City Council, as the resultant parcel would accommodate the already approved development, and the dedication of right-of-way would help meet the bike and pedestrian needs of the City.

Discussion:

Mr. Coulter asked if the applicant was present. Greg Cini, 353 S. Parkview Ave., Bexley, Ohio, did not have further comments. Board members had no questions or concerns. Mr. Coulter asked if there was anyone to speak for or against this application and no one came forward.

MPC Motion:

Mr. Foust moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY THE GRIFFIN 105 GROUP, LLC FOR APPROVAL OF PRELIMINARY AND FINAL SUBDIVISION PLATS FOR 800 PROPRIETORS RD. AS PER CASE NO. SUB 02-18, DRAWINGS NO. SUB 02-18, DATED APRIL 25, 2018, BE RECOMMENDED TO THE CITY COUNCIL FOR APPROVAL BASED ON THE PLANNING GOALS OF THE CITY, AS REFERENCED IN THE LAND USE PLANS AND ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Foust, aye; and Mr. Schuster, aye. The motion was approved.

D. Architectural Review Board - New

1. Sign – **6877 N. High St.** (LCNB National Bank) **AR 29-18**

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the following from the staff memo:

Findings of Fact & Conclusions

Page 9 of 22

ARB/MPC Meeting May 10, 2018

Minutes

Background & Request:

This multi-tenant commercial building was constructed in the early 1970's. The look of the freestanding sign on the property has changed several times over the years, including to its current look in 2007. Also at that time a curved blue awning was approved above the entrance.

This application would allow a new tenant, LCNB National Bank, to change the sign faces from the existing, which identify Columbus First Bank.

Project Details:

1. The new faces would be aluminum painted green with routed copy "LCNB National Bank Since 1877" in white.
2. Preferred is PMS 354 Green, which is a light green. Samples have also been submitted for PMS 356 and PMS 357, which are darker shades.

Land Use Plans:Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance

- While the regulations permit a certain maximum square footage of signs for a business, try to minimize the size and number of signs. Place only basic names and graphics on signs along the street so that drive-by traffic is not bombarded with too much information.
- Colors for signs should be chosen for compatibility with the age, architecture and colors of the buildings they serve, whether placed on the ground or mounted on the building. Signs must be distinctive enough to be readily visible, but avoid incompatible modern colors such as "fluorescent orange" and similar colors. Bright color shades generally are discouraged in favor more subtle and toned-down shades.

Recommendation:

Staff recommended approval of this application with the darkest shade of green submitted being used. The lighter shades appear brighter than what is typically seen in the District.

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar said the applicant determined that refacing the existing sign was not an option, so was now proposing a new rectangular cabinet. The new sign would be the same height and width as the existing sign, and the darker green background on aluminum with routed out white illuminated letters are proposed. Mr. Coulter asked if the applicant was present and Mark Pennington, 6877 N. High St., Worthington, Ohio introduced himself. Mr. Coulter asked if there was anyone to speak for or against this application and no one came forward.

Motion:

Mr. Foust moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY LCNB NATIONAL BANK FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO CHANGE THE FREESTANDING SIGN AT 6877 N. HIGH ST., AS PER CASE NO. AR 29-18, DRAWINGS NO. AR 29-18, DATED MAY 10, 2018 BE

APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Foust, aye; and Mr. Schuster, aye. The motion was approved.

2. Barn Restoration – Roof – **63 W. Granville Rd.** (Megan Shroy) **AR 33-18** (Amendment to AR 81-17)

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the following from the staff memo:

Findings of Fact & Conclusions

Background & Request:

Both the late 19th century Colonial Revival home and the barn on this roughly 0.4 acre corner lot are contributing structures in the Worthington Historic District. An application was originally approved by the ARB in September of 2015 to construct a new garage and restore the existing barn on this property. In October of 2017, an extension was granted for restoration of the barn.

This is a request to amend the previous approval regarding the roof material.

Project Details:

1. The owners were originally planning to leave the existing asphalt shingles on the barn. After researching the look of other barns from the same era, the owners would now like to install a metal roof.
2. Gray standing seam metal is proposed.

Land Use Plans:

Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance

Older outbuildings, sheds, and garages should be retained and repaired. They add variety and visual interest to the streetscape and are part of Worthington's character.

Recommendation:

Staff recommended approval of this application. Although the look would change, a metal roof could have been used for this type of structure.

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar mentioned that much of the siding was replaced, and talked about the neighbor's concerns about ice from the roof. She also asked the Board to consider the addition of a small condensing unit to be placed on the east side of the barn. The applicants, Megan & Brent Shroy, 63 W. Granville Rd., came forward. Mrs. Shroy said the original siding of the barn was mostly rotted out, all of the windows were broken, and the roof and gutters drained onto their neighbor's driveway. She felt the barn was now beautiful and really coming along. Mrs. Shroy said they

saved as much of the original siding as they could. She recently started researching old barns, and barns of this time period typically had metal roofs. Mrs. Shroy new the neighbor was concerned with noise from the roof as well as ice. She referred to her contractor to answer questions.

Rob Seiler, M & S Roofing LLC, 1745 Schilling Lane, Columbus, Ohio, explained how the metal roofing material is 24 gauge steel so would not make noise, and said snow guards could be attached. Mrs. Bitar asked if new gutters were going to be installed and Mr. Seiler said he had not discussed that yet with anybody. Mrs. Shroy said new gutters will be installed.

Mr. Coulter asked for clarification of the condenser. Mrs. Shroy said air conditioning was installed in the barn and mentioned they do not have central air in their home. The condenser is smaller than what would be used for a residence. Mr. Shroy explained condensers are common throughout Worthington and they had planned to install the condenser in the back of the barn. The adjacent neighbor asked if the condenser could be relocated and Mr. Shroy agreed to do that. The condenser will be located on the east side of the barn. Mr. Coulter asked Mr. Shroy to add soft screening to hide the unit from being visible. Mrs. Holcombe said the Shroys have done a wonderful job with the restoration of the barn and she was delighted to see they were adding a standing seam rooftop. Mr. Coulter asked if there was anyone to speak for or against this application.

Mr. Schuster expressed concern with the use of the metal roof based on the Design Guidelines. He also asked for clarification of the color. Mr. Foust indicated his historic barn of about the same era originally had a standing seam metal roof. He asked if the proposed roof would be a true standing seam metal roof and if the color would be low gloss. Mrs. Holcombe felt the proposed roof would be in character with the barn. Mr. Coulter asked for the spacing and Mr. Seiler said 14.5". Mr. Foust felt that was appropriate.

James Wasserman, 696 Oxford St., Worthington, Ohio, said he has been before the Board several times bringing samples of bricks and other materials. He said he has been told by the Board not to put electricity in his potting shed, and not to straighten out his sloped driveway. Mr. Wasserman said this was a major construction site with a lot of noise from pounding hammers, loud music, shouting and loud cursing. He was upset with the way the construction vehicles were parked inappropriately and restricted access from his driveway. Mr. Wasserman also thanked the Board for their caution during the approval process. Mr. Coulter said he has seen situations like that before and if Mr. Wasserman has concerns in the future to contact the City for assistance.

John Roesch, 704 Oxford St., Worthington, Ohio, said he does not have a problem with the metal rooftop as long as the snow guards are in place, and he would like to see screening added to the location of the condenser to help muffle any noise generated from the unit. There were no other speakers.

Motion:

Mrs. Holcombe moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY MEGAN SHROY TO AMEND CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS AR 81-17 BY CHANGING THE BARN ROOF AT 63 W. GRANVILLE RD. AS PER CASE NO. AR 33-18, DRAWINGS NO. AR 33-18, DATED APRIL 24, 2018, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING AS AMENDED TO INCLUDE A CONDENSER LOCATED ON THE EAST SIDE OF THE BARN AND SCREENED WITH EVERGREEN PLANTINGS; THE STANDING SEAM ROOF WILL BE THE COLOR OF LOW GLOSS DUCK GRAY; SNOW GUARDS WILL BE ADDED TO THE ROOF; AND NEW GUTTERS WILL BE ADDED TO THE BARN AND GARAGE.

Mr. Foust seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Foust, aye; and Mr. Schuster, aye. The motion was approved.

3. Window & Heat Pump – 600 Morning St. (Paul Campagnoli/Elizabeth Melville) AR 34-18

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the following from the staff memo:

Findings of fact & Conclusions

Background & Request:

This house was originally constructed as a split-level in 1948, but was changed to a two-story house in 2011. Approval of this request would allow the addition of a new window to the rear and a heat pump on the south side.

Project Details:

1. The proposed window is 24” wide x 10” high. It would be cream to match the house trim.
2. A mini-split heat pump, originally proposed on the south side of the house as part of a master bedroom renovation plan, would now be located to the rear due to concerns from a neighbor.

Land Use Plans:

Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance

Be sure that window designs are appropriate for the style or time period of the house. Avoid use of inappropriate window designs.

Keep functional items such as trash containers and mechanical equipment well screened with fences or plantings.

Recommendations:

The proposed window style is not traditional, but none of the rear windows are traditional. The proposed location would not easily be seen by anyone and the trim would match the house.

Discussion:

Mrs. Bitar said due to the concerns of the adjacent neighbor the heat pump would now be to the rear of the house. Paul Campagnoli, 600 Morning St., Worthington, Ohio, said the window they will be installing is operational. Mr. Coulter asked if there was anyone present to speak for or against this application and no one came forward.

Motion for ARB application:

Mr. Schuster moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY PAUL CAMPAGNOLI AND ELIZABETH MELVILLE FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO INSTALL A WINDOW AND A HEAT PUMP AT 600 MORNING ST. AS PER CASE NO. AR 34-18, DRAWINGS NO. AR 34-18, DATED APRIL 25, 2018, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mr. Foust seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Foust, aye; and Mr. Schuster, aye. The motion was approved.

4. Sign – 2245 W. Dublin-Granville Rd. (Great Impressions/Shelter Insurance) AR 35-18

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the following from the staff memo:

Findings of fact & Conclusions**Background & Request**

In 2014 & 2015, the property owner of this land at the southwest corner of W. Dublin-Granville Rd. and Linworth Rd. annexed, rezoned, subdivided, created a Development Plan, and received Architectural Review Board approval to redevelop the property as a neighborhood commercial site. Final approval was given for Linworth Crossing early this year.

Sign Criteria were developed as outlined in the Land Use Plans below. Inclusion of a logo as part of a tenant wall sign requires approval from the ARB. Shelter Insurance is locating in Suite 107, which is in Building A, and would like to install a logo as part of its sign.

Project Details:

1. The proposed sign would have PMS #541 blue lettering consisting of 15.1” high “SHELTER” above 9.5” high “INSURANCE”.
2. To the left, a 2’4” x 2’4” shield is proposed in red white and blue that would also say “SHELTER INSURANCE”.
3. Total sign area would be about 23 square feet.

Land Use Plans:**Linworth Crossing Development Plan**

Approved Sign Criteria per the Development Plan:

- Tenants in a space with a smaller sign band are permitted 28 square feet of sign area.
- Maximum character height is 24”.
- Black gooseneck LED lights will be above all signs.
- All signs will consist of 1 ½” thick non-illuminated dimensional letters and logos, centered in the sign band area. The font style can vary.
- The proposed color palette for the signs is red (PMS #7621); blue (PMS #541); green (PMS #561); and PMS Black C.
- Proposed logos must be approved by the ARB.

Recommendation:

Staff recommended approval of this application, as the sign meets the criteria for this development.

Discussion:

The applicant, Greg Kitzmiller, 1148 Gold Pl., Gahanna, Ohio, did not have additional comments. Mr. Coulter asked if there was anyone wanting to speak and no one came forward.

Motion application:

Mr. Foust moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY GREAT IMPRESSIONS ON BEHALF OF SHELTER INSURANCE FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO ADD A WALL SIGN AT 2245 W. DUBLIN-GRANVILLE RD. , SUITE 107, AS PER CASE NO. AR 35-18, DRAWINGS NO. AR 35-18, DATED APRIL 26, 2018 BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Foust, aye; and Mr. Schuster, aye. The motion was approved.

5. New Garage – **46 W. New England Ave.** (Luanne L. & Michael D. Clevenger) **AR 36-18**

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the following from the staff memo:

Findings of fact & Conclusions**Background & Request:**

This property is roughly 1/4 acre in size, and bordered on three sides by a municipal parking lot. The Colonial Revival house on this property was constructed in 1929 and is a contributing building in the Worthington Historic District. The garage was a contributing garage in the District, although it is not clear when it was constructed. A request to demolish the garage was approved at the last

ARB meeting, and the Board saw a preview of the proposed garage. This is a formal application for approval of the new garage.

Project Details:

1. The new 24' x 20' garage would be constructed in roughly the same location as the old garage except the new structure would be rectangular instead of L shaped. A variance would be needed for placement ~5' from the east side property line.
2. A 4:12 pitched roof is proposed for the garage, with the gable facing north-south. Lap Hardiplank siding is proposed that would be painted "Baked Bean", which is a brownish red color. There is an existing wood-sided addition on the back of the house that would re-painted in the same color.
3. Asphalt shingles in Burnt Sienna are proposed for the roof.
4. A double garage door with the look of carriage doors is proposed on the south elevation. Next to the garage door, a man door with 9 lights above 2 panels is proposed. Both doors would be white.
5. The existing scalloped white wood fence is being maintained.

Land Use Plans:

Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance

New outbuildings should use design cues from older nearby structures, including form, massing, roof shape, roof pitch and height, materials, window and door types and detailing. Try to create a new building compatible in appearance with the house it accompanies.

Recommendation:

Staff recommended approval of this application, as the proposed garage is compatible with the house and appropriate for this location.

Discussion:

The applicants, Mike Clevenger and Luanne Clevenger, 46 W. New England Ave., Worthington, Ohio, came forward. Mr. Clevenger mentioned the fence was in progress. There were no comments from the audience.

Motion:

Mr. Foust moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY LUANNE L. & MICHAEL D. CLEVENGER FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO CONSTRUCT A NEW FREESTANDING GARAGE AT 46 W. NEW ENGLAND AVE. AS PER CASE NO. AR 36-18, DRAWINGS NO. AR 36-18, DATED APRIL 26, 2018, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING.

Mrs. Holcombe seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Foust, aye; and Mr. Schuster, aye. The motion was approved.

6. String Lighting – **671 High St.** (Lauren Guzior/The Half Pint) **AR 37-18**

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the following from the staff memo:

Findings of Fact & Conclusions

Background & Request:

This vernacular style commercial building was constructed in the 1800's, and additions/new construction occurred in the 1900's. Several years ago, the space was converted from the former Damsels in this Dress into Harold's American Grille. Harold's closed at the end of last year, and The Half Pint received ARB and Conditional use approval to open at this location. This is a request to add string lighting for the rear seating area.

Project Details:

1. The applicant would like to string lights running from the building to 9' poles erected at the perimeter of the patio.
2. A catalogue cut of the lights has been submitted.

Land Use Plans:

Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance

Lighting fixtures in a commercial district need to be considered carefully and selected so they enhance the district's historic character. Use of fairly small lighting fixtures, and as few as possible, is recommended. Fixtures should not be overly ornate. Simple and smaller usually is better. Avoid excessive brightness.

Recommendation:

This style of lighting may be appropriate in this location if the Board finds the lighting would not bother the residential neighbors.

Discussion:

Mr. Coulter asked for the applicant, and Lauren Guzior said she was representing 671 High St., Worthington, Ohio. She said they are willing to change the light bulbs for the sign to be less bright. Ms. Guzior said they intended the light to be warm and calming, but not to light up the entire parking lot. Mr. Coulter expressed his approval for the proposed lighting in this location, not seen from High St.

Mr. Foust said he was not opposed to the lighting and will likely vote in favor. He said the complaints he has received from neighbors concern the AEP lighting and exposed fixtures. He assumed the business lights would be turned off when the business closes. Ms. Guzior confirmed the lights would be turned off when the business closes. Ms. Guzior said the kitchen will close Monday through Thursday at 9:00 p.m. and the bar at 11:00 p.m. Fridays and Saturdays the kitchen will close at 10:00 p.m., and the bar at midnight. Sundays, the kitchen will close at 8:00 p.m. and the bar will close at 9:00 p.m. Mr. Foust requested the lights to be turned off when the bar closes.

Mr. Coulter asked if there was anyone present to speak for or against this application and no one came forward.

Motion:

Mr. Foust moved:

THAT THE REQUEST BY LAUREN GUZIOR FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS TO ADD STRING LIGHTING AT 671 HIGH ST., AS PER CASE NO. AR 37-18, DRAWINGS NO. AR 37-18, DATED APRIL 27, 2018, BE APPROVED BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS IN THE STAFF MEMO AND PRESENTED AT THE MEETING AND AMENDED TO INCLUDE THE LIGHTS WILL ONLY BE ON DURING BUSINESS HOURS.

Mr. Schuster seconded the motion. Mrs. Bitar called the roll. Mr. Coulter, aye; Mrs. Holcombe, aye; Mr. Foust, aye; and Mr. Schuster, aye. The motion was approved.

7. Addition & Renovation – 155 W. Dublin-Granville Rd. (James Ross/Tschofen) AR 38-18

Mrs. Bitar reviewed the following from the staff memo:

Findings of fact & Conclusions

Background & Request:

This parcel was established in 1957 as part of the Kilbourne Village subdivision. The existing 1740 square foot split-level house was constructed in 1960. Last year there was a request to demolish the existing house and construct a new 2400 square foot single-story residence. Now proposed is addition to and renovation of the existing house.

Project Details:

1. Site Plan:

- The proposed addition would extend about 29' to the rear of the house, following the house line on the east side, and set in 1.6' on the west side. The increased floor area would be at the same level as the existing sides of the house. A kitchen, eating area, family room and master suite are planned.
- A landscaping plan was presented at the meeting.

2. House:

- An increase in height and pitch is proposed for the existing gables on the house. At the east end, the east-west roof gable would be raised to accommodate the additional structure to the rear. Also, a porch roof is proposed over the entry that would be moved to the middle of the eastern 1/3 of the house. The gable over the center of the house would increase to match the pitch of the other gables, and extend over the addition to the rear. Over the garage, the gable would increase and a gabled dormer is proposed. A second gable would be to the rear and a flat roof would be in between.

- Simonton white vinyl windows are proposed for the structure. A catalogue cut is needed.
 - A catalogue cut is needed for the front door.
 - A CHI carriage style door is proposed for the garage.
 - Concrete block is proposed for the foundation, but the look and color are not known.
 - CertainTeed dimensional shingles in “Thunderstorm Gray” are proposed for the roof.
3. Siding Materials:
- Option A – Cementitious white board and batten siding all around; cementitious white shakes for the gables; stone instead of brick on the existing front.
 - Option B – Cementitious white board and batten on front only; 5” vinyl lap siding on sides and rear; existing brick painted white.
 - Option C – 5” white vinyl lap siding all around; vinyl shakes in front gables; existing brick painted white.

Land Use Plans:

Worthington Design Guidelines and Architectural District Ordinance

- Residential additions are recommended to maintain similar roof forms; be constructed as far to the rear and sides of the existing residence as possible; be subordinate; and have walls set back from the corners of the main house. Design and materials should be traditional, and compatible with the existing structure. Stone typically was not used in Worthington for additions, or for houses in general.
- New structures should complement the form, massing and scale of existing nearby structures. Also, building placement and orientation are important design considerations. Most main entrances should face the street and garages should avoid facing the street.
- Roof: Roof shapes for new buildings should be appropriate to the style or design of the building. If a new building does not follow a particular style but is instead a vernacular design, then roof shapes and heights similar to those in the neighborhood or nearby would be most appropriate.
- Materials: Contemporary materials that simulate traditional ones are appropriate, but the preferred option is to use true traditional materials such as wood siding. Incompatible contemporary materials should be avoided. Brick has long been a traditional material in Worthington. Prepare a sample board for review by the Architectural Review Board.
- Windows: Be sure that window designs are appropriate for the style or time period of the house. Using the excellent precedents of Worthington’s many historic structures, carefully design the pattern of window openings; window sizes and proportions (they must be appropriate for the size and proportions of the wall in which they are placed); pattern of window panes and muntins; and trim around the windows. Good quality wood windows are readily available and more affordable than in the past. True wood windows are always the first preference. Aluminum- or vinyl-clad windows can be appropriate, but primarily on secondary facades and less conspicuous locations. All-aluminum or vinyl windows are not prohibited but are not encouraged. Avoid blank walls.
- Entries: For newly-built buildings, simpler designs usually look better than more ornate ones. Avoid heavy ornamentation on doors and entrances. Observe entry placement on existing

buildings. Whether located symmetrically or asymmetrically, entries usually are aligned with a window on the second floor so that a regular rhythm of openings is maintained on both floors. Entries should be located so they are easily visible, and they should be oriented toward the street.

- **Color:** In general, avoid bright colors not typical in Worthington neighborhoods, such as various shades of purple or orange. For infill buildings being placed in an existing streetscape, select colors compatible with those already used along the streetscape. Many buildings follow a pattern of light colors for the building body and darker colors for the trim. Following this pattern is encouraged. In Worthington, the use of white or cream-colored trim also is common and would be appropriate for new construction. Avoid using too many colors. Usually one body color and one trim color are sufficient.
- **Landscaping:** Worthington's mature shade trees are the primary landscaping feature throughout the community. They are a major contributor to its character and help define its neighborhoods as stable, desirable places to live. In general, lawns are generous but not overly large, which contributes to the sense of human scale that is one of Worthington's important attributes. Other landscaping elements tend to be properly scaled and well-tended, which also tends to enhance neighborhood character. Maintain and nurture mature trees to prolong their lives. Plant and maintain street trees in planting areas between the street and sidewalk. Paving can sometimes reduce water absorption of the soil so much that trees do not get the moisture they require.

Recommendations:

- Although the Design Guidelines encourage maintaining similar roof forms with additions, the resultant structure in this proposal would resemble the existing split level and allow the home to be accessible.
- Retaining the brick area on the front, and the use of lap siding would be most compatible with the existing house and neighborhood. A cementitious product, though, would be more desirable than vinyl siding. The addition of shakes in the front gables is not in character with this house or neighboring houses.
- All vinyl windows are not encouraged in the District unless the product has the look of traditional wood windows.

Discussion:

The applicant, Jim Ross, representing his client at 155 W. Dublin-Granville Rd., Pete Tschofen, said these track homes were built in the late 1960's and 1970's and there was nothing attractive about them. Mr. Ross thought it was a challenge for people that want to live in Worthington to be able to remodel their homes, but somehow keep the character.

Mr. Coulter felt they should proceed with discussing option B. Mrs. Holcombe said she also liked option B. She did not like the shakes on the other options, but thought the floor plan was great. Mr. Tschofen said he would like to have one floor living area with the guest rooms upstairs. Mr. Foust said the home he grew up in was a three level split, and had shakes. His house was brick and stucco, but there were some homes with board and batten siding in the Kilbourne Village area.

Mr. Foust felt the design was closer to keeping with the look of Kilbourne village than the last proposal.

Mr. Schuster asked about the white vinyl siding, thinking Hardi siding would be more attractive. He asked if the windows looked like wood or looked more like vinyl, and Mr. Ross said that is a matter of opinion. Mr. Ross felt that financially vinyl siding made more sense. Mr. Coulter said the front elevation is of primary importance and thought the window products that look like wood and not vinyl are better. He felt they could compromise with better windows instead of Hardi siding. Mr. Coulter said the Board would like to see a sample of what the window will look like. Mr. Ross said they would rather install wood or fiberglass windows instead of putting Hardi Plank on the other three sides of the home. Mrs. Holcombe said she agreed and felt spending more on the windows would get a better return on the investment. Mr. Ross said he typically uses Marvin window products and is willing to do that if he can install vinyl on the outside.

Mr. Myers said some of the things he would like to see be resolved are the pitch on the roof, board and batten siding as opposed to lap siding, and it sounded like the Board was consistent about seeing the brick stay. He also felt the garage door was not appropriate. Mr. Coulter felt the roof pitch was appropriate, and cautioned about the flat roof on the west side. He agreed the garage door may not be quite right. Mr. Myers said the Kilbourne Village area was not a significant period for architecture but it does set a time period in Worthington's history. He said there is a feeling of saving time periods, but he also understands the need to attract new people to the community. Mrs. Holcombe said that style of garage door was being used throughout the City. She also expressed there was value in keeping the split level, as it was a significant style from that time period. Mrs. Holcombe felt the brick should be kept

Mr. Foust summarized that plan B maintains the original character of the house. With Hardi siding on the front, vinyl siding might be acceptable on the other three sides if that was a tradeoff for a good quality wood like window. He thought Mr. Myers had a good point about the garage door changing the character of the building. Mr. Foust thought if details of the windows and garage door were worked out, the application could be supported. Mrs. Holcombe felt quality windows were important and reiterated she was fine with the garage door. Mr. Ross said most of the windows in the neighborhood originally had aluminum windows so why was he being asked to install wood windows. Mr. Foust said they are not trying to restore the house, but instead enhance the community in general and balance with the other houses in the neighborhood. Mr. Ross agreed it is difficult to find the middle ground. Mrs. Bitar asked the Board to consider the house would be all white with this proposal. Mr. Coulter thought the brick should be off white. Mr. Schuster agreed an appropriate window style should be used.

Mr. Ross requested to table the application. Mrs. Holcombe moved to table the application, seconded by Mr. Foust. All Board members voted, "Aye," and the application was tabled.

Mr. Foust explained the Board members would like to see a sample of the windows, a catalogue cut of the front door, catalogue cuts of the lights to be used on the front of the house, and catalogue

cuts for the garage doors. Mrs. Bitar said the foundation material would also be needed. Drainage was discussed.

E. Other

There was no other business to discuss

F. Adjournment

Mr. Schuster moved to adjourn the meeting, seconded by Mr. Foust. All Board members voted, "Aye," and the meeting adjourned at 9:02 p.m.